

Summary of Comments

| Part of Plan | Respondent | Summary of Comments | Authority Response | Respondent ID | Response ID | Action needed? |
|----------------|-----------------------------------|--|--|---------------|-------------|----------------|
| Whole Document | Will Terry | The Plan does not cover people, which are important to keep the Park as a working, living countryside. The National Park Authority cannot do it by themselves, but can help, guide and influence people. Attracting outside funding into the Park must be maintained and improved on. | Many of the 'means to achieve' identify other organisations, individuals and businesses amongst those who will be expected to deliver the Plan. Section 1.9 highlights this approach. | 32 | 164 | No |
| Whole Document | Comments at Moors Centre 27/11/11 | Generally things should carry on as they are. | Comment noted. The statutory National Park purposes which inform the basis of much of the work undertaken in the Park underpin the Plan. | 15 | 60 | No |
| Whole Document | Great Ayton Parish Council | Precise figures should be avoided. Instead say, for example, 'in excess of 400 million'. | Use of precise figures reflects some of the work that has been carried out specifically as part of the Management Plan review. Figures have been 'rounded' where considered appropriate. | 57 | 419 | Amend Plan |
| Whole Document | Campaign for National Parks | Concerns over the deliverability of the Plan and the potentially conflicting nature of some of the proposals. There should be a clearer set of priorities based around maintaining and enhancing the unique qualities of the North York Moors. The impacts of specific actions should be considered across all ecosystem services and strategies devised to address any conflicts and make decision over trade-offs. An ecosystems services approach should involve 1) identifying the ecosystem services and their relative importance, 2) identifying through stakeholder engagement (providers and beneficiaries) which ecosystem services should be provided in the future and what benefits they will bring (including visitors and wider society alongside farmers, residents and businesses), 3) identifying how the provision of each service could impact on the provision of other services and their benefits, 4) developing processes through which the hard choices and trade-offs can be decided on and 5) reviewing and monitoring that takes account of new evidence, challenges and opportunities. It would be useful to have an additional section showing how the different objectives in each chapter would impact on each other and what evidence and stakeholder opinion has been used to establish this. This could help to identify priorities for action. | The Plan has steered clear of a full ecosystem services approach on the basis that it may make the Plan particularly technical and would be difficult to address Park-wide issues. A brief analysis of some of the Park's ecosystem services has been included in 1.6, and the focus of some other areas, such as agriculture and woodland, places a greater focus on what the Park provides than previous Plans have done. To clarify, the sentence in the second paragraph under 1.6 will be amended to read 'Some of the services or benefits...', and the figures will be removed from the table. A table is to be included in 1.9 which will identify where various activities (farming, tree planting, habitat expansion) should and should not take place, and what the potential positive and negative (to be mitigated) impacts would be. | 22 | 109 | Amend Plan |

| Part of Plan | Respondent | Summary of Comments | Authority Response | Respondent ID | Response ID | Action needed? |
|----------------|-------------------------------|---|---|---------------|-------------|----------------|
| Whole Document | Hutton-le-Hole Parish Council | No comments. | Noted. | 23 | 119 | No |
| Whole Document | B E Vyner | The Plan is rather vague. There should be a set of clear and targeted proposals within a well set out scheme. As it is it seems to be a re-iteration of the status quo. | It is acknowledged that some parts of the Plan are more detailed than others, but it is considered that this Plan contains some fairly specific targets and policies and other considerations about what the Park can produce that have not featured in any of the previous plans. The Plan is intended to be strategic on the basis that the detail will be set out in other plans referred to in the Means to Achieve. Some additional detail is to be included to reflect priorities of certain subject areas as being developed through the Authority's Business Plan. | 26 | 134 | No |
| Whole Document | B E Vyner | It should have been made easier to comment on the Plan by way of a direct weblink to particular sections, as it is one is expected to remember what the Plan says. | Comment noted for future consultations. | 26 | 137 | No |
| Whole Document | B E Vyner | Why is there almost no mention of neighbouring authorities? | Constituent councils have been mentioned in the means to achieve where relevant and their Sustainable Community Strategies are referred to on page 5. | 26 | 138 | No |
| Whole Document | Peter Woods | The word 'underway' should be 'under way'. | This has been checked and amendments will be made where necessary. | 28 | 158 | Amend plan |
| Whole Document | English Heritage | The historic environment and cultural heritage are poorly represented throughout the document, the natural environment is predominant. | More text has been added to 2.4 (now 2.2) in relation to the Authority's conservation priorities which are being identified as part of the Business Plan process. This helps to ensure that this section has a similar level of detail to other sections. The Heritage Assets section has been moved further towards the front of this chapter and has been retitled 'Historic Environment'. Further references have been included elsewhere in the Plan where appropriate, including in 1.4 through the addition of 'and cultural heritage' in the first bullet point relating to community strategies, and in the new table in 1.9. | 37 | 183 | Amend Plan |

| Part of Plan | Respondent | Summary of Comments | Authority Response | Respondent ID | Response ID | Action needed? |
|----------------|--------------------------------|---|--|---------------|-------------|----------------|
| Whole Document | English Heritage | There should be an additional, separate bullet point (in the summary leaflet) to cover the interests of the historic environment rather than it being a subset of moorland landscape. | Comment noted. The summary leaflet was produced for consultation only. A further summary leaflet will be produced following adoption of the Plan and this comment will be taken into account. | 37 | 187 | No |
| Whole Document | North Yorkshire County Council | Broadly welcome the Management Plan, in particular the approach which reflects ecosystem services. Support the focus on food production, provision of opportunities for improving health, and responding to the effects of climate change. | Comments noted. | 40 | 208 | No |
| Whole Document | Michael Richardson | Overall the plan is OK, particularly in view of financial restraints at this time. | Comment noted. | 4 | 10 | No |
| Whole Document | English Heritage | It is unclear how the aims and policies will be monitored and how success of the Plan will be measured. | Indicators and targets have been incorporated where relevant and useful data is, or can be made, available. Mechanisms for reporting are to be agreed. | 37 | 416 | No |
| Whole Document | RSPB | The Plan lacks sufficient consideration for wildlife conservation and biodiversity, and is too heavily weighted towards economic development and socio-economics. This is inappropriate given the legal status of many conservation assets and the Authority's legal remit on conservation. The Sandford Principle requires greater weight to be attached to the purpose of 'conserving and enhancing'. Biodiversity is a public good, its true value has been inadequately assessed. | Conserving the special qualities, which includes legally protected sites and species, has formed the basis of determining what the Park can provide, rather than this being at the expense of the special qualities. Chapter 4 'Business and Land Management' reflects the Government's agenda for economic growth, within the context of National Park purposes. The Sandford Principle requires greater weight to be attached to the first purpose only where there is a conflict. A new table in 1.9 will help to show how the various aims of the Plan can all be achieved together. | 45 | 248 | Amend Plan |
| Whole Document | Northumbrian Water | No objections | Noted | 1 | 1 | No |
| Whole Document | Peter Woods | There tends to be too much adherence to the status quo, rather than questioning it and seeking to improve it. Education should be at the forefront, including residents and visitors. | There are areas where the Plan considers things not previously addressed such as increasing food production. The Plan is based largely around the statutory National Park purposes, which in some cases involves a continuation of what is already happening. 3.4 Understanding the Park aims to increase understanding through education. | 28 | 144 | No |

| Part of Plan | Respondent | Summary of Comments | Authority Response | Respondent ID | Response ID | Action needed? |
|----------------|---|---|---|---------------|-------------|----------------|
| Whole Document | Marine Management Organisation | The aspirations of National Parks to be exemplars of sustainable development are welcome. | Noted. | 50 | 314 | No |
| Whole Document | English Heritage | The Aims / Policies / Means to achieve grids are incomplete because they do not include any assessment of measurement or monitoring or an indication of who might lead on the policy. | The Means to Achieve columns identify the projects and organisations who will take this forward. This provides flexibility for how the policies could be implemented. Details of the National Park Authority's role will be agreed through the Business Plan and the Cultural Heritage Action Plan. | 37 | 186 | No |
| Whole Document | Oswaldkirk Parish Meeting | It would be useful to include a summary of all the key aims and policies and how success will be measured. The tables in each section are helpful, however it would be more useful if more detail were provided regarding exactly how it is proposed to try to achieve some of the policies, for example the first policy in 4.2, although it is appreciated that it is a strategic plan. The points under 'How this will be monitored' are not all a means of monitoring, for example in relation to '3 areas of peatland have been restored' on page 26. It is confusing that some targets relate to 2017 when the preceding text relates to 'In 15 Years time...'. Some of the criteria are too vague, for example 'a decrease in the National Park's CO2 emissions'. There is no indication of whether building 10 more affordable homes will meet the overall policy. Not all sections have monitoring criteria, how will success of these be determined? If the title was 'How will success be determined?' there could be a range of measurements and monitoring techniques that will determine success. | The 'In 15 Years Time...' will be separated from the policies in the final desk top published version as it looks as though the policies to relate to 15 years time. The monitoring mechanisms are not necessarily all targets, but are ways of monitoring changes, some of which may be directly attributable to the Management Plan but some won't be. The presentation of the monitoring measures has been amended to provide separation between the indicators and the targets or desired direction of change. A new sub-section has been added to 1.9 How the Management Plan will be Delivered to explain the differences between the monitoring mechanisms across the chapters. The mechanism for reporting is to be agreed. | 44 | 244 | Amend Plan |
| Whole Document | Ryedale District Council (Forward Planning) | The Council is supportive of the objectives of the Plan and will support the NPA in meeting these objectives, particularly regarding elements which extend beyond National Park boundaries such as green infrastructure networks, riparian environments, particularly the River Derwent SAC, flood management and activities within towns and villages which border the National Park. | Support noted. | 10 | 40 | No |
| Whole Document | Farmoor Services LLP | Have other NGOs had an input into the draft Plan prior to consultation? | Natural England, the Environment Agency, the Forestry Commission and other organisations including NFU and CLA have been involved in the drafting of the Plan. A public consultation and stakeholder workshops were held in 2010 prior to the drafting of the Plan. | 9 | 39 | No |

| Part of Plan | Respondent | Summary of Comments | Authority Response | Respondent ID | Response ID | Action needed? |
|----------------|----------------------------|---|--|---------------|-------------|----------------|
| Whole Document | Great Ayton Parish Council | The plan should support the direction of travel sought by the National Park Authority. It should be capable of being readily monitored and reviewed and be aligned with the Business Plan. | The Plan is strategic in nature which will enable it to be flexible. The Authority's Business Plan which sets out the priorities, targets and actions for the Authority, is being prepared alongside the Management Plan. | 57 | 436 | No |
| Whole Document | Natural England | Each section tends to focus on one area of activity without cross-reference to other related activities. Synergies and conflicts are not adequately identified or addressed. The continuation or expansion of any service (notably habitat expansion, woodland creation and farming) must be considered in relation to its potential effects on other services and ecosystems. This will help to flag up conflicts so that decisions can be taken about any trade-offs. | A table has been included in 1.9 which identifies where various activities (farming, tree planting, habitat expansion) should and should not take place, and what the potential positive and negative (to be mitigated) impacts would be. | 62 | 464 | Amend Plan |
| Whole Document | Gus Pennington | Happy with the overall scope, structure and focus of the plan, and believe it is well-conceived. | Comment noted. | 5 | 16 | No |
| Whole Document | Natural England | In some instances the challenges are not addressed in the policies, and the policies are often very general. Policies should be more focussed with, where possible, clear, measurable targets. | In some instances the challenges are addressed through policies in other sections to avoid duplication of many policies all aiming to do the same thing. For example the first challenge in 2.4 Heritage Assets (now 2.2 Historic Environment) relates to damage to archaeological assets from recreational activities which is addressed through a policy in 3.2 Recreation and Access (now Enjoying the Park) which aims to reduce conflicts between recreational activities and the environment. However, in some places throughout the Plan additional challenges or policies have been added to ensure continuity. The Management Plan is a strategic document and it is not appropriate for the policies to be more specific - this will be done through other documents such as Biodiversity Action Plans. The targets reflect the data that is available, the Authority is not able to commit to undertaking additional surveys. | 62 | 465 | No |
| Whole Document | Great Ayton Parish Council | Welcome the inclusion of Local Authorities in supporting the Plan and hopes that the Plan will encourage reciprocal action. | Local Authorities have been involved in the preparation of the Plan. As the Plan is for the Park, not just the Authority, the Local Authorities have a key role in its delivery. | 57 | 437 | No |

| Part of Plan | Respondent | Summary of Comments | Authority Response | Respondent ID | Response ID | Action needed? |
|---|---|---|---|---------------|-------------|----------------|
| Whole Document | Redcar and Cleveland Strategic Partnership | Excellent document which provides a robust vision going forward taking into account the changing circumstances now and for the future for the quality environment, it's management and the needs of the local community and visitors. | Comment noted. | 6 | 29 | No |
| 1.1 The North York Moors National Park | North East Yorkshire Geology Trust | The Management Plan should include a commitment to working in partnership to maximise the benefits delivered. The Geology Trust has a proven track record of meeting many of the National Park's aims, objectives and purposes. | The North East Yorkshire Geology Trust have been referred to in the Means to Achieve new policy E27 on increasing awareness and understanding of the Park's geological assets. | 53 | 393 | No |
| 1.1 The North York Moors National Park | Natural England | The National Park boundary should be shown on the map on page 2. | The boundary will be clearer on the final desk top published version. | 62 | 466 | Amend Plan |
| 1.2 Special Qualities of the North York Moors | Ryedale District Council (Forward Planning) | The Council supports the vision, in particular the extra objective around sustainable resource management and recognition of environmental limits. | Support noted. | 10 | 42 | No |
| 1.2 Special Qualities of the North York Moors | Scarborough Borough Council | The special qualities are an appropriate balance between the qualities of the environment and a recognition of the role that human settlement and activity plays in the area. | Comment noted | 66 | 556 | No |
| 1.2 Special Qualities of the North York Moors | English Heritage | Shouldn't castles be included as distinct features on the moorland edges? The special quality 'A heritage of...' should also include architects. | The special qualities were drawn up as part of a consultation exercise to inform the 2004 review of the Management Plan. It is not considered that castles on the moorland edges are significant in terms of the special qualities of the National Park. However, reference to castles will be included in the text on the built environment in 2.4 Heritage Assets (now 2.2 Historic Environment). This states 'Whilst not common features in the landscape, there are a number of castles and similar structures, mostly around the edges of the Park, which provide an insight into the area's diverse history. These include West Ayton, Whorlton, Helmsley and Danby.' | 37 | 188 | Amend Plan |
| 1.2 Special Qualities of the North York Moors | Natural England | This would read better if the vision for National Parks came first, followed by the vision for the North York Moors, followed by the special qualities. | This amendment has been made. | 62 | 469 | Amend Plan |

| Part of Plan | Respondent | Summary of Comments | Authority Response | Respondent ID | Response ID | Action needed? |
|---|------------------------------------|--|---|---------------|-------------|----------------|
| 1.2 Special Qualities of the North York Moors | Natural England | The special qualities could be revisited to also include the importance of the underlying geology in influencing historic and current land uses and the widespread geological evidence, importance of soils and woodlands as carbon sinks, the permeability of the Park to enable species migration and the importance of ecosystem services in relation to food, timber and fresh, clean water. | The special qualities were agreed through consultation as part of the Management Plan review in 2004. It is considered that the geological importance of the Park is covered already by the special qualities 'Special landforms from the Ice Age' and 'Exceptional coastal geology'. The other suggestions are not considered to be special qualities, the special qualities are those features which distinguish the North York Moors National Park from anywhere else, whereas the suggestions are instead considered to be important functions of the Park. | 62 | 467 | Amend Plan |
| 1.2 Special Qualities of the North York Moors | Natural England | Support amendments to the vision but they could be expanded to reflect the priorities for National Parks on page 1, particularly the Park acting as an exemplar for integrated environmental and socio-economic sustainable development in light of climate change. | It is not considered appropriate to re-iterate the outcomes identified in the Circular. | 62 | 468 | No |
| 1.4 How the Management Plan Relates to other... | Scarborough Borough Council | The Localism agenda and 'duty to cooperate' increases the need to ensure that the plans and actions of the National Park Authority and those of constituent councils are in alignment. | This section identifies the aims and objectives of the constituent councils' community strategies, which have helped to inform the policies of the Management Plan. | 66 | 555 | No |
| 1.4 How the Management Plan Relates to other... | North East Yorkshire Geology Trust | No mention is made in the Plan to the Local Geodiversity Action Plan that the Geology Trust is about to publish. | Reference is made to the Geodiversity Action Plan in Core Policy C of the Core Strategy and Development Policies of the Local Development Framework. It is not considered appropriate to refer to every other plan which relates to the National Park in the Management Plan. | 53 | 397 | No |
| 1.4 How the Management Plan Relates to other... | Natural England | In the paragraph which contains 'Ecosystem services are defined...' reference should also be made to cultural services such as sense of place, sense of history and inspiration. | The last sentence of this paragraph has been expanded to state '..., open space for recreation, sense of place, sense of history and a place for inspiration.' | 62 | 470 | Amend Plan |
| 1.4 How the Management Plan Relates to other... | North Yorkshire County Council | There is scope to set delivery of the Management Plan within the scope of other initiatives, such as Local Nature Partnerships and the North Yorkshire Rights of Way Improvement Plan. | Other plans and strategies have been identified in the Means to Achieve of each policy where they are relevant to its achievement, whilst trying to prevent the Plan from becoming out of date bearing in mind its 5 year life. The purpose of the Means to Achieve is explained in 1.9 Delivering the Plan. | 40 | 209 | No |

| Part of Plan | Respondent | Summary of Comments | Authority Response | Respondent ID | Response ID | Action needed? |
|---|------------------------------------|---|--|---------------|-------------|----------------|
| 1.4 How the Management Plan Relates to other... | English Heritage | Should the historic environment be included as one of the themes (identified from the 5 community strategies)? Could add reference 'contribution of historic environment - tourism, sustainability'. In the chart on page 6, add reference to the historic environment. | 'and cultural heritage.' has been added to the end of the first bullet point in relation to the community strategies. The strategies in the chart are purely examples. | 37 | 189 | Amend |
| 1.4 How the Management Plan Relates to other... | Marine Management Organisation | The Marine Policy Statement should be mentioned, and future Marine Plan for the North East Inshore area, in keeping with the duty to cooperate introduced by the Localism Act. | 1.4 contains examples only, but the fourth paragraph has been expanded to include examples of other plans and policies which have helped to inform the Management Plan, including reference to the Marine Policy Statement. | 50 | 315 | Amend Plan |
| 1.4 How the Management Plan Relates to other... | Thirlby Parish Meeting | Presumably the Management Plan will also need to be consistent with the National Planning Policy Statement. It would be helpful to indicate ways in which this will simplify or complicate the Management Plan process. | The National Planning Policy Framework provides guidance for the planning system, whereas the Management Plan is outwith the formal planning system and it is therefore not directly relevant. | 48 | 547 | No |
| 1.4 How the Management Plan Relates to other... | North East Yorkshire Geology Trust | Geodiversity should be mentioned in the 'themes', particularly within conserve and enhance biodiversity and natural and built environments. | This is taken from the Sustainable Community Strategies within which there is no reference to geodiversity. | 53 | 395 | No |
| 1.5 Why Review the Management Plan? | Natural England | The pursuit of economic objectives should support, rather than compromise, the two statutory purposes. Therefore other approaches may replace the importance of tourism, such as properly valued ecosystem services. | The decline in tourism not only has implications for the economy, but also for meeting the second National Park purpose in terms of promoting understanding and enjoyment of the Park. A new sentence has been added to the end of the final paragraph in 1.6 to state 'In the future, payments for ecosystem services may become more mainstream in recognition of the role that farming can have in meeting wider environmental objectives.' | 62 | 471 | Amend Plan |
| 1.6 Benefits from Moorland, Woodland, Farmland... | Natural England | Reference to an integrated approach to the management of upland areas may lessen the relative importance of such an approach to the Park's lowland areas. | This has been amended to state 'An integrated approach to the management of the Park's ecosystems...' | 62 | 472 | Amend Plan |
| 1.6 Benefits from Moorland, Woodland, Farmland... | Campaign for National Parks | Welcomes the Authority's aim to adopt an ecosystem services approach to objective setting and delivery within the Plan. This is in line with the National Ecosystem Assessment, Natural Environment White Paper and the UK Government Vision and Circular for National Parks. The Plan rightly recognises that the approach needs to be developed in line with important legislation. | Comments noted. Whilst the plan considers what the Park provides and could provide in the future a full ecosystem services approach has not been adopted as it is acknowledged that this can be impractical and too technical for such a large area providing many different services over many different ecosystems. | 22 | 108 | No |

| Part of Plan | Respondent | Summary of Comments | Authority Response | Respondent ID | Response ID | Action needed? |
|---|---|--|---|---------------|-------------|----------------|
| 1.6 Benefits from Moorland, Woodland, Farmland... | Great Ayton Parish Council | Reference to figures should also include the date, it may be better to include the figures in 4.2 and 4.3. | Reference to figures has been removed from the table. | 57 | 418 | Amend Plan |
| 1.6 Benefits from Moorland, Woodland, Farmland... | Natural England | Further ecosystem services should be added to the table, notably 'coastal flooding' and 'dynamic coastal processes' under regulating, and 'sense of place', 'sense of history' and 'learning and education' under cultural services. | It is considered that coastal flooding and dynamic coastal processes are not ecosystem services, they are rather events which take place in the coastal ecosystem. 'Sense of place', 'sense of history' and 'learning and education' could apply to the whole Park, a sentence has been added to the end of the fourth paragraph to state 'Some services, such as creating a sense of place and providing opportunities for learning and education and supporting services such as photosynthesis and soil formation, are common to all ecosystems.'. In addition, sense of place has been referred to in the new table in 1.9 which will set out what impacts should be avoided when delivering the aspirations of the Plan. | 62 | 473 | Amend Plan |
| 1.6 Benefits from Moorland, Woodland, Farmland... | RSPB | Reference to wildlife and biodiversity should be added to the opening paragraphs. Biodiversity is a key component and a prime indicator of the health and function of ecosystems. The table on page 8 lacks the fourth component 'supporting'. These functions are important to environmental health and to land-based economies. Burning on moorland can impede all examples of supporting services if not appropriately managed. | The table is based on the National Ecosystem Assessment categories, in many models 'supporting' is often covered by 'regulating'. Reference has been added to the fourth paragraph in 1.6 to state 'Some services, such as creating a sense of place and providing opportunities for learning and education and supporting services such as photosynthesis and soil formation, are common to all ecosystems.' | 45 | 250 | Amend Plan |
| 1.6 Benefits from Moorland, Woodland, Farmland... | Thirlby Parish Meeting | 'Ecosystem services' suggests that the natural world should serve humans rather than the other way round. It would be better to refer to healthy, viable ecosystems, natural processes and the maintenance and support of these. There are benefits to people from the Park's ecosystems as long as they are managed well. This is clearer in the final paragraph. | A sentence will be added to the end of the first paragraph to state 'It is important that ecosystems are maintained in a healthy condition.' | 48 | 296 | Amend Plan |
| 1.6 Benefits from Moorland, Woodland, Farmland... | Great Ayton Parish Council | Table is referred to as Figure 1 but is not labelled. | The table has been labelled 'Figure 1'. | 57 | 417 | Amend Plan |
| 1.6 Benefits from Moorland, Woodland, Farmland... | Ryedale District Council (Forward Planning) | Support the emphasis on protecting and sustainably using ecosystem services. | Support noted | 10 | 43 | No |

| Part of Plan | Respondent | Summary of Comments | Authority Response | Respondent ID | Response ID | Action needed? |
|-----------------------------|----------------------------|--|--|---------------|-------------|----------------|
| 1.7 Sustainable Development | RSPB | Agree that National Parks should be exemplars of sustainable development. In the absence of a standard definition adopted by government sustainable development should be based on the Guiding Principles in the UK Sustainable Development Strategy. | The definition is based upon that contained in the National Parks' Circular which is considered to be more directly relevant to National Parks. | 45 | 251 | No |
| 1.7 Sustainable Development | Natural England | The Brundtland definition of sustainable development should be included. | Text has been included at the start of the paragraph to state 'The most widely accepted definition of sustainable development is that defined in the 1987 Brundtland Report - 'Sustainable development is development that meets the needs of the present without compromising the ability of future generations to meet their own needs.' | 62 | 474 | Amend Plan |
| 1.8 Pressures for Change | Paul Ming | How does CO2 become methane and nitrous oxide? | The sentence refers to the CO2 equivalent of the emissions of methane and nitrous oxide for the basis of comparison with actual CO2 emissions. The sentence has been re-worded for clarity to state 'In 2006, methane and nitrous oxide emissions from the Park were equivalent to 314kt of CO2.' | 41 | 221 | Amend Plan |
| 1.8 Pressures for Change | Natural England | Support the sentence '...it is generally accepted that further intensification of agriculture for example through increased use of fertilisers and pesticides or more intensive factory farming would harm the environment and landscape of the National Park' but this is in contradiction to section 4.2. | This has been addressed through amendments to section 4.2 Agriculture to clarify the intention of the objectives for agriculture. A table has been included in 1.9 which identifies where various activities (farming, tree planting, habitat expansion) should and should not take place, and what the potential positive and negative (to be mitigated) impacts would be. | 62 | 476 | Amend Plan |
| 1.8 Pressures for Change | Hambleton District Council | Climate change could affect the Park through drought, fire, flood, extreme heat and cold, snow levels, invasive species and new diseases. A wider variety of species should be encouraged. There should be emergency plans so that local communities are prepared and are aware of how the NPA can help in cases of extreme weather. | Policies relating to habitats and wildlife and trees and woodlands aim to create more resilient networks. It is understood that the constituent Councils produce Emergency Plans, it is not possible to refer to every other Plan in the Management Plan as it would be too detailed. | 52 | 392 | No |
| 1.8 Pressures for Change | Natural England | This could also include reference to current policy drivers including the European Landscape Convention, the England Biodiversity Strategy, the UK Geological Action Plan and the Natural Environment White Paper. | Current policies are contained in 1.4, and further reference to the plans and strategies of other organisations has been added. Specific reference to the Natural Environment White Paper and the European Landscape Convention has been added, and the England Biodiversity Strategy is referred to. Relevant policies and strategies are identified in each chapter where appropriate. | 62 | 475 | No |

| Part of Plan | Respondent | Summary of Comments | Authority Response | Respondent ID | Response ID | Action needed? |
|--------------------------|------------------------------------|--|--|---------------|-------------|----------------|
| 1.8 Pressures for Change | Natural England | It would be helpful to indicate how objectives and actions will be priorities in light of budget reductions. | This will be done through the Authority's Business Plan which is being produced alongside the Management Plan. | 62 | 548 | No |
| 1.8 Pressures for Change | Natural England | The importance of visitor experience should be seen as a special quality, dependent upon or enhanced by tranquillity and isolation. A balance should be pursued with a clear recognition that the statutory purposes should prevail, prioritising a precautionary approach. | The importance of tranquillity to enjoyment of the Park is identified in 2.3 Tranquillity (now 2.4). Section 1.9 explains that any activities arising from the Plan should be undertaken in line with statutory National Park purposes. | 62 | 477 | No |
| 1.8 Pressures for Change | RSPB | The account of issues and challenges is incomplete, and there is a lack of viable solutions to address these. There are several bird conservation priorities of national and international significance that the Plan does not even begin to address. There should be a paragraph on the legislative and policy drivers for wildlife conservation and the need to halt biodiversity loss, the National Park should contribute towards the delivery of national and regional biodiversity and conservation targets. | The section relates to the pressures for change and where a new approach may be needed as opposed to every topic that needs to be addressed. Wildlife conservation and maintaining biodiversity are ongoing priorities for the Park and this is made clear in the first paragraph of section 1.8. | 45 | 249 | No |
| 1.8 Pressures for Change | North East Yorkshire Geology Trust | The Geology Trust could make a contribution to quite a few issues raised in this section including understanding climate change, tourism and branding, health through nature, localism and contraction of resources. | The North East Yorkshire Geology Trust have been referred to in the Means to Achieve new policy E27 on increasing awareness and understanding of the Park's geological assets. | 53 | 398 | Amend? |
| 1.8 Pressures for Change | Paul Ming | Some areas of woodlands should be left unconnected so that predators can eat, is this what buffering means? | Buffering relates to planting trees or creating other habitats adjacent to existing woodlands to help protect them from the effects of other land uses. The intention is not to connect all woodlands in the Park, but to develop better networks of a range of habitats so that the landscape is more 'permeable' for wildlife. | 41 | 222 | No |
| 1.8 Pressures for Change | Buglife | Increasing the area of woodland could be beneficial to invertebrates but land should firstly be evaluated for its current wildlife values (including invertebrates), open habitat can be of more significance. Tree planting and filling gaps could conflict with aims to increase the area of open species-rich habitat. | It is considered that much of the tree planting could take place on bracken covered slopes or other areas of low biodiversity value. In some cases open woodland and other habitat mosaics can be developed and the Plan states that further work is required to ascertain precisely where tree planting may be feasible. A table is to be included in 1.9 which will identify where various activities (farming, tree planting, habitat expansion) should and should not take place, and what the potential positive and negative (to be mitigated) impacts would be. | 2 | 7 | Amend Plan |

| Part of Plan | Respondent | Summary of Comments | Authority Response | Respondent ID | Response ID | Action needed? |
|---|------------------------------------|---|--|---------------|-------------|----------------|
| 1.9 How the Management Plan will be Delivered | Great Ayton Parish Council | A footnote should be included to clarify / explain the meaning of the Sandford principle. | A footnote has been added to state 'Introduced in legislation by the 1995 Environment Act.' | 57 | 420 | Amend Plan |
| 1.9 How the Management Plan will be Delivered | North East Yorkshire Geology Trust | The Geology Trust has not been approached to become a committed partner or to be a signatory of the Plan. | The North East Yorkshire Geology Trust have been referred to in the Means to Achieve new policy E27 on increasing awareness and understanding of the Park's geological assets. | 53 | 399 | No |
| 1.9 How the Management Plan will be Delivered | Great Ayton Parish Council | The term 'stakeholder' is outdated and has a financial connotation. | The term 'stakeholder' is commonly used and understood. | 57 | 421 | No |
| 1.9 How the Management Plan will be Delivered | Great Ayton Parish Council | The final Plan should indicate how communication of the Plan will be delivered. | Reference has been added to 1.9 to how the Plan will be communicated beyond the main stakeholders, for example through the Moors Messenger. | 57 | 438 | Amend Plan |
| 1.9 How the Management Plan will be Delivered | RSPB | Welcome the recognition of the need to implement the Plan in a way which ensures damage to Natura 2000 sites is avoided and that the Sandford principle is applied where necessary. However much of the Plan lacks detail to ensure this occurs and many policies conflict with this requirement. Agree that further discussion is needed with stakeholders on delivery and monitoring and would welcome the opportunity to discuss these issues. | The Plan should be read as a whole. A table has been included in 1.9 which will identify where various activities (farming, tree planting, habitat expansion) should and should not take place, and what the potential positive and negative (to be mitigated) impacts would be. The inclusion of additional detail in the Habitats Regulations Assessment demonstrates how the Plan can be implemented in a way which will ensure that there is no harm to Natura 2000 sites. | 45 | 252 | Amend Plan |
| Chapter 2 - Environment | Natural England | The sections based upon distinct landscape elements are welcomed (Moorland, Trees and Woodland, Rivers and Streams, and Coastal and Marine). However, this could be further developed with strategic landscape units from the Landscape Character Assessment forming the principal underpinning structure for the Plan and its policies. | It was initially intended that the main ecosystems of the Park would form the 'chapters' of the Plan. However, many issues are park-wide and to avoid repetition it was considered more appropriate to use topic based chapters. It is considered that the same issues would emerge through structuring a Plan around the Landscape Character Areas. | 62 | 479 | No |
| Chapter 2 - Environment | Natural England | The approach of supplementary sections on Moorland, Trees and Woodland, Rivers and Streams and Coastal and Marine Environment is supported, but this could be further developed with the strategic landscape units from the Landscape Character Assessment underpinning the Plan, possibly in future reviews. | It is considered that the ecosystem services provided by the different landscape character areas often overlap between areas, which may lead to repetition of particular aims and policies. The four broader areas were selected due to the significance of the level of distinction between them whereas many of the landscape units from the Landscape Character Area are likely to overlap in terms of the provision of ecosystem services. | 62 | 567 | No |

| Part of Plan | Respondent | Summary of Comments | Authority Response | Respondent ID | Response ID | Action needed? |
|-------------------------|--|---|---|---------------|-------------|----------------|
| Chapter 2 - Environment | Buglife | There is no section on biodiversity. | Biodiversity is integral to the Habitats and Wildlife section. | 2 | 2 | No |
| Chapter 2 - Environment | Hambleton District Council | The Plan should seek to increase the area / volume of carbon sinks such as peat bogs. | The Plan seeks to continue to restore peat bogs, under section 2.7 Soils. | 52 | 356 | No |
| Chapter 2 - Environment | Natural England | Instead of 'economic use of the environment' (4th paragraph) reference should be made to 'environmentally dependent' economic uses or businesses. | The sentence has been amended to 'Environmentally dependent economic uses, including agriculture and shooting...' | 62 | 478 | Amend Plan |
| Chapter 2 - Environment | North Yorkshire County Council | Pleased to note the Plan's consideration of both the intrinsic value of environmental assets as well as the valuable services they provide. | Comment noted. | 40 | 212 | No |
| Chapter 2 - Environment | Redcar and Cleveland Strategic Partnership | Pretty comprehensive and given what 'we know now' and can forecast for the near future, I would suggest that all of the most salient issues have been considered. | Comment noted. | 6 | 19 | No |
| Chapter 2 - Environment | Ingleby Arncliffe Parish Council | The need is to get the balance right between the wish to use and live in a National Park and the potential damage to landscape, tranquillity and habitat. | The Management Plan recognises this through the inclusion of policies to both protect and enhance the environment but also support businesses and communities. The Local Development Framework contains policies to ensure that new development is carried out in a way which is appropriate to the Park's environment. | 34 | 170 | No |
| 2.1 Landscape | Natural England | The actions and capital investment programmes of utility companies and other relevant authorities should be included in the Means to Achieve in the final policy. | This policy relates only to highways and transport infrastructure, this has been clarified through amending to read '...replacement highways infrastructure...'. Development by utility companies is captured under policy E3. | 62 | 481 | Amend Plan |

| Part of Plan | Respondent | Summary of Comments | Authority Response | Respondent ID | Response ID | Action needed? |
|---------------|--------------------------------|---|---|---------------|-------------|----------------|
| 2.1 Landscape | Marine Management Organisation | To complement references to landscape please note section 2.6.5 of the Marine Policy Statement concerning seascape. | A sentence on seascape has been added to section 2.1 Landscape to the paragraph which begins 'This diversity..' to state 'The coastline of the Park forms a distinctive seascape, characterised by high cliffs interspersed with narrow valleys.' Further detail on seascape has been included in 2.11 Coastal and Marine Environment in the first paragraph to state 'The dramatic coastal scenery along the Park's eastern boundary is enhanced by the open skies and seascape adjoining it. Uninterrupted views over the sea can be gained from various high vantage points along the coast most notably at Ravenscar and Boulby. Work is currently being undertaken nationally on Seascape Characterisation by Natural England and will be a key element of Marine Plans in the near future'. | 50 | 313 | Amend Plan |
| 2.1 Landscape | Great Ayton Parish Council | Welcomes reference to roadsigns. | Comment noted. | 57 | 422 | No |
| 2.1 Landscape | Natural England | Support the commitment to produce a Landscape Conservation Action Plan and the recognition of the interdependence between landscape and other uses and activities in the Park, particularly within the context of climate change. | Support welcomed. | 62 | 480 | No |
| 2.1 Landscape | Scarborough Borough Council | Opportunities for joint working to develop the Landscape Conservation Action Plan and on elements of 'green infrastructure' provisions should be explored. Officers would be keen identify opportunities for cross boundary alignment of policy and activities. | Comment noted. | 66 | 557 | No |
| 2.1 Landscape | Hartoft Parish Council | Policies / monitoring may not be compatible with the way incoming residents wish to develop properties, such as occupying farm houses without the associated land management. | Promoting / supporting farming may help to ensure that farms remain as such. The National Park Authority, as planning authority, has no control over whether occupants manage the land or not, but can control subsequent changes such as the need for new buildings if land management was later resumed. | 51 | 319 | No |
| 2.1 Landscape | Forestry Commission | In the second challenge, remove reference to planting of non-native trees as the trend in recent years has been the reverse. | The challenge relates to the potential demand to plant non-native trees for biomass, this has been clarified through amending the challenge to state '...and increased planting in response to demand for biomass.' | 43 | 440 | Amend Plan |

| Part of Plan | Respondent | Summary of Comments | Authority Response | Respondent ID | Response ID | Action needed? |
|---------------------------|--------------------------------------|--|---|---------------|-------------|----------------|
| 2.1 Landscape | Redcar and Cleveland Borough Council | Support the policy which states 'New development will not have a detrimental impact on the landscape of the National Park'. | Support noted. | 35 | 175 | No |
| 2.1 Landscape | Hartoft Parish Council | It is incongruous to worry about road signs amongst the problems we face. If change in the landscape is resisted it is always catastrophic when it does happen. Resisting changes to economic demand will lead to economic decline, as inferred by conservation. Communities and organisations cannot achieve this as 'someone else' is expected to maintain it. | Conserving the landscape falls within the first National Park statutory purpose. The environment of the Park is an important factor in the economy, particularly tourism. Communities have not been identified in the Means to Achieve. | 51 | 318 | No |
| 2.1 Landscape | English Heritage | There is lack of reference to designed landscapes which form a considerable part of the National Park, these are the Rievaulx Terrace, Duncombe Park, Mulgrave and Arncliffe Hall. The moorland edge and its specific character is under-represented in the text. The 2nd policy should state '...will not have a detrimental impact on the landscape and designed landscapes of the National Park' and the means to achieve should include Conservation Area Appraisals and Management Plans. The method of measuring the success of this would be a number of Management Plans produced for each designed landscape or the production of a number of Conservation Area Appraisals. The 4th challenge should include reference to 'erosion of settlement character by incremental change in building and structures.' | Reference to designed landscapes has been included in the text (rather than the policy) at the end of the paragraph 'This diversity...' to state 'The National Park also contains a number of designed landscapes which are included on English Heritage's Register of Historic Parks and Gardens. These are Rievaulx Terrace, Duncombe Park, Mulgrave Castle and Arncliffe Hall.' Conservation Area Appraisals and Management Plans are Supplementary Planning Documents which form part of the Local Development Framework, Core Policies A and G are referred to in the policy table but to add reference to a lot of other documents would not be practical. They are referred to in the text of 2.2 Historic Environment. There are no targets for CAAs as it has become less of a priority now that Article 4 Directions are in place. These were the main challenges identified by the refresh of the Landscape Character Assessment but the second challenge in 2.4 Heritage Assets (now 2.2 Historic Environment) has been amended to state 'Erosion of settlement character through incremental alterations and small scale developments, and pressure for inappropriate alterations to the built heritage, including from renewable energy installations.' | 37 | 184 | Amend Plan |
| 2.2 Habitats and Wildlife | Buglife | The importance of springs and seepages should be highlighted, and the national importance of flushes to inverts. Wetlands such as Fen Moss are not mentioned. Concern that there has not been a baseline survey of invert resources to inform decisions on which springs and seepages are especially significant. Aquifers have been exploited by water abstraction. | It would be too detailed to mention specific wetlands such as Fen Bog in the Plan. Soldier flies and whorl snails are mentioned in relation to fens and flushes, but it is considered too detailed for the Management Plan to consider which springs and seepages are especially significant. The final sentence of 7th paragraph will be amended to state 'Fens, flushes, springs and seepages...'. There are no known problems of aquifers being exploited by water abstraction. | 2 | 4 | Amend Plan |

| Part of Plan | Respondent | Summary of Comments | Authority Response | Respondent ID | Response ID | Action needed? |
|---------------------------|--------------------------------------|--|--|---------------|-------------|----------------|
| 2.2 Habitats and Wildlife | RSPB | The indicator relating to the population of Merlin will be valuable. Recent research shows that the population is already suffering a major decline. Measures to understand and address this should be a conservation priority. | Data collated by the National Park Authority shows that merlin populations have fluctuated over recent years, the data has been looked at in detail and no clear trends have been identified. Merlin populations are affected by a range of factors, many of which cannot be influenced, and therefore it is considered that a specific target may prove unattainable or meaningless. | 45 | 258 | No |
| 2.2 Habitats and Wildlife | North Yorkshire County Council | It might be useful to explore whether the development of Local Nature Partnerships might lead to a cross boundary consensus and a joint strategy for the development of the natural environments across North Yorkshire and York. | The penultimate challenge states 'Changes to the means of delivering enhancements for biodiversity through the introduction of Local Nature Partnerships, Nature Improvement Areas and biodiversity offsetting' which recognises that Local Nature Partnerships may be relevant. | 40 | 210 | Amend Plan |
| 2.2 Habitats and Wildlife | Comments from Parish Forums | Can additional areas of species rich grassland be accommodated without using up productive farmland? | The Plan states that any new areas of species rich grassland should be on lower productivity grassland (that which is currently species-poor). A table has been included in 1.9 which identifies where various activities (farming, tree planting, habitat expansion) should and should not take place, and what the potential positive and negative (to be mitigated) impacts would be. | 56 | 412 | Amend Plan |
| 2.2 Habitats and Wildlife | Natural England | This section should help to deliver the targets of the England Biodiversity Strategy including targets for areas of priority habitats, restoration of degraded habitats and restoration / creation of ecological connectivity. The England Biodiversity Strategy target for SSSIs is 50% in favourable condition by 2020. There is perhaps some confusion between targets and indicators. The target for species rich grassland is welcome. Have waders and merlin been selected as good indicators of the health and resilience of wider habitats, and can more ambitious targets be set for them? There should be a target to increase raptors, the presence of which can be a tourist attraction. | Currently 11% of SSSIs are in favourable condition, and a further 88% in unfavourable recovering. Waders and merlin have been included in the targets as they have been monitored for a long time. The indicators and targets have been separated out, in relation to SSSIs reference has been added to the target contributing towards the England Biodiversity Strategy target. The targets are based around data which is available to the Authority. | 62 | 482 | Amend Plan |
| 2.2 Habitats and Wildlife | Game and Wildlife Conservation Trust | The general tones of references to grouse moor management are quite negative. | The wildlife benefits are highlighted in 4.4 Moorland Shooting. | 58 | 443 | No |
| 2.2 Habitats and Wildlife | RSPB | Agree that the indicator on wading birds is appropriate. Suitable measures and timescales need to be identified. | This would be too detailed for the Management Plan. | 45 | 257 | No |

| Part of Plan | Respondent | Summary of Comments | Authority Response | Respondent ID | Response ID | Action needed? |
|---------------------------|----------------|--|---|---------------|-------------|----------------|
| 2.2 Habitats and Wildlife | RSPB | The North York Moors Biodiversity Action Plan is still incomplete and lacks any objectives or actions for birds. The Management Plan should identify conservation objectives, actions and targets for priority bird species in the Park, aimed at working towards favourable conservation status for the SPA and favourable condition for SSSIs including thriving bird populations on the citations. Objectives should also aim to restore and enhance populations of other declining bird species, e.g. red-listed species and BAP species. Breeding waders should be a priority here. | This will be delivered through the Local Biodiversity Action Plan which is identified in the Means to Achieve. The Biodiversity Action Plan is due to be reviewed shortly and whilst generally these will be more focussed on habitats than species in the future, species action plans could be produced if these were felt to be important. | 45 | 256 | No |
| 2.2 Habitats and Wildlife | RSPB | Breeding waders have undergone drastic declines in number and range over the last few years. Lapwing are a red-listed species of conservation concern. It is important that wader surveys should be undertaken in the next few years, as the last ones were 2008 (moorland) and 2003 (farmland). This would also be valuable in assessing the targeted HLS agreements. If wader numbers have held up in the North York Moors (in contrast to other areas) up to date surveys and information on land management would be valuable in addressing the widespread national decline. | The 2008 breeding waders survey for the National Park showed that populations of some species had declined but others had increased. The Management Plan contains a commitment to continue to monitor breeding waders. | 45 | 255 | No |
| 2.2 Habitats and Wildlife | Gus Pennington | Following progress made in relation to merlin/golden plover, the Authority may wish to say something explicit about protecting other raptor populations (e.g. rough legged buzzards, harriers, goshawks). North Yorkshire has a significantly worse record for bird of prey persecution than other areas of the country and has been rising over the last 10 years. The Park Authority could/should act as a forum convener and broker between landowner associations/shooting groups and other parties to reduce persecution. This needs to be enforced through incentives and sanctions. | Text will be added to 2.2 Habitats and Wildlife (now 2.3) to state 'There have been cases of illegal persecution of protected species in the National Park. Such incidences will continue to be addressed by the relevant enforcement agencies with appropriate support from the National Park Authority.'. A further challenge will be added to state 'Addressing wildlife crime.' | 5 | 17 | Amend Plan |
| 2.2 Habitats and Wildlife | RSPB | Concerned that Merlin, Golden Plover, Peregrine falcon, Hen Harrier, Short-Eared Owl, Lapwing and Ring Ouzel (for which moorland SSSIs are designated) are absent due to illegal persecution. North Yorkshire is consistently the worst county for illegal bird of prey persecution. Evidence suggests this is contingent with management of heather moorland for commercial red grouse shooting. The NPA should take a lead role in forming a partnership to address this issue. | Text has been added to 2.2 Habitats and Wildlife (now 2.3) to state 'There have been cases of illegal persecution of protected species in the National Park. Such incidences will continue to be tackled by the relevant enforcement agencies with appropriate support from the National Park Authority'. A further challenge has been added to state 'Addressing wildlife crime.' | 45 | 254 | Amend Plan |

| Part of Plan | Respondent | Summary of Comments | Authority Response | Respondent ID | Response ID | Action needed? |
|---------------------------|----------------------------------|---|--|---------------|-------------|----------------|
| 2.2 Habitats and Wildlife | RSPB | Recent research shows that Merlin populations in northern England have declined in recent years. The North York Moors data for this species represents the best and most comprehensive in the country, therefore understanding and addressing the decline in Merlin should be a conservation priority. | The Authority has been collating data on merlin which show that populations have been fluctuating rather than declining. A detailed examination of the data has not revealed any specific trends. | 45 | 253 | No |
| 2.2 Habitats and Wildlife | Hartoft Parish Council | The policy of 'no net loss to priority habitat...' may be aspirational if new landowners seek only to maximise income. | The policies should all be achieved alongside each other. This can be influenced through agri-environment schemes, and through the planning system for new developments. | 51 | 322 | No |
| 2.2 Habitats and Wildlife | Forestry Commission | Re the first challenge '...replacement of native woodland with conifers'. Recent changes have been in the opposite direction, is this actually a threat? This should be removed. | The challenge relates to areas previously affected by land management as opposed to current or future changes, this will be clarified by amending the text to read 'The need to continue to enhance and improve habitat connection in areas affected by previous land management practices. Such practises included moorland reclamation, grassland improvement, drainage, conversion to arable and especially replacement of native woodland with conifers. This is particularly significant as certain species may become increasingly at risk of becoming more isolated as a result of climate change.' | 43 | 241 | Amend Plan |
| 2.2 Habitats and Wildlife | Natural England | The 5th policy, which relates to diversifying habitats, should be clarified to explain which habitats are being referred to and whether it is intended that each habitat will be more diverse (which may not be compatible with the specific biodiversity interests) or that a more diverse suite of habitats will be created. It is not clear why field margins and grasslands are mentioned as particular habitats. | For clarity, this policy has been amended to state 'A more diverse range of habitats will be supported, particularly through management of field margins and grasslands.' | 62 | 485 | Amend Plan |
| 2.2 Habitats and Wildlife | Comments at Sutton Bank 11/12/11 | There should be more wildlife (deer, flowers, grassland). | A policy has been included which aims to create and restore additional areas of important habitats to ensure better networks for species, this states 'The connectivity and resilience of habitats will be improved both within and beyond the National Park, particularly in relation to species rich grasslands, woodlands and river corridors. Additional areas of species rich grassland will be restored or created on lower productivity grassland.' | 25 | 132 | No |

| Part of Plan | Respondent | Summary of Comments | Authority Response | Respondent ID | Response ID | Action needed? |
|---------------------------|--------------------------------------|--|--|---------------|-------------|----------------|
| 2.2 Habitats and Wildlife | Game and Wildlife Conservation Trust | There is considerable evidence that grouse moor management benefits many upland species, this should be mentioned, possibly alongside reference to SPA and SACs for Merlin and Golden Plover. | This is referred to in 4.4 Moorland Shooting. | 58 | 446 | No |
| 2.2 Habitats and Wildlife | Hartoft Parish Council | In relation to the 7th challenge, skills are often lost when people retire. New owners may find it difficult to let the land out as there are fewer active farmers. Apprentices are not taken on as there is not enough work and it is too arduous / poorly paid. | There are policies aiming to promote traditional skills in 2.4 Historic Assets (now 2.2 Historic Environment) and 4.2 Agriculture, and a policy in 4.2 Agriculture which supports environmental stewardship schemes. | 51 | 321 | No |
| 2.2 Habitats and Wildlife | Natural England | The words 'seek to' should be removed from the 6th policy. | This amendment has been made. | 62 | 486 | Amend Plan |
| 2.2 Habitats and Wildlife | Natural England | In relation to the 2nd and 3rd policies, the implications need to be considered in relation to the other aims of the Plan, notably those in the Agriculture section relating to an expansion and intensification of grassland for increased productivity. | A table is to be included in 1.9 which will identify where various activities (farming, tree planting, habitat expansion) should and should not take place, and what the potential positive and negative (to be mitigated) impacts would be. | 62 | 484 | Amend Plan |
| 2.2 Habitats and Wildlife | Natural England | Under the 2nd policy, specific habitats which are to be addressed should be identified and what land is likely to be given up. | Reference has been added in relation to the habitat connections mapping work which has been taking place and the strategic habitat connections map has been included. The Plan states that this should form the main driver for work on biodiversity. Specific sites where resources will be focussed are being identified as part of the Business Plan process. A table has been included in 1.9 which identifies where various activities (farming, tree planting, habitat expansion) should and should not take place, and what the potential positive and negative (to be mitigated) impacts would be. | 62 | 483 | Amend Plan |
| 2.2 Habitats and Wildlife | Natural England | This section should be more ambitious, with more specific and measurable targets. Reflecting the Lawton review, it could set out policies for improving connectivity and permeability, removing barriers to species migration, establishing buffers and expanding priority habitats. | The habitat connections map has been included which sets out the basis of strategic connections in the National Park. The focus for delivering many of the habitats and wildlife policies will be on strengthening these connections. Detailed work is underway to identify specific sites where work can focus upon improving connections, including via the measures outlined above. | 62 | 565 | Amend Plan |

| Part of Plan | Respondent | Summary of Comments | Authority Response | Respondent ID | Response ID | Action needed? |
|---------------------------|--------------------------------------|---|---|---------------|-------------|----------------|
| 2.2 Habitats and Wildlife | Natural England | It will be important to ensure that visitor pressure is managed so that possible harmful effects, particularly upon Natura 2000 sites, are avoided. | Sections 3.1 and 3.2 recognise that the Park needs to be promoted in a way which will ensure that visitor activity is appropriate to conserving and enhancing the environment, and that the principles of 'wise growth' should be adopted. A table has been included in 1.9 which will identify where various activities (farming, tree planting, habitat expansion) should and should not take place, and what the potential positive and negative (to be mitigated) impacts would be. | 62 | 487 | Amend Plan |
| 2.2 Habitats and Wildlife | Redcar and Cleveland Borough Council | Support the policy 'New development will seek to protect biodiversity and provide enhancements'. | Support noted | 35 | 177 | No |
| 2.2 Habitats and Wildlife | Redcar and Cleveland Borough Council | Support improvements to habitat connection. | Support noted. | 35 | 176 | No |
| 2.2 Habitats and Wildlife | Marine Management Organisation | Regarding reference to the Marine Plan as a means to achieve, future Marine Plan development will be in accordance with, and enhance where possible, measures set out in the Management Plan and Local Development Framework. | Noted. | 50 | 316 | No |
| 2.2 Habitats and Wildlife | Hartoft Parish Council | Tackling invasive species is labour intensive and volunteers are often difficult to find in dispersed parishes. | The National Park Authority are working to tackle invasive species including Himalayan balsam and Japanese knotweed at various locations. | 51 | 320 | No |
| 2.2 Habitats and Wildlife | Game and Wildlife Conservation Trust | The fifth challenge - explain what the impacts might be and how they will be monitored. | Examples are included in 2.8 Moorland, it is not considered necessary to repeat these here. The impacts will be monitored via the ongoing monitoring of wildlife generally, it is not proposed to specifically monitor the effects of grouse management. | 58 | 445 | Amend Plan |
| 2.2 Habitats and Wildlife | Buglife | Not clear how invertebrates have been considered in drafting the Plan and how new information will be channelled into the planning and habitat management process. | Invertebrates form part of the wider habitats which are discussed. More detailed consideration of priority habitats will take place through any future review of the Local Biodiversity Action Plan. | 2 | 3 | No |

| Part of Plan | Respondent | Summary of Comments | Authority Response | Respondent ID | Response ID | Action needed? |
|---------------------------|--|--|--|---------------|-------------|----------------|
| 2.2 Habitats and Wildlife | Peter Woods | Predator control must be more firmly controlled. There are increasing shortages of raptors such as harriers, owls, buzzards, stoats and foxes. If we are to stop rare species persecution in other parts of the world, we should do the same here. Reductions in numbers of stoats, buzzards and foxes has resulted in an increase in rabbits which consume huge amounts of pasture, 5 rabbits eat the same as one sheep and will therefore have significant effects on farm incomes. | The Game and Wildlife Conservation Trust's Code of Good Shooting Practice 2008 will be referred to in the means to achieve in relation to shooting policies in sections 4.4 and 4.5. This Code includes guidance on predator control. The Authority is not aware of any problems associated with stoats and foxes. | 28 | 155 | Amend Plan |
| 2.3 Tranquillity | Redcar and Cleveland Borough Council | Support the policy 'Noise from the use of recreational motorised vehicles will be minimised'. | Support noted. | 35 | 178 | No |
| 2.3 Tranquillity | Motor Sports Association / Assoc of Northern Car Clubs / (Yorkshire Motorsports) Forest Users' Group | Reference in paragraph 7 to the 'use of off-road motorised vehicles for recreational purposes' is misleading as the vehicles which take part in rallies or enduro competitions are all road going vehicles which comply with noise restrictions. Any signage is only temporary, removed after the event. Other vehicles are built for off-road competitions, but it is not thought that any of these take place in the North York Moors National Park. There are seldom, if ever, any noise issues associated with observation / sporting trials which have no speed element. In relation to the policy 'noise from the use of recreational motorised vehicles will be minimised', the Forestry Commission and National Park Authority's requirements for motor sport events are complied with in full and take any action needed for subsequent events. There are only a few events each year and it is not intended to increase this significantly. Such events contribute considerably to the tourism economy of the Park. Whilst maintaining and enhancing tranquillity is laudable, it must be remembered that National Parks were created for enjoyment by all members of society. | Comments noted, although some off-roading recreational activities do affect the tranquillity of the Park. | 27 | 141 | No |
| 2.3 Tranquillity | B E Vyner | Unless the National Park Authority works with adjoining councils there will be no improvement to light pollution on the perimeter of the Park. | A policy in this section aims to ensure that development outside the Park does not affect tranquillity within the Park, through the National Park Authority responding to relevant planning applications. | 26 | 139 | No |
| 2.3 Tranquillity | Yorkshire Dales Green Lanes Alliance | Tranquillity is not just about absence of noise, but about the perception of an area being remote, wild and free from human impact. Recreational motor vehicles on green lanes destroy this. | This is reflected in the text. | 47 | 294 | No |

| Part of Plan | Respondent | Summary of Comments | Authority Response | Respondent ID | Response ID | Action needed? |
|------------------|--|--|---|---------------|-------------|----------------|
| 2.3 Tranquillity | Buglife | Pleased that new development must not cause unacceptable light pollution. | Comment noted. | 2 | 8 | No |
| 2.3 Tranquillity | Welcome to Yorkshire | There is no reason that an increase in visitor numbers would adversely impact on the National Park, although issues of traffic and parking will need to be handled carefully. | This is covered in 3.1. The third challenge will be amended to state 'managing the potential increase in the number of visitors.' | 49 | 300 | Amend Plan |
| 2.3 Tranquillity | Redcar and Cleveland Strategic Partnership | The aim to preserve tranquility may prove to be a growing challenge. | Comment noted, it is considered that many of the policies in the Management Plan will help to ensure that tranquillity is preserved and further work is to be undertaken. | 6 | 20 | No |
| 2.3 Tranquillity | English Heritage | The monitoring measure is not a measure, it is an aim or an objective. | The monitoring measures have been modified to identify the indicator and the target or desired direction of change. It is possible that any future mapping work may not be precisely comparable with previous mapping (although this would be desirable) as it will not be undertaken by the CPRE, also there is no commitment to undertake mapping by any particular time. Therefore it is not possible to set a target. | 37 | 190 | No |
| 2.3 Tranquillity | Natural England | Supports this section but 'undiscovered' in the 3rd policy should state 'undisturbed' or 'less disturbed'. The policies should aim for an expansion in tranquil areas, to reverse as well as counter threats to tranquillity. | This policy has been deleted and replaced by a policy which covers all elements of tranquillity and states 'Existing tranquil areas will be protected, and expanded where possible'. | 62 | 488 | Amend Plan |
| 2.3 Tranquillity | Comments from Parish Forums | The development of a potash mine in the Park would totally change the tranquillity. | This would be an issue for the consideration of any planning application that the Authority receives, rather than for the Management Plan. | 56 | 413 | No |
| 2.3 Tranquillity | Peter Woods | Dark skies are only really apparent in the southern parts of the Park, anywhere north of the Lyke Wake Walk is affected by the orange glow from Teesside. There are also isolated examples of unnecessary light pollution which need to be challenged. | The issue of light pollution, particularly for Teesside, is recognised in the text. Comments will be taken into account through future work on tranquillity. | 28 | 145 | No |
| 2.3 Tranquillity | Thirlby Parish Meeting | The table should refer specifically to noise from motorcycles and recreational aircraft. | A sentence has been added to the middle of the seventh paragraph to state 'Noise from motorcycles and aircraft can also detract from tranquillity.' | 48 | 549 | Amend Plan |

| Part of Plan | Respondent | Summary of Comments | Authority Response | Respondent ID | Response ID | Action needed? |
|---------------------|----------------------------------|--|---|---------------|-------------|----------------|
| 2.3 Tranquillity | Paul Ming | Should powerlines that have just been renewed have been buried? | There is no requirement in the National Park for replacement powerlines to be buried. | 41 | 223 | No |
| 2.3 Tranquillity | Paul Ming | Dark skies should be improved rather than just maintained. Light from the streetlights in Fylingthorpe shine towards the sky, all street lights should shine down. The colour of light is important, orange light appears more urban / industrial. | A policy has been added which states 'Dark skies will be protected and improved'. | 41 | 224 | Amend Plan |
| 2.3 Tranquillity | Comments at Sutton Bank 11/12/11 | Dark skies and tranquillity should be maintained. | A policy will be included which seeks to maintain and improve dark skies. This will state 'Dark skies will be protected and improved. New development in the National Park will not cause unacceptable light or noise pollution'. | 25 | 131 | Amend Plan |
| 2.3 Tranquillity | Hartoft Parish Council | Even small increases in tourism will impact on tranquillity, such as noise from motor car rallies, motor cycle competitions and shooting. | The impact may however not be significant, it depends on how it is managed. This is addressed in 3.1 A Sustainable Growth in Visitors for the National Park. | 51 | 323 | No |
| 2.4 Heritage Assets | Great Ayton Parish Council | Should the word 'layer' in the 4th paragraph be 'section' or 'section through'. | This sentence has been reworded to read 'All of these phases of activity survive side by side, providing a physical record of some 5,000 years of use.' | 57 | 423 | Amend Plan |
| 2.4 Heritage Assets | Scarborough Borough Council | Building stone from within the National Park is also important for use in the areas surrounding the Park. The Plan should recognise this and note that the sourcing of materials for use outside the Park may be appropriate. | The sentence in the second paragraph will be amended to state 'The built environment of the area...'. Core Policy E of the Local Development Framework supports mineral extraction to meet a local need for building stone. | 66 | 558 | Amend Plan |
| 2.4 Heritage Assets | Natural England | Reference to the Lime and Ice project should be included as an example of how people engage with their heritage. | Reference to the Lime and Ice project has been added in the Means to Achieve of the 4th policy. | 62 | 489 | Amend Plan |

| Part of Plan | Respondent | Summary of Comments | Authority Response | Respondent ID | Response ID | Action needed? |
|---------------------|------------------------|--|--|---------------|-------------|----------------|
| 2.4 Heritage Assets | B E Vyner | It is unclear why the existing Conservation Areas are so poorly policed, and how this situation will be reversed, for example Osmotherley. There is reference to a 'Plan' for the historic environment but we have been waiting for this for 50 years. There needs to be a clear strategy rather than vague 'good thoughts'. | Article 4 Directions have been put in place in most of the Park's Conservation Areas including Osmotherley which means that planning permission is needed before changes such as new windows can take place. Conservation Area Supplementary Planning Documents have been adopted for some Conservation Areas which provide further guidance to inform planning decisions and other projects in Conservation Areas. There has not been any previous commitment to produce a plan specifically for the historic environment, the detailed strategy will be contained in the Cultural Heritage Action Plan which is to be prepared. Enforcement action is pursued in Conservation Areas where the Authority considers it expedient to do so. | 26 | 133 | No |
| 2.4 Heritage Assets | Nigel and Carol Wilson | There is an omission in relation to museums, in particular Ryedale Folk Museum, which is a valuable resource for education and entertainment, including relocated buildings and a store of local artefacts. The museum meets the requirements of many parts of the Plan including raising knowledge and awareness of the historic environment. | Museums will be included in the means to achieve. The final sentence of the text will be amended to state 'Partnership working between various interests including English Heritage, Highways Authorities, landowners, local history groups, schools, communities and the National Park Authority is key to achieving improvements in the historic environment.' | 24 | 123 | Amend Plan |
| 2.4 Heritage Assets | Michael Richardson | With regard to buildings 'at risk', the simple and probably cheaper option of demolition and removal should only be used if all other alternatives are not viable. | The Authority examines a variety of options to secure buildings at risk including grant aid, enforcement action to secure repair, schemes for alternative uses and consolidation works to stabilise disused structures. | 4 | 13 | No |
| 2.4 Heritage Assets | English Heritage | What else is threatening the archaeological resource of the Park? | This first challenge has been amended to read 'Disturbance and damage to archaeological sites, including by cairn building, upgrading of access tracks and drains, cutting heather, inappropriate moorland burning and wildfires and from recreation such as off-road vehicles, walking, mountain biking or horse riding.' | 37 | 193 | Amend Plan |
| 2.4 Heritage Assets | English Heritage | In relation to 'at risk' who is this defined by? | The third paragraph under Archaeology has been amended to clarify the number of Scheduled Monuments identified as at risk by the National Park Authority and the number identified as at risk by English Heritage. The fourth paragraph under Built Environment has been amended to clarify those buildings which are identified as being at risk by the National Park Authority and those which are identified as being at risk by English Heritage. | 37 | 192 | Amend Plan |

| Part of Plan | Respondent | Summary of Comments | Authority Response | Respondent ID | Response ID | Action needed? |
|---------------------|----------------------------|---|--|---------------|-------------|----------------|
| 2.4 Heritage Assets | Great Ayton Parish Council | It would be useful to refer to the National Park Authority's Apprentice Scheme as a Means to Achieve. | Reference to the Traditional Building Skills Apprenticeship Scheme has been included. | 57 | 424 | Amend Plan |
| 2.4 Heritage Assets | Hartoft Parish Council | 18th and 19th century domestic properties do not readily lend themselves to compliance with Building Regulations, and there are conflicts between these and planning rules which can render an old property incompatible with modern living expectations. | This issue is identified in the text. | 51 | 324 | No |
| 2.4 Heritage Assets | English Heritage | The policy should state 'conserve' instead of 'preserve'. Conservation Area Assessments and Design Guidance should be included in the means to achieve. | The text will be amended to state 'conserve'. Conservation Area Assessments and Design Guides are part of the Local Development Framework, in order to keep the Means to Achieve concise it is not appropriate to refer to these here. Conservation Area Assessments are referred to in the text. | 37 | 194 | Amend Plan |
| 2.4 Heritage Assets | English Heritage | A role for English Heritage has not been mentioned. Neither of the measures for monitoring are measures as they are not real reductions in numbers as new places will go on to the register. It should say 'The number of SMs at risk will have declined / reduced by 50 from the numbers presented in the initial list.' | Following discussions with English Heritage, the target has been reworded to read 'Number of Scheduled Monuments on the Monument Management Scheme list at risk - By 2017, the number at risk (principally High Risk and Medium Risk with high vulnerability) has been reduced by 65 from the number presented on the initial list.' Reference to the Monument Management Scheme (partnership between English Heritage and the National Park Authority) has been referred to in the Means to Achieve the first policy. In relation to Listed Buildings the target will be reworded to state 'Number of Listed Buildings on the Buildings at Risk register - 35 Buildings at Risk have been removed from the register.' If targets relate to the list as at 2012, monitoring will not reflect any buildings which are added to and also removed from the list between 2012 and 2017. Whilst overall reductions may not be achieved, there will be 35 fewer on the list in 2017 than there would otherwise have been. The final sentence has been amended to state 'Partnership working between various interests including local communities, landowners, local history groups, schools, English Heritage, Highways Authorities and the National Park Authority is key to achieving improvements in the historic environment.' In addition, English Heritage has been referred to in the 'In 15 Years Time...' part of the section. | 37 | 195 | Amend Plan |

| Part of Plan | Respondent | Summary of Comments | Authority Response | Respondent ID | Response ID | Action needed? |
|---------------------|----------------------------|---|--|---------------|-------------|----------------|
| 2.4 Heritage Assets | English Heritage | There is a lack of appreciation of the way in which the historic environment could be enhanced. | A new sentence has been added which states 'Conservation of the historic environment often creates opportunities for enhancement which can facilitate the introduction of viable new uses, having knock-on benefits for the economy.' | 37 | 185 | Amend Plan |
| 2.4 Heritage Assets | Natural England | The first bullet point under Challenges should include reference to risk of damage from cutting heather (which is possibly increasing) and unregulated burning. There should be cross-reference to 4.4 Moorland Shooting. | Reference to land management has been added to the first challenge which now reads 'Disturbance and damage to archaeological sites, including by cairn building, upgrading of access tracks and drains, cutting heather, inappropriate moorland burning and wildfires and from recreation such as off-road vehicles, walking, mountain biking or horse riding.' The majority of the moorland is under Natural England agreements and the issues raised should be addressed by these. It is not considered necessary to add cross-reference to 4.4 Moorland Shooting as the Plan should be read as a whole, and cross-references are not included elsewhere. | 62 | 490 | Amend Plan |
| 2.4 Heritage Assets | English Heritage | The first paragraph should include Cold War heritage. | The 2nd sentence of the first paragraph under Archaeology has been amended to read 'These represent the activities of human beings from the end of the last Ice Age (around 12,000 years ago) to important industrial landscape and military remains from the 20th Century, including from the Cold War.' | 37 | 191 | Amend Plan |
| 2.5 Geodiversity | Whitby Town Council | Whitby should be a focus of interest in the development of a Geopark. | A sentence has been added to the end of the third paragraph to state 'Any future Geopark should represent a continual area of geological interest and should be pursued if the administrative load is proportionate.' | 38 | 201 | Amend Plan |
| 2.5 Geodiversity | Great Ayton Parish Council | Perhaps there should be reference to the possibility of further potash mines and the associated issues. | The current exploration is referred to in 4.6 Local Businesses. | 57 | 426 | No |
| 2.5 Geodiversity | Great Ayton Parish Council | Should reference to the Whinstone dike not be Cleveland Dyke and included in the general description of the National Park's geology? | Reference to the Cleveland Dyke has been included in the list of features at the end of the first paragraph. | 57 | 425 | Amend Plan |

| Part of Plan | Respondent | Summary of Comments | Authority Response | Respondent ID | Response ID | Action needed? |
|------------------|------------------------------------|---|---|---------------|-------------|----------------|
| 2.5 Geodiversity | Natural England | More emphasis could be given to the international significance of the coastline for its rich fossil evidence, with an associated challenge relating to fossil collecting and the desirability of recording all finds to improve understanding. | The sentence in the first paragraph will be amended to read 'The Park, particularly the coast, is internationally renowned for its fossil evidence. This includes dinosaur remains which has lead to the coast being termed the 'Dinosaur Coast'.'. The challenge is covered within the first challenge of increasing understanding. A new policy has been added which states 'Awareness and understanding of the National Park's geological assets will be increased.' | 62 | 493 | Amend Plan |
| 2.5 Geodiversity | Natural England | It might be preferable to refer to 'dynamic coastal processes' rather than 'coastal erosion'. | Reference to coastal erosion has been deleted from the end of the sentence 'Natural processes include...' and a new sentence has been added which states 'Dynamic coastal processes actively contribute to natural changes in the coastline including rockfalls, landslips, silt deposition and undercliff slumping.' | 62 | 492 | Amend Plan |
| 2.5 Geodiversity | Natural England | There should be a policy to ensure that there is no further loss of geodiversity interest through new development, and one about raising awareness and understanding with the general public. | Two new policies have been added to state 'Geological assets will be protected and enhanced where appropriate' and 'Awareness and understanding of the National Park's geological assets will be increased'. | 62 | 494 | Amend Plan |
| 2.5 Geodiversity | North East Yorkshire Geology Trust | The North East Yorkshire Geology Trust should be listed as one of the partners or stakeholders in relation to geodiversity. | The North East Yorkshire Geology Trust have been referred to in the Means to Achieve new policy E27 on increasing awareness and understanding of the Park's geological assets. | 53 | 403 | No |
| 2.5 Geodiversity | Natural England | Would support in principle the recognition of the National Park as part of the European Geoparks network. Targets could refer to the UK Geodiversity Action Plan. | The UK Geodiversity Action Plan includes a target to recommend areas of international geodiversity importance including Global Geoparks, which is taken forward by the Management Plan. The monitoring measures in the Management Plan identify indicators and targets, whereas the targets in the UK Geodiversity Action Plan are actions. | 62 | 491 | No |
| 2.5 Geodiversity | North East Yorkshire Geology Trust | The policies and aims relating to achieving Geopark status could have all been achieved through the National Park Authority supporting the Geology Trust in the past. The Geology Trust has done a lot to promote and raise awareness of the geology of the Park including trail guides, events, working with landowners, 'geonaut' events in schools and a Student Volunteer Programme. Extra designation will not achieve increased levels of awareness but will be costly and will deprive other organisations of funding. An alternative would be the development of the Geology Trust as a Geoconservation Hub which would help the Geology Trust to greatly increase awareness. | It is intended to keep the policy relating to achieving Geopark status. The North East Yorkshire Geology Trust have been referred to in the Means to Achieve new policy E27 on increasing awareness and understanding of the Park's geological assets. | 53 | 394 | No |

| Part of Plan | Respondent | Summary of Comments | Authority Response | Respondent ID | Response ID | Action needed? |
|------------------|------------------------------------|--|--|---------------|-------------|----------------|
| 2.5 Geodiversity | Peter Woods | Whinstone mining was primarily for setts used in town centres and alley ways, but also for aggregate used on roads and ballast for 19th century railways. | The term roadstone in the Plan refers to the production of setts and aggregate, this will be expanded to state '...roadstone and ballast from the Whinstone dike...' | 28 | 147 | Amend |
| 2.5 Geodiversity | Welcome to Yorkshire | The benefits of becoming a Geopark should be investigated thoroughly, particularly as to whether this does benefit geological tourism. Geopark status may be something that a layman would not necessarily recognise. It will be important to understand how best to maximise the tourism potential of Geopark status, possibly looking at the North Pennines AONB. | It is intended to keep the policy relating to achieving Geopark status. | 49 | 301 | No |
| 2.5 Geodiversity | Peter Woods | Concerned that designation of the whole Park as a Geopark could compromise geo-education. As there is open access on the moorland it is important to enable visitors to learn about the structure of the landscape. There are many local active and retired geologists who could help. Starting with primary schools could help to address the world-wide shortage of geologists. Inspiring work has been done by the North East Yorkshire Geology Trust and their self-guided geo-trails. | Geopark designation is based around education and understanding of geology, and would therefore enhance understanding of the Park's geology across the Park. | 28 | 181 | No |
| 2.5 Geodiversity | Peter Woods | Potash is only mentioned at Boulby, whereas over the next 15 years there may be a new mine between Whitby and Scarborough, should this not be mentioned? | At the time of writing it is not certain whether or not a new mine will be developed in the Park. Reference to exploration of potash reserves between Whitby and Scarborough is included in 4.6. | 28 | 148 | No |
| 2.5 Geodiversity | North East Yorkshire Geology Trust | This is a limited view of geodiversity, it should be comprehensive and in exact detail. | It is not appropriate to include a lot more detail in the Management Plan, this represents a short overview of the topic. | 53 | 400 | No |
| 2.6 Air Quality | Farmoor Services LLP | The statement 'Moorland burning can have adverse impacts on air quality' should not be included given the costs, carbon emissions (tractor diesel) and damage to sites associated with attempting to cut the heather. | Moorland burning can have localised impacts on air quality. The sentence will be amended to state 'Whilst appropriate moorland burning regimes help to sustain the moorland, moorland burning, either controlled or through accidental fires, can have localised, temporary impacts upon air quality.' | 9 | 46 | Amend Plan |

| Part of Plan | Respondent | Summary of Comments | Authority Response | Respondent ID | Response ID | Action needed? |
|-----------------|----------------------------|---|---|---------------|-------------|----------------|
| 2.6 Air Quality | Hambleton District Council | Air quality may need spot-monitoring to assess whether it exceeds nitrous oxide levels at locations which have high levels of summer traffic such as Helmsley. | Air quality is not considered to be a problem in the Park, as indicated by DEFRA monitoring and the fact that there are no Air Quality Management Areas designated in the Park. A sentence has been added to state 'There are no Air Quality Management Areas designated in the National Park, reflecting the generally clean condition of the air.' DEFRA Air Quality monitoring is reported in the State of the Park report. It is not thought that any further monitoring of air quality is necessary. | 52 | 372 | Amend Plan |
| 2.7 Soils | RSPB | It is unrealistic to assume that one project that is short term will address all blanket bog issues. Long term sustainable management of this habitat needs to be carefully considered. | Agri-environment schemes have been included in the means to achieve. | 45 | 261 | Amend Plan |
| 2.7 Soils | Natural England | The challenges should also recognise the threat to the peat resource from poor management or wildfire events that lead to degraded vegetation or in some cases bare peat, which leaves the peat vulnerable to erosion. | The first challenge has been amended to state 'Ensuring that land management practices do not result in the loss of soils.' and an additional challenge has been added to state 'Loss of soils due to wildfires.' | 62 | 495 | Amend Plan |
| 2.7 Soils | RSPB | There is little mention of carbon storage, which is surely the main purpose of restoring blanket bog and needs to be considered in the long term. | Carbon storage is not the main purpose of restoring peatland, peat is also important for biodiversity, paleoecology and water storage / flood risk reduction. The 2nd paragraph refers to peat being important for carbon storage. | 45 | 262 | No |
| 2.7 Soils | Forestry Commission | Reference to loss of soils from forestry operations should be removed as the UK Forestry Standard requires measures to be taken to ensure that this does not happen. Compared with agriculture, soil loss from forestry is very minor. | The challenge has been reworded to state 'Ensuring that land management practices do not result in the loss of soils.' Reference to the UK Forestry Standards will be included in 4.3 Forestry and Woodland in the Means to Achieve the third policy to state 'Compliance with the UK Forestry Standard'. | 43 | 240 | Amend Plan |
| 2.7 Soils | RSPB | It is not clear what is meant by 'around 4,100 hectares of blanket bog...and a further 46,000 hectares of peaty soils.' Is the former active blanket bog and does the latter include areas of degraded blanket bog and wet and dry heath? | The blanket bog is defined as 'blanket bog peat soils' and the latter is 'very acid loamy upland soils with a wet peaty surface' and 'slowly permeable wet very acid upland soils with a peaty surface'. Data on the extent of degraded peat is not available. | 45 | 259 | No |

| Part of Plan | Respondent | Summary of Comments | Authority Response | Respondent ID | Response ID | Action needed? |
|--------------|-----------------------------|---|--|---------------|-------------|----------------|
| 2.7 Soils | Natural England | The area of the 3 peatland areas to be restored should be specified. | This target has been removed due to uncertainties over future funding for such works, although the Plan still provides support for such works should they be possible through policy E30 which states 'Blanket peat bog will be managed appropriately to ensure its retention' and identifies Yorkshire Peat Partnership as a key partner. | 62 | 497 | No |
| 2.7 Soils | Scarborough Borough Council | There should be further reference to managing the peat resources and prevention of drying out, in view of the role they play in carbon storage. | Reference is included in the text to the importance of peat in storing carbon, which is taken through into the policies regarding peat and soil management. | 66 | 559 | No |
| 2.7 Soils | RSPB | The section on challenges should also refer to burning (from sporting management) and loss of stored carbon. | This is covered under amendments to the challenges in order that the first challenge states 'Ensuring that land management practices do not result in the loss of soils' which would include sporting management. A new second challenge states 'Loss of soils due to wildfires.' | 45 | 260 | Amend Plan |
| 2.7 Soils | Natural England | Threats from wildfire should be addressed through public education and awareness, and visitor and access management. This should be more explicit from a soils perspective. | A new challenge has been added to state 'Loss of soils due to wildfires.'. Section 2.8 Moorland contains a policy aiming to prevent accidental fires, which will address impacts from fire on a range of assets including soils. | 62 | 496 | No |
| 2.8 Moorland | Natural England | Reference should be included to the extensive areas of moorland that are designated as Special Protection Areas and Special Areas of Conservation. | Reference has been added to the end of the first paragraph to state 'Most of the moorland is designated at international level as a Special Protection Area and a Special Area of Conservation, due to the importance of the wet and dry heath habitat and the bird populations.' | 62 | 498 | Amend Plan |
| 2.8 Moorland | RSPB | There should be a more precise definition of 'appropriate burning regimes'. | Burning regimes are controlled through Higher Level Stewardship and the Natural England consenting regime. It is considered to be too detailed to discuss the actual methods in the Management Plan. | 45 | 271 | No |
| 2.8 Moorland | RSPB | The introductory paragraph should mention the statutory protected sites which should be the main driver behind moorland management. Moorland management objectives should be closely linked with restoring and enhancing habitats and achieving favourable conservation status. | 'Alongside environmental management, ' has been added to the first paragraph. The biodiversity elements of the moorland are considered in 2.2 Habitats and Wildlife (now 2.3). | 45 | 263 | Amend Plan |

| Part of Plan | Respondent | Summary of Comments | Authority Response | Respondent ID | Response ID | Action needed? |
|--------------|--------------------------------------|---|--|---------------|-------------|----------------|
| 2.8 Moorland | Game and Wildlife Conservation Trust | It is Lyme not Lymes Disease. | This has been corrected. | 58 | 442 | Amend Plan |
| 2.8 Moorland | North Yorkshire County Council | Welcome the policy to improve the ability of moorland to store rainwater and reduce the risk of flooding. | Comment noted. | 40 | 213 | No |
| 2.8 Moorland | Great Ayton Parish Council | Add 'man made ponds' to the challenge relating to pressure for additional infrastructure. | The word 'ponds' has been added. | 57 | 427 | Amend Plan |
| 2.8 Moorland | RSPB | Additional challenges should be added in relation to achieving favourable conservation status for protected sites and their component habitats and species, and stopping illegal bird of prey persecution. | The condition of SSSIs is one of the monitoring mechanisms identified under 2.2 (now 2.3), it is not considered necessary to duplicate this here. A sentence is to be added to the end of the text in 2.2 (now 2.3) to state 'There have been cases of illegal persecution of protected species in the National Park. Such incidences will continue to be addressed by the relevant enforcement agencies with appropriate support from the National Park Authority.' | 45 | 269 | Amend Plan |
| 2.8 Moorland | Natural England | The monitoring should be more specific and give an indication of the areas to be brought into good conservation management, relating to the target in the England Biodiversity Strategy for 50% of moorland SSSI to be in favourable condition by 2020. | The target has been amended to read 'At least 90% of Sites of Special Scientific Interest are in favourable or recovering condition, and contribute towards the England Biodiversity Strategy target for 50% of SSSIs to be in favourable condition by 2020'. | 62 | 501 | Amend Plan |
| 2.8 Moorland | RSPB | Illegal persecution of birds of prey is a serious issue which needs to be addressed. | Reference to illegal bird of prey persecution has been added to the text to state 'There have been cases of illegal persecution of protected species in the National Park. Such incidences will continue to be addressed by the relevant enforcement agencies with appropriate support from the National Park Authority.', and a new challenge has been included which states 'Addressing wildlife crime'. | 45 | 266 | Amend Plan |

| Part of Plan | Respondent | Summary of Comments | Authority Response | Respondent ID | Response ID | Action needed? |
|---------------------------|--------------------------------------|--|---|---------------|-------------|----------------|
| 2.8 Moorland ² | Natural England | Support the statement that 'too frequent or poorly managed burning is damaging the conservation value of the moorland.' However, a distinction should be made between dry heath and blanket bog which require different approaches to prevent peat drying out. It should also acknowledge that in some instances appropriate management will include 'no burn' areas and / or longer burning rotations to retain refuges for lichens, mosses and some invertebrates. There is also a need to address the restoration of degraded areas and address soil erosion, water quality and water storage. These issues should be included in the challenges. | A sentence has been added to the end of the third paragraph to state that 'In some places it is appropriate to establish 'no burn' areas or longer burning rotations'. Soil erosion and restoring degraded areas is addressed in 2.7 Soils. The DEFRA Heather and Grass Burning Code has been referred to in the Means to Achieve policy E34. An additional challenge has been added to state 'Ensuring that controlled burning is carried out in an appropriate way and does not affect watercourses, and avoiding wildfires.' | 62 | 499 | Amend Plan |
| 2.8 Moorland ² | Natural England | It is not clear what the issues are in relation to the challenge of retaining sheep on the Moors. The policy could be developed further to relate to appropriate management including burning but also sustainable grazing, with a separate policy addressing the issue of wildfires. | A paragraph has been added after paragraph 3 to state 'Sheep numbers on the moors were, until recently, in decline due to the harsh environment for grazing sheep resulting in low levels of productivity. More recent environmental schemes and initiatives have halted this decline by rewarding the environmental role of sheep grazing as a way of managing the moors.' A policy will be included to state 'Grazing levels on the moors will be maintained at levels required to maintain the habitat and cultural heritage of the area' with agri-environment schemes as the means to achieve. | 62 | 500 | Amend Plan |
| 2.8 Moorland | Scarborough Borough Council | Supports the aspiration to improve the ability of land to store rainwater. | Comment noted. ² | 66 | 560 | No |
| 2.8 Moorland | Hambleton District Council | Strongly agree with improving land management to slow and store water. | Noted. ² | 52 | 355 | No |
| 2.8 Moorland | RSPB | In the monitoring section there should be reference to habitat condition and population status for key species. | Key species are monitored in the habitats and wildlife section. The Local Biodiversity Action Plan will consider specific habitats in more detail. | 45 | 272 | No |
| 2.8 Moorland | Game and Wildlife Conservation Trust | The paragraph on accidental fires on unmanaged moors does not acknowledge that rotational burning can reduce the risk and that poorly managed moors are equally at risk, although the section does recognise the value of properly managed burning rotation to conservation. | The second sentence has been amended to state '...of the moorland, and rotational burning can reduce the risk of wildfire.' | 58 | 447 | Amend Plan |

| Part of Plan | Respondent | Summary of Comments | Authority Response | Respondent ID | Response ID | Action needed? |
|--------------|----------------------------|--|--|---------------|-------------|----------------|
| 2.8 Moorland | Hambleton District Council | Natural land management practises such as livestock grazing should be used to maintain the moorland. | This is part of the reason behind supporting more sheep on the moors. | 52 | 359 | No |
| 2.8 Moorland | RSPB | There should be a policy in place to address the issues of infrastructure associated with grouse shooting. | Policy B17 in 4.4 Moorland Shooting which contains reference to the Authority's Planning Advice Note on Agricultural, Forestry and Recreational Tracks. | 45 | 270 | No |
| 2.8 Moorland | Susan Willmington | Would like to see ponies, more sheep and many bee hives on the moor. Bracken, gorse and scrub trees need controlling. There should be more wild flowers native to the moors. | The text recognises the problem of controlling bracken, a general policy in moorland management will be included to state 'The moorland will be managed in a way which maintains the open landscape, supports biodiversity and protects the cultural heritage.'. 4.2 Agriculture considers that 6,000 more sheep could be accommodated on the moorland. Locating ponies and bee hives on the moor would largely depend upon the willingness of bee / pony keepers and moorland landowners. 84% of the moorland is now in Higher Level Stewardship. | 11 | 49 | Amend Plan |
| 2.8 Moorland | RSPB | As well as storing more water on the moors, grazing reductions, bare peat restoration and reduction of heather cover may also be appropriate for peat bog restoration. | The moors are currently undergrazed in places, unlike some other upland areas, so a measure to reduce this further would not be appropriate. Work is already underway to enable more water to be stored on the moors through grip and gully blocking. | 45 | 267 | No |
| 2.8 Moorland | Peter Woods | Bracken continues to be a major problem on the moors. Spraying with Asulox has had limited success and in places has drifted onto adjacent farms and woodlands. As it affects all ferns there is the potential to lose some very rare species. It can also affect water supplies and aqueous habitats so its use should be banned in this National Park. | At the time of writing Asulox is no longer licensed. The inclusion of a new specific policy on moorland management will provide the strategic basis for bracken control. This will state 'The moorland will be managed in a way which maintains the open landscape, supports biodiversity and protects the cultural heritage.' | 28 | 157 | Amend Plan |
| 2.8 Moorland | RSPB | The extent and frequency of managed burning should be assessed and monitored to ensure it is compatible with conservation of the habitat and wildlife. Long term controlled burning is inappropriate as it will damage the wet heath vegetation. Grazing levels should avoid damage to conservation interests. | Burning regimes are controlled through Higher Level Stewardship and the Natural England consenting regime. It is considered to be too detailed to discuss the actual methods in the Management Plan. | 45 | 265 | No |

| Part of Plan | Respondent | Summary of Comments | Authority Response | Respondent ID | Response ID | Action needed? |
|--------------|----------------------------------|--|---|---------------|-------------|----------------|
| 2.8 Moorland | Farmoor Services LLP | Concerned by reference to inappropriate burning of the moorland. Natural England have stopped appropriate rotational burning in favour of a more high risk burning regime with abandonment of traditional burning practices on large sections of moorland - trees and scrub are now starting to encroach. Should elaborate what is meant by 'There is clear evidence that too frequent or poorly managed burning is damaging the conservation value of the moorland.' If this is referring to defective Condition Assessments carried out by Natural England their generic wording should (not?) be used to justify further restrictions on burning. Reference to inappropriate burning will help those who wish to see burning stopped. | Natural England supports appropriate rotational burning. The Plan does not refer to any generic Natural England condition assessments, but is a reflection of the fact that in some places this is a problem. | 9 | 35 | No |
| 2.8 Moorland | Comments at Sutton Bank 11/12/11 | The Plan should support flood alleviation measures. | The policy aims to improve the ability of the moorland to store rainwater and alleviate flooding incidents downstream. | 25 | 125 | No |
| 2.8 Moorland | Hambleton District Council | There should be research into potential uses for moorland products such as heather scrub for biomass fuel, thatch, artwork), wool for insulation. Promote a market for the products of sustainably raised and humanely killed game and wild rabbit, such as fur and feathers. | This is covered though policies supporting farm diversification and local businesses. Policy B24 in 4.6 has been amended to state 'Opportunities for the production and sale of good quality local food and products will be increased'. | 52 | 360 | Amend Plan |
| 2.8 Moorland | Peter Woods | Drainage grips lead to water running off the moors and contributing to flooding. No attempt has been made to burn the heather in a way that would slow down the initial water run-off. Retaining water on the moorland would make fires much easier to control. Grips should be blocked but the loss of material is the main difficulty. A solution could be to bury crushed, recycled glass, which is an inert material, in the ditches. | The Plan identifies the recent and ongoing work to address this issue, through the use of woody debris dams and blocking of grips. It is proposed that this work will continue and a range of options will be considered for each location. Reference to the DEFRA and Natural England Heather and Grass Burning Code. An additional challenge will be added to state 'Ensuring that controlled burning is carried out in an appropriate way and does not affect watercourses, and avoiding wildfires.' | 28 | 156 | Amend Plan |
| 2.8 Moorland | Peter Woods | Moorland is described as natural, whereas most of it is a monoculture of heather with a limited range of habitats. True landscape history up to the present day should be emphasised as part of promoting 'understanding' of the Park. It is man-made and not being helped back to its truly natural biodiversity. | The Plan recognises that the moorland is a man-made landscape, but this landscape is identified as one of the special qualities and was one of the reasons behind the designation of the National Park. Promoting understanding of the Park includes landscape history through a variety of means. | 28 | 146 | No |

| Part of Plan | Respondent | Summary of Comments | Authority Response | Respondent ID | Response ID | Action needed? |
|-------------------------|--------------------------------------|--|---|---------------|-------------|----------------|
| 2.8 Moorland | RSPB | This section is too heavily weighted towards the interests of land managers and does not take proper account of the conservation status and needs of the moors. | Other elements of the environment are covered elsewhere. 'Alongside environmental management,' has been added to the first paragraph. A new general policy on moorland management has been added to state 'The moorland will be managed in a way which maintains the open landscape, supports biodiversity and protects the cultural heritage.' The biodiversity elements of moorland are considered in 2.2 Habitats and Wildlife (now 2.3). | 45 | 268 | Amend Plan |
| 2.8 Moorland | RSPB | A proper assessment of the extent of different moorland habitats is needed, including area of active blanket bog, degraded blanket bog, wet and dry dwarf shrub heath, area of SSSIs etc. | Some of this data is not currently available. If this was to be undertaken for the moorland it would also need to be done for the other habitats of the Park, essentially covering the whole Park which would be too detailed for the Management Plan. Data on the extent of active and degraded blanket bog is not available. | 45 | 264 | No |
| 2.8 Moorland | Game and Wildlife Conservation Trust | The general tones of references to grouse moor management are quite negative. | 4.4 Moorland Management explains the benefits that grouse shooting provides for the environment. | 58 | 444 | No |
| 2.9 Trees and Woodlands | Robert Sword | The heart of the Park is not naturally wooded and the character of many of the steep banks falling away from the plateaux would be lost by planting trees on them, although 500 hectares is not a large area. | It is considered that much of the tree planting could take place on bracken covered slopes and the Plan states that further work is required to ascertain precisely where tree planting may be feasible. A table is to be included in 1.9 which will identify where various activities (farming, tree planting, habitat expansion) should and should not take place, and what the potential positive and negative (to be mitigated) impacts would be. | 18 | 77 | Amend plan |
| 2.9 Trees and Woodlands | Farmoor Services LLP | The Plan should aim to restore those moorland areas planted by blocks of conifers. | In line with Government policy, converting forest to open habitat will usually only take place where it is a high priority for biodiversity reasons, unless compensatory tree planting takes place elsewhere to provide equivalent or greater carbon benefits. However the policies would not preclude this from happening. | 9 | 37 | No |
| 2.9 Trees and Woodlands | Forestry Commission | The challenge 'Loss of value of PAWS as time passes' could be misleading as gradual restoration is acknowledged as being more ecologically beneficial than high forest clear fell systems. A more appropriate statement could be 'Loss of value of PAWS through inactive management as time passes.' | The challenge has been reworded to state 'Loss of value of PAWS if steps are not taken to enhance or restore sites through appropriate and timely management.' | 43 | 242 | Amend Plan |

| Part of Plan | Respondent | Summary of Comments | Authority Response | Respondent ID | Response ID | Action needed? |
|-------------------------|---------------------------------|--|---|---------------|-------------|----------------|
| 2.9 Trees and Woodlands | Forestry Commission | 'PAWS sites' is grammatically incorrect. | References have been amended to 'PAWS' | 43 | 243 | Amend Plan |
| 2.9 Trees and Woodlands | Comments from Parish Forums | Can additional areas of woodland be accommodated without using up productive farmland? | It is considered that much of the tree planting could take place on bracken covered slopes and the Plan states that further work is required to ascertain precisely where tree planting may be feasible. A table has been included in 1.9 which identifies where various activities (farming, tree planting, habitat expansion) should and should not take place, and what the potential positive and negative (to be mitigated) impacts would be. | 56 | 411 | Amend Plan |
| 2.9 Trees and Woodlands | Miss T Solesby | Care needs to be taken to ensure that new woodland does not blot out wide moorland views. | It is considered that much of the tree planting could take place on bracken covered slopes and the Plan states that further work is required to ascertain precisely where tree planting may be feasible. A table has been included in 1.9 which will identify where various activities (farming, tree planting, habitat expansion) should and should not take place, and what the potential positive and negative (to be mitigated) impacts would be. | 55 | 406 | Amend Plan |
| 2.9 Trees and Woodlands | Natural England | The target of 500 hectares by 2017 is welcome, but there should be some clarification of the types of woodlands proposed. | It is considered too detailed for the Management Plan, this will be determined through further work to take this forward. | 62 | 503 | No |
| 2.9 Trees and Woodlands | Comments at Sutton Bank 4/12/11 | There should be woodland planting where appropriate. | There is a target in this section to increase the area of woodland in the National Park. | 16 | 72 | No |
| 2.9 Trees and Woodlands | Hambleton District Council | A wider variety of trees should be grown, focussing on native species and increasing the proportion of edible fruit and nuts available and those predicted to be better adapted to a changing climate. | The policy refers to creating more resilient woodlands, but it is not appropriate to refer to specific species or types of trees in the Management Plan. | 52 | 364 | No |
| 2.9 Trees and Woodlands | Great Ayton Parish Council | There are too many references to %, change to read 'almost a quarter...' | Precise figures have been included based upon the research that has been undertaken as part of producing the Management Plan. | 57 | 428 | No |

| Part of Plan | Respondent | Summary of Comments | Authority Response | Respondent ID | Response ID | Action needed? |
|-------------------------|--|---|--|---------------|-------------|----------------|
| 2.9 Trees and Woodlands | Redcar and Cleveland Strategic Partnership | Supports the extension of native woodland cover as this covers so much added value across many themes and priorities going forward. | Support noted. | 6 | 22 | No |
| 2.9 Trees and Woodlands | Martin Muir | Tree planting should be on land of poor productivity. It can improve the landscape with sensitive positioning. 500 hectares is a lot of land which may require taking land out of food production, world food supply is a sensitive issue. | The Plan states that tree planting could be accommodated on land of low productivity (based on the Askham Bryan report). A table is to be included in 1.9 which will identify where various activities (farming, tree planting, habitat expansion) should and should not take place, and what the potential positive and negative (to be mitigated) impacts would be. | 17 | 74 | Amend Plan |
| 2.9 Trees and Woodlands | Redcar and Cleveland Borough Council | Support the proposals to restore PAWS. | Support noted. | 35 | 179 | No |
| 2.9 Trees and Woodlands | Peter Woods | Creating new woodland in empty spaces, such as National Parks, will help to address climate change and carbon capture would be multiplied many-fold. The Plan makes a laudable and brave attempt to introduce this and should seek Government support to bring this into reality. | The Plan aims to encourage tree planting in places where this will not conflict with other important interests. DEFRA have been consulted on the draft Plan. | 28 | 152 | No |
| 2.9 Trees and Woodlands | Forestry Commission | The third challenge should be removed as the UK Forestry Standard requires measures to be taken to ensure that this doesn't happen. | The challenge has been reworded to state 'Ensuring that all forestry operations do not damage the conservation value of woods and trees and adhere to the minimum standards set out in the UK Forestry Standard.' | 43 | 439 | Amend Plan |
| 2.9 Trees and Woodlands | Hartoft Parish Council | It is better to leave the carbon in the trees than to use them for woodfuel. Burning wood releases micro-particulates which can cause lung problems. | The trees can be replaced thus making them more sustainable than use of traditional fossil fuels which cannot be. There are not known to be such problems with the use of wood fuel systems. | 51 | 325 | No |
| 2.9 Trees and Woodlands | RSPB | It is important that woodland does not encroach on carbon and biodiversity rich peat soils. In relation to further work that is needed to avoid conflicts with other environmental interests an objective is needed in the policies and monitoring sections. | It is considered that some of the tree planting could take place on bracken covered slopes and the Plan states that further work is required to ascertain precisely where tree planting may be feasible. A table has been included in 1.9 which identifies where various activities (farming, tree planting, habitat expansion) should and should not take place, and what the potential positive and negative (to be mitigated) impacts would be. | 45 | 273 | Amend Plan |

| Part of Plan | Respondent | Summary of Comments | Authority Response | Respondent ID | Response ID | Action needed? |
|-------------------------|----------------------------|--|---|---------------|-------------|----------------|
| 2.9 Trees and Woodlands | Natural England | Important populations of ancient and veteran trees and their contribution to the landscape and biodiversity should be mentioned. | A new paragraph has been added to state 'The Park has nationally important populations of veteran trees and has some of the best sites in northern England for old trees and their associated wildlife. Areas such as Bilsdale and Farndale still support quite extensive areas of old wood pasture, and smaller numbers of ancient trees are present in various places throughout the National Park. The trees are often centuries old and it may be necessary to manage them or to maintain a favourable environment around them to help them survive in the long term. Establishing a new generation of young trees in notable veteran tree areas can be important and there are significant opportunities to plant trees to improve habitat connectivity and to enhance landscape.' | 62 | 505 | Amend Plan |
| 2.9 Trees and Woodlands | Natural England | Could a figure for the current 'area of woodland managed in line with conservation objectives' and anticipated area at the end of the Plan period be included. | The Authority does not readily have data relating specifically to woodlands, but the indicator has been included as an intention to monitor this in the future. | 62 | 504 | Amend Plan |
| 2.9 Trees and Woodlands | Natural England | Support increasing the area of woodland by 3,000 hectares, and the acknowledgement that further work needs to be done to identify where these woodlands can best be located. Any possible conflicts with other environmental interests and ecosystem services should be identified. For example, there are potential conflicts with the SPA and SACs and the target for SSSIs to be in favourable condition. | A table has been included in 1.9 which identifies where various activities (farming, tree planting, habitat expansion) should and should not take place, and what the potential positive and negative (to be mitigated) impacts would be. | 62 | 502 | Amend Plan |
| 2.9 Trees and Woodlands | Great Ayton Parish Council | The Peterken Report requires a footnote to reference what it is. | A footnote is already included, but text has been added to the end of the paragraph to state '...report, commonly known as the Peterken Report.' | 57 | 429 | Amend Plan |
| 2.9 Trees and Woodlands | Whorlton Parish Council | It is unclear what mechanisms are available for implementing the ambitious target of a 3,000 hectare increase in tree coverage, especially when some forests currently being felled are not planned to be replanted. Is a 'native species only' policy appropriate when some non-native species have better performance in stated objectives such as biomass production, carbon absorption and structural timber production. | The target for tree planting is 500 hectares by 2017. Tree planting would generally take place on private land, supported by a range of incentives provided by the Forestry Commission, National Park Authority and others, as identified in the Means to Achieve. The Plan does not exclude the planting of non-native species but aims to restore networks. Native species would be favoured on PAWS. The selection of which trees to plant will need to primarily contribute towards furthering the first National Park purpose. | 33 | 165 | No |

| Part of Plan | Respondent | Summary of Comments | Authority Response | Respondent ID | Response ID | Action needed? |
|-------------------------|-----------------------------------|--|--|---------------|-------------|----------------|
| 2.9 Trees and Woodlands | Peter Woods | Any tree planting would need to be protected from sheep. Planting trees on the moorland would involve far more jobs than grouse shooting does. | New trees will be protected if necessary. | 28 | 154 | No |
| 2.10 Rivers and Streams | Natural England | Welcome reference to 'Slowing the Flow', but some of its achievements could be mentioned in the text. | This has been included in 2.8 Moorland, but as there is a policy on storing rainwater it is logical to include some reference in the text. A sentence has been added to the end of the final paragraph to state 'Measures such as blocking moorland drains are being put in place to increase the ability of the moorland to store water and release it slowly.' | 62 | 506 | Amend Plan |
| 2.10 Rivers and Streams | Great Ayton Parish Council | Include reference to pollution from old mines, such as at Staithes Beck. | This is too detailed for the Management Plan. | 57 | 430 | No |
| 2.10 Rivers and Streams | Comments at Moors Centre 27/11/11 | More should be done to reduce flooding. Elsewhere in the country works are being carried out in rivers to 'step' the river to reduce the flow. | A policy in 2.10 Rivers and Streams aims to improve the Park's ability to store rainwater, which will most likely include the consideration of a range of options. It is considered appropriate to keep the Plan as it is as this will allow consideration of a range of measures. | 15 | 63 | No |
| 2.10 Rivers and Streams | Natural England | The policies are supported but there could be reference to win-win scenarios where landscape and biodiversity benefits are also achieved. | Text has been added to the first sentence of 'In 15 Years Time...' to read '...been possible, which has also led to improvements in the landscape and for biodiversity more generally.' | 62 | 508 | Amend Plan |

| Part of Plan | Respondent | Summary of Comments | Authority Response | Respondent ID | Response ID | Action needed? |
|-------------------------|----------------------------|---|---|---------------|-------------|----------------|
| 2.10 Rivers and Streams | Thirlby Parish Meeting | More emphasis should be given to flood management. There should be an indicator relating to flooding. | A sentence has been added to the start of the final paragraph to state 'Rivers that flow through the Park can be prone to flooding during times of heavy rainfall and some communities in and around the Park have suffered from the impacts of flooding. Notable recent incidents include flooding in Hawnby, Rievaulx and Helmsley in 2005 and floods have also been recorded at settlements along the Esk Valley. There have also been many floods in settlements just outside of the National Park including at Pickering, Great Ayton and Skinningrove. As well as damage to property and risk to people, flooding incidents in the Park have also damaged roads, rights of way and farmland.'. Whilst the National Park Authority, the Environment Agency and others can carry out works to help to reduce flooding, it is largely dependent upon the amount of rainfall and the topography, which cannot be controlled, and therefore an indicator may not be appropriate. | 48 | 550 | Amend Plan |
| 2.10 Rivers and Streams | Great Ayton Parish Council | Include hydro power in the challenges as a possible barrier to fish migration. | It is not considered to be a specific challenge as there are ways of ensuring that fish migration can still take place, and in some instances the situation can be improved. A paragraph has been included before the final paragraph to state 'The aim for increasing renewable energy may lead to pressure for more hydroelectric schemes along the National Park's rivers. Such installations can include measures to ensure that fish migration can still take place, and in some instances measures can be put in place to improve on the current situation.' | 57 | 431 | Amend Plan |
| 2.10 Rivers and Streams | Hartoft Parish Council | If the moorland is used to store water there will be little additional capacity to store more during prolonged heavy rain. | The intention is that it is during these times that more can be stored. The water is released slowly, not stored indefinitely. | 51 | 327 | No |
| 2.10 Rivers and Streams | English Heritage | Will removing barriers to fish migration involve removing historic weirs? | The Environment Agency are looking into exactly which barriers might need to be removed, some of these are outside the Park. Removal of any that are Listed would require Listed Building consent. | 37 | 196 | No |
| 2.10 Rivers and Streams | Natural England | There should be an additional bullet point in the challenges relating to the need to take measures in the uplands to reduce flood risk downstream, especially in the context of climate change. | An additional challenge has been added to state 'Reducing the risk of flooding both within and outside the National Park.' | 62 | 507 | Amend Plan |

| Part of Plan | Respondent | Summary of Comments | Authority Response | Respondent ID | Response ID | Action needed? |
|-------------------------------------|------------------------|---|--|---------------|-------------|----------------|
| 2.10 Rivers and Streams | Hartoft Parish Council | Lining water courses with coarse crushed limestone would help to raise the pH. | The Plan does not go into detail about exactly what measure could be put in place. The Environment Agency will investigate a range of options. | 51 | 326 | No |
| 2.11 Coastal and Marine Environment | Natural England | It would be helpful to clarify the influence and statutory responsibilities of the National Park Authority and other public bodies in relation to the coast and the marine area. | A sentence has been added to the paragraph regarding the Marine and Coastal Access Act to state 'The Marine Management Organisation is responsible for planning and licensing in the marine area.' | 62 | 510 | Amend Plan |
| 2.11 Coastal and Marine Environment | Natural England | Dynamic coastal processes should be addressed more explicitly and reference should be made to the Whitby Coast Strategy which has implications for the National Park. There should be a policy to enable the continuation of dynamic coastal processes. | A policy has been included based upon the approach of Shoreline Management Plan 2. Whilst Shoreline Management Plan 2 allows for the continuation of dynamic coastal processes along much of the undeveloped coastline, it does aim to continue to protect some communities. The policy states 'Natural processes will be allowed to continue along much of the coastline, with coastal and flood risk management measures being maintained or implemented where necessary.' It is not clear what the implications of the Whitby Coast Strategy are for the Park. The Whitby Coast Strategy relates to land outside of the National Park and whilst there may be some indirect implications for the National Park it is not considered that these would be significant enough to warrant mentioning the Strategy in the Management Plan. | 62 | 511 | Amend Plan |
| 2.11 Coastal and Marine Environment | Environment Agency | Is Sandsend Bathing Water beach located outside of the National Park? | Yes. Reply sent. | 60 | 459 | No |

| Part of Plan | Respondent | Summary of Comments | Authority Response | Respondent ID | Response ID | Action needed? |
|-------------------------------------|--------------------------------|--|---|---------------|-------------|----------------|
| 2.11 Coastal and Marine Environment | The Runswick Bay Association | What is the significance and implications of the proposed Marine Conservation Zone to the people of Runswick Bay, who proposed it and why? What is the role of the North Yorkshire and Cleveland Coastal Forum, its make up and the means by which a body might seek representation? | Sent email 30.11.11 to answer questions. Marine Conservation Zones, introduced by the Marine and Coastal Access Act 2009, will protect nationally important marine wildlife, habitats, geology and geomorphology. Natural England and the Joint Nature Conservancy Council are identifying and proposing sites to the Government. A number of features at Runswick Bay are proposed for designation including some rock, sand and sediment habitats, and the Ocean quahog (a type of subtidal mollusc). Any future development or activities in the marine area should avoid harm to these designated features. The North Yorkshire and Cleveland Coastal Forum was formed in 2002 to co-ordinate the interests of a range of organisations with a coastal remit, including the National Park Authority, local Councils, Natural England, English Heritage, Environment Agency, interest and environmental groups and local businesses. Coastal Projects Officer, John Beech, will be able to assist with regards to becoming involved (details given). | 13 | 58 | No |
| 2.11 Coastal and Marine Environment | Natural England | Further indicators should be identified. In particular seascape is overlooked. | In the absence of any current assessment of seascape, it would not be possible to commit to monitoring its condition. It is not possible to monitor the implementation of everything in the Plan, much of which will be monitored through other more detailed plans and strategies referred to in the Means to Achieve. | 62 | 512 | No |
| 2.11 Coastal and Marine Environment | Welcome to Yorkshire | It may be worth the National Park Authority being involved in the Yorkshire Bathing Water Partnership. | The Yorkshire Bathing Water Partnership will be added in the Means to Achieve for policy E46. | 49 | 302 | Amend Plan |
| 2.11 Coastal and Marine Environment | Marine Management Organisation | The EU Marine Strategy Framework Directive puts in place measures to achieve Good Environmental Status of UK seas as of 2012, Good Environmental Status descriptor 10 states 'Properties and quantities of marine litter do not cause harm to the coastal and marine environment'. In relation to the Marine Plans as a means to achieve, future Marine Plans will be in accordance with, and enhance where possible, measures set out in the Management Plan and the Local Development Framework. | At the end of the paragraph 'The 2009...' a sentence has been added to state 'The Marine Strategy Framework Directive aims to achieve Good Environmental Status of Europe's seas by 2020.'. At the end of the paragraph 'A significant problem for many...' a sentence has been added to state 'One of the requirements of the Marine Strategy Framework Directive is to ensure that litter does not cause harm to the coastal and marine environment.' | 50 | 317 | Amend Plan |

| Part of Plan | Respondent | Summary of Comments | Authority Response | Respondent ID | Response ID | Action needed? |
|---|--|---|---|---------------|-------------|----------------|
| 2.11 Coastal and Marine Environment | Natural England | Reference should also be made to the River Tyne to Flamborough Head Shoreline Management Plan 2 in the text and the Means to Achieve, and should specifically support this Plan. | A sentence has been added to the end of the final paragraph to state 'The River Tyne to Flamborough Head Shoreline Management Plan 2 sets out the policies in relation to coastal management.' A new policy has been added to state 'Natural processes will be allowed to continue along much of the coastline, with coastal and flood risk management measures being maintained or implemented where necessary', with the Shoreline Management Plan as the Means to Achieve. | 62 | 509 | Amend Plan |
| Chapter 3 - Understanding and Enjoyment | Redcar and Cleveland Strategic Partnership | All the required elements appear to be in place, comprehensive and far reaching. | Comment noted. | 6 | 23 | No |
| Chapter 3 - Understanding and Enjoyment | North East Yorkshire Geology Trust | The Geology Trust is helping to deliver all aspects of this chapter. | Not all organisations have been referred to. A sentence will be added to the end of the first paragraph of 1.9 to state 'There may be other projects or organisations which will also help to deliver the policies which have not been specifically identified at the time of writing.' | 53 | 401 | Amend Plan |
| Chapter 3 - Understanding and Enjoyment | B E Vyner | Cannot see how the enjoyment and understanding policies will be achieved when Moorsbus is to be abolished. The Plan should refer to the austerity measures and point to some positive ways forward. | Policy 5.3 Transport (now 5.5) contains a policy on small scale transport initiatives which will link the main villages, surrounding towns and tourism attractions. Such transport schemes are intended to provide a more focussed service for people to access the Park. The policies in the Understanding and Enjoyment chapter are not dependent on Moorsbus as the majority of people do not travel into the Park in this way. The Plan is for the Park not the Authority and many of the policies will not just be taken forward by the National Park Authority but by other organisations, private businesses and communities. Section 1.8 identifies the contraction of resources (not just for the National Park Authority but for other organisations) as one of the main challenges for the Management Plan. The National Park Authority's spending on transport will be more targeted, and will help specific groups who wish to visit the Park. | 26 | 135 | No |
| Chapter 3 - Understanding and Enjoyment | Norma Taylor | Access, tourism and education are extremely important for the local community, residents and visitors. There is likely to be an increased emphasis on healthy lifestyles. | This chapter promotes these, and policy U7 aims to improve public health and wellbeing through re-connecting with nature. | 65 | 543 | No |

| Part of Plan | Respondent | Summary of Comments | Authority Response | Respondent ID | Response ID | Action needed? |
|---|------------------------|--|--|---------------|-------------|----------------|
| Chapter 3 - Understanding and Enjoyment | Sport England | It is hoped that the North York Moors National Park Authority will adopt the 'Adventure Capital' approach being used in the Lake District National Park. | The Management Plan contains information on the facilities already available in the Park. Work is to be undertaken on the 'branding' of the Park. | 46 | 288 | No |
| 3.1 A Sustainable Growth in Visitors for the... | Peter Hay | Including the North York Moors on the Met Office forecasts might help to attract more visitors as the weather is generally better in the Moors than it is in the Dales. | This is too detailed for the Management Plan but could be considered as part of the production of the Promoting the Park Plan. | 54 | 404 | No |
| 3.1 A Sustainable Growth in Visitors for the... | Buglife | More tourists will increase the demand for water. | The National Park Authority intends to set up a Green Business Scheme whereby advice and support would be provided to tourism business, including on measures to save water. A challenge will be added to 4.1 Tourism to state 'Reducing the environmental impact of tourism businesses.', with a policy to state 'Tourism businesses will reduce their impact on the environment and use resources efficiently' with the Means to Achieve being Green Tourism Business Scheme and/or other schemes. | 2 | 5 | Amend Plan |
| 3.1 A Sustainable Growth in Visitors for the... | Natural England | The evidence for the Park being able to accommodate 1.6 million additional visitors days within the principles of 'wise growth' is not clear. The Plan should fully adopt the precautionary principle in respect of visitor numbers, particularly in relation to transport. There should be recognition of the way in which any negative impacts of visitor growth should be managed. Increases in visitor numbers must be accommodated within environmental limits. | It is considered that previous higher levels of visitor days were accommodated satisfactorily in the Park, and the increase in number from 2007 levels is actually about a million more rather than 1.6 million. Knowledge of the current situation would suggest that around an 11% increase in the number of people undertaking certain activities could be accommodated depending upon how they arrive, where they go and what they do. An additional challenge has been included in 3.2 Recreation and Access (now Enjoying the Park) to state '• Ensuring that recreational activities in the Park do not result in harm to the natural and historic environment and tranquillity and do not disturb communities and vulnerable or protected wildlife.' | 62 | 513 | Amend Plan |
| 3.1 A Sustainable Growth in Visitors for the... | Nigel and Carol Wilson | There is an omission in relation to museums, in particular Ryedale Folk Museum, which is a valuable resource for education and entertainment. The museum meets the requirements of many parts of the Plan including increasing visitor numbers. | Reference to visiting museums and visitor centres will be added to the list of activities in the first paragraph in 3.2 Recreation and Access (now Enjoying the Park). | 24 | 122 | Amend Plan |

| Part of Plan | Respondent | Summary of Comments | Authority Response | Respondent ID | Response ID | Action needed? |
|---|------------------------------------|---|---|---------------|-------------|----------------|
| 3.1 A Sustainable Growth in Visitors for the... | PLB | After the first paragraph add reference to the increased number of day visits and tourist days in the wider region. | Reference has been added at the end of the first paragraph in 3.1 to state 'In contrast, the number of visits made to the Yorkshire and Humber Region have increased by around 6% since 2006.' (A footnote has been added to explain that this relates to holidays and visiting friends and relatives only, and the source is Great Britain Travel Survey and Welcome to Yorkshire). | 59 | 449 | Amend Plan |
| 3.1 A Sustainable Growth in Visitors for the... | Primary Land Users' Group 18/10/11 | There is a perception that there are more people in the Park. | Some places within the Park may have been experiencing an increase in visitors but the Park as a whole has seen a decrease. | 21 | 101 | No |
| 3.1 A Sustainable Growth in Visitors for the... | Welcome to Yorkshire | Fully support the Authority to encourage more people to visit the area, whilst recognising this should be appropriate to the National Park. | Support noted. | 49 | 303 | No |
| 3.1 A Sustainable Growth in Visitors for the... | Local Access Forum 6/12/11 | The phrase 'without detrimental effect' needs qualifying as there will always be some effect, could say 'without undue detrimental effect'. | It is considered that current levels of visitors are not having a detrimental effect (apart from in a few specific circumstances) and that the increase suggested would also not have a detrimental effect, provided that, as stated in 3.1, they arrive at the right times, in the right places and in the right way to minimise any impact. A detrimental effect is considered to be one that would harm the National Park's special qualities. | 20 | 91 | No |
| 3.1 A Sustainable Growth in Visitors for the... | Primary Land Users' Group 18/10/11 | The way that visitors spend their time and money has changed. | The Promoting the Park Strategy (to be prepared) will reflect present trends. | 21 | 103 | No |
| 3.1 A Sustainable Growth in Visitors for the... | Local Access Forum 6/12/11 | Important to address the decline in visitors, visitor figures for the region have been holding up well. An increase in visitors should be encouraged and supported. | Policies in 3.3 and 4.1 aim to increase the number of visitors to the Park. | 20 | 87 | No |
| 3.1 A Sustainable Growth in Visitors for the... | North East Yorkshire Geology Trust | To help to increase visitor numbers in the off-peak seasons the NPA should publicise a wider range of events, including those of the Geology Trust. | This is too detailed for the Management Plan. The North East Yorkshire Geology Trust have been referred to in the Means to Achieve new policy E27 on increasing awareness and understanding of the Park's geological assets. | 53 | 396 | No |

| Part of Plan | Respondent | Summary of Comments | Authority Response | Respondent ID | Response ID | Action needed? |
|---|--|---|---|---------------|-------------|----------------|
| 3.1 A Sustainable Growth in Visitors for the... | Redcar and Cleveland Strategic Partnership | Balance between sustaining visitor growth and protecting the fabric of the National Park will need to be balanced and managed well. It is important to sustain growth in terms of visitors for the obvious long term benefits of the National Park. Redcar & Cleveland BC Countryside Strategy highlights Awareness and Understanding as one of five key priorities for all the same reasons. | This section is based around achieving the principles of 'wise growth'. The Promoting the Park strategy will take forward the Plan's aim of increasing the number of visitors to the Park. | 6 | 24 | No |
| 3.1 A Sustainable Growth in Visitors for the... | Hartoft Parish Council | It is unclear what is meant by sustainable. It will require an increase in infrastructure, 'wear' to the landscape, pollution and loss of tranquillity. Hartoft Parish has experienced this over the past 15 years. Increasing the number of tourists conflicts with the aims and policies for tranquillity. | It is considered that current levels of visitors are not having a detrimental effect (apart from in a few specific circumstances) and that the increase suggested would also not have a detrimental effect, provided that, as stated in 3.1, they arrive at the right times, in the right places and in the right way to minimise any impact. | 51 | 328 | No |
| 3.1 A Sustainable Growth in Visitors for the... | Primary Land Users' Group 18/10/11 | Are people just passing through the Park and heading to the coast? | Some will be heading to Whitby or Scarborough, but those captured in the visitor figures are undertaking a visit to the Park itself. Much of the coastline is a part of the National Park. | 21 | 102 | No |
| 3.1 A Sustainable Growth in Visitors for the... | Motorcycle Action Group, Scarborough | Nowhere in the document is any mention of motorbikes, whether as an alternative to the private car, or as a means of relieving congestion within the park. Motorcyclists often spend more on their excursions, as they don't have the capacity for taking their refreshments with them. They usually travel as a social group, so any pub, café or visitor attraction they stop at is provided with a boost in their trade. The omission of powered two-wheelers should be rectified. | The policies are strategic and cover motorbikes as well as any other user groups. | 7 | 30 | No |
| 3.1 A Sustainable Growth in Visitors for the... | PLB | Add reference that the Recreation and Access Strategy advocates dispersal of visitors across the Park from key arrival points and honeypots. | A new policy has been added based upon the 'hubs' identified in the Recreation and Access Strategy to state 'Opportunities for a range of recreational activities will be developed around existing 'hubs'.', with the Means to Achieve the Recreation and Access Strategy. | 59 | 450 | Amend Plan |
| 3.1 A Sustainable Growth in Visitors for the... | Primary Land Users' Group 18/10/11 | Has just the North York Moors experienced a decline in visitors, or have other Parks as well? Regional figures are upwards so the North York Moors are going against the trend. | Information on other National Parks' visitor number trends is being obtained. | 21 | 100 | Amend Plan |

| Part of Plan | Respondent | Summary of Comments | Authority Response | Respondent ID | Response ID | Action needed? |
|---------------------------|-----------------------------------|--|---|---------------|-------------|----------------|
| 3.2 Recreation and Access | PLB | The phrase 'reconnect people with nature' puts nature before other elements of the special qualities, and the Park is not particularly natural. Rather than through connecting with nature, wellbeing is usually improved through being outside in the landscape, most of which is not natural, or with the Park's heritage. | The phrase has been taken from the Natural Environment White Paper, and whilst it refers to 'nature' the intention would seem to relate to the countryside, green spaces etc even though many are 'man-made'. | 59 | 453 | No |
| 3.2 Recreation and Access | Comments at Sutton Bank 4/12/11 | The visitor facilities at the 2 National Park centres are great. | Comment noted. | 16 | 66 | No |
| 3.2 Recreation and Access | PLB | The aim relating to 'There will be greater opportunities...', it is not clear whether this means more, or better, or both. This should be clarified. | This aim has been amended to read 'There will be increased and improved opportunities for the public to...' | 59 | 455 | Amend Plan |
| 3.2 Recreation and Access | Comments from Parish Forums | Concern over coaches parking on verges. | Policies in 3.2 Recreation and Access (now Enjoying the Park) aim to reduce conflicts between visitors and the environment and communities. | 56 | 415 | No |
| 3.2 Recreation and Access | Local Access Forum 6/12/11 | Not sure why increasing the number of volunteers is seen as a challenge. | This is referring to the national aim. | 20 | 93 | No |
| 3.2 Recreation and Access | Local Access Forum 6/12/11 | The Management Plans produced by the Estates could have more emphasis on and do more about rights of way. | The Access Management Plans for each Estate are included in the Means to Achieve. Estates and landowners will be identified as the partners in delivering these. | 20 | 92 | Amend Plan |
| 3.2 Recreation and Access | PLB | The policy 'Local communities will enjoy improved access to..', clarify what the access is to. | The policy has been re-worded to read 'Local communities will enjoy improved access to recreational activities and be engaged in...' | 59 | 456 | Amend Plan |
| 3.2 Recreation and Access | Comments at Moors Centre 27/11/11 | There should be more access to woodlands. | All Forestry Commission woodlands are open access, plus there are others with rights of way. It is considered that there is already good access to woodland in the National Park. | 15 | 62 | No |

| Part of Plan | Respondent | Summary of Comments | Authority Response | Respondent ID | Response ID | Action needed? |
|---------------------------|--------------------------------------|---|--|---------------|-------------|----------------|
| 3.2 Recreation and Access | Local Access Forum 6/12/11 | The second purpose used to refer to 'quiet' enjoyment but this was removed via legislation. | Comment noted | 20 | 88 | No |
| 3.2 Recreation and Access | Local Access Forum 6/12/11 | Plan should recognise that local residents also recreate in the Park, there is not much about them in this chapter. | The second sentence of the first paragraph will be amended to state 'People enjoy the National Park for a ...'. The 'In 15 Years Time...' will be amended to state 'More people of all ages, backgrounds and abilities now have a high quality, enjoyable experience of the National Park. They...' | 20 | 89 | Amend Plan |
| 3.2 Recreation and Access | Susan Willmington | Hope that people will continue to use the moors for walking and cycling. Paths should be clearly marked. Bogs that can be crossed on foot are not possible on horseback. It needs to be clear on each gate that it needs to be shut, all gates should be self closing. Remove redundant signs from gates. | This is covered under the first policy but the points are too detailed for the Management Plan. | 11 | 48 | No |
| 3.2 Recreation and Access | PLB | Could there be a list of targets and then a list of how these will be monitored? Amend 'tourist days' to 'visitor days' in the targets. Instead of 85% of PRoW being easy to use, the target should be to increase this year on year. | The data to monitor the targets will be collated by the National Park Authority, from various sources, as stated in 1.9. This has been made clearer, and the monitoring tables have been amended to differentiate between the indicator and the target or desired direction of change. The data relates to 'tourists', as 'visitors' could be visiting the Park for other reasons, but as the term visitors is commonly understood to mean people visiting for leisure and recreation the target has been reworded to refer to 'visitors' . The target is set to maintain 85% of Public Rights of Way being easy to use, rather than to increase this, in acknowledgement that there will always be current issues which are being resolved, and also that some Public Rights of Way are not well used and resolving issues at these would not represent efficient use of resources. | 59 | 457 | No |
| 3.2 Recreation and Access | Comments at Robin Hood's Bay 3/12/11 | Concern about the lack of support for important tourism events - Robin Hood's Bay toilets closed on Victorian weekend. | A sentence will be added to the end of the first paragraph to state 'In addition, a wide range of events is held in the National Park each year which draws in many visitors, such as events on the North Yorkshire Moors Railway and Robin Hood's Bay Victorian Weekend.' The Promoting the Park strategy will consider the role of events. | 19 | 82 | Amend Plan |
| 3.2 Recreation and Access | PLB | Should the second paragraph also refer to provision and availability of information? | A policy has been added to state 'Provision of high quality information on the recreational opportunities in the National Park will be made available using a wide of range of media.' | 59 | 451 | Amend Plan |

| Part of Plan | Respondent | Summary of Comments | Authority Response | Respondent ID | Response ID | Action needed? |
|---------------------------|---------------------------------|--|---|---------------|-------------|----------------|
| 3.2 Recreation and Access | Local Access Forum 6/12/11 | Horse riding is not mentioned, it brings a lot of income and visitors into the Park and has health benefits. | Horse riding will be mentioned in the list of activities in the first paragraph. The rights of way network (as referred to in the first policy) includes bridleways. | 20 | 90 | Amend Plan |
| 3.2 Recreation and Access | British Horse Society | As the horse industry contributes so much to the National Park economy, Definitive Map work including links and proper recording of under and unrecorded rights of way, multi-use rights of way around communities and ease of use which at the moment has no relevance to rider and carriage drivers where there are no higher rights routes, should all be priorities. | This would all come under policy U2, but is too detailed for the Management Plan. Horseriding has been included in the list of activities in the first paragraph. | 42 | 236 | Amend Plan |
| 3.2 Recreation and Access | Comments at Sutton Bank 4/12/11 | Cheap accommodation should be provided on the long-distance walks (e.g. wigwams, pods). | Pods are being installed in the National Park. The last policy in 4.1 Tourism will be amended to state 'The quality and variety of tourism...' | 16 | 114 | Amend Plan |
| 3.2 Recreation and Access | Natural England | Natural England could be included in the Means to Achieve in relation to resolving conflicts between recreational activities and the special qualities. | Natural England have been referred to in relation to the management of green lanes. | 62 | 518 | Amend Plan |
| 3.2 Recreation and Access | Natural England | Local Transport Plans should be included in the Means to Achieve in the policy relating to transport. | Reference to Local Transport Plans has been added. | 62 | 519 | Amend Plan |
| 3.2 Recreation and Access | Alison Fuller | Motor rallies should not be included as a major event, the section implies that motor sports events are a good thing. Are the cycling enduros pedal cycles or motorbikes? Reference to motorsports should be taken out or included as a separate sentence - 'a small number of motor sport events are also held.' | Cycling enduros are pedal bikes. The paragraph is factual as the Park is used for motor rallies. | 30 | 160 | No |
| 3.2 Recreation and Access | British Horse Society | There is no recognition that locals use the rights of way network as well as visitors. | The second sentence of the first paragraph has been amended to state 'People enjoy the National Park for a ...'. The 'In 15 Years Time...' has been amended to state 'More people of all ages, backgrounds and abilities now enjoy high quality, enjoyable experiences of the National Park. They...' | 42 | 233 | Amend Plan |
| 3.2 Recreation and Access | Alison Fuller | In the challenge referring to climate change, amend 'footpaths' to 'rights of way'. | This amendment will be made. | 30 | 161 | Amend Plan |

| Part of Plan | Respondent | Summary of Comments | Authority Response | Respondent ID | Response ID | Action needed? |
|---------------------------|--------------------------------|---|---|---------------|-------------|----------------|
| 3.2 Recreation and Access | North Yorkshire County Council | Pleased to see that the 2nd statutory purpose is considered alongside contemporary issues including the need to reverse the trend in declining tourist days, the need to use the Park as a resource for health and wellbeing, the need to involve volunteers and the need to address climate change. The County Council looks forward to further engagement, as referred to in the policy table. | Comments noted. | 40 | 214 | No |
| 3.2 Recreation and Access | North Yorkshire County Council | It would be helpful to emphasise the review of the Rights of Way Improvement Plan. | Rights of Way Improvement Plans are mentioned in the Means to Achieve, which will include any future reviews. | 40 | 211 | No |
| 3.2 Recreation and Access | Natural England | Supports the recognition of health and wellbeing benefits gained through activities in the Park, and the aim to increase this across the population. | Comment noted. | 62 | 515 | No |
| 3.2 Recreation and Access | Ramblers' Association | There should be an online problem reporting system for public rights of way which enables users to see updates on progress, lists of outstanding problems and all problems completed in the last 12 months. | This is a specific request not relevant to the Management Plan. An email response has been sent. An online reporting system already exists, and updates / queries from our database are provided as and when requested. | 36 | 182 | No |
| 3.2 Recreation and Access | Local Access Forum 6/12/11 | The term 'experience economy' needs more of an explanation. | It is considered that this is generally a well understood phrase. | 20 | 94 | No |
| 3.2 Recreation and Access | British Horse Society | The word 'footpaths' should be replaced with 'rights of way' where it has been used as a generic term. | These amendments have been made. | 42 | 235 | Amend Plan |
| 3.2 Recreation and Access | British Horse Society | The CROW Act, NERC Act and Marine and Coastal Access Act have all had detrimental effects on equestrian access. CROW Act has removed rights for horseriders on the moorland and the foreshore. The NERC Act has, in practice, denied equestrian access to dual status routes where anti-motor barriers have been installed. The CROW Act has also brought in the cut off date for recording under and unrecorded highways and the higher rights users stand to lose the most. | Comment noted, this is too detailed for the Management Plan. | 42 | 234 | No |

| Part of Plan | Respondent | Summary of Comments | Authority Response | Respondent ID | Response ID | Action needed? |
|---------------------------|--------------------------------------|---|--|---------------|-------------|----------------|
| 3.2 Recreation and Access | Welcome to Yorkshire | Many of the challenges are also opportunities, particularly the growing demand for reconnecting with nature and experiential breaks. Slowing visitors down and promoting better experiences brings added benefits of lower mileage, longer stays, spending more, recommending and returning. The North York Moors could learn from the work the Yorkshire Dales are doing with tourism businesses developing new ways for visitors to experience the Dales. | 4.1 Tourism refers to seeking business affiliation, but local businesses will be referred to in the Means to Achieve. The comments could be considered as part of the production of the Promoting the Park Strategy. | 49 | 304 | Amend Plan |
| 3.2 Recreation and Access | Hartoft Parish Council | Shouldn't Moorsbus be mentioned in the last policy? | Moorsbus is to be disbanded but will be replaced by other initiatives as set out in the Means to Achieve. | 51 | 329 | No |
| 3.2 Recreation and Access | Sport England | The Plan should recognise the sporting events that take place and not restrict these from happening. Sports can take place within designations such as SSSIs (for example climbing on protected rock faces). The Management Plan can protect long running sport events through the use of SASP (Significant Areas for Sport). | A range of sporting events are referred to. There is no need to refer to designations as the Environment chapter contains reference to these. Gliding at Sutton Bank is the only location/activity in the Park identified as a SASP, and this will be addressed through future revisions of the Recreation and Access Strategy. It is not considered that other sites in the National Park would be appropriate as SASPs, which currently cover the sports of canoeing, gliding, water skiing and parachuting. | 46 | 289 | No |
| 3.2 Recreation and Access | Sport England | The Plan should support small scale developments to improve the rights of way network including drinking troughs for horses, washing facilities for mountain bikes and benches and signage for walkers, and public art. There should be positive planning policies to support these. | This is covered under policy U2. This level of detail may be more appropriate for Rights of Way Improvement Plans. Planning policies are contained in the Local Development Framework. | 46 | 291 | No |
| 3.2 Recreation and Access | Yorkshire Dales Green Lanes Alliance | The 2008 Recreation and Access Strategy states that off-road driving is inappropriate other than as a carefully managed activity in parts of the forests, including as an action restricting vehicular use on unsurfaced, unclassified roads. This objective should be retained. Support joint action with the police and the use of Traffic Regulation Orders to target illegal motorised use. TROs are likely to be cheaper than continual repair. Repair using materials and techniques to sustain more vehicle use is often inappropriate in a National Park. | The Recreation and Access Strategy refers to off-road vehicles as 'generally considered to be inappropriate' elsewhere but could be accommodated in the forests. This acknowledges that in some places outside of forests the use of vehicles might be acceptable. | 47 | 295 | No |
| 3.2 Recreation and Access | PLB | Could the phrase 'experience economy' in the 4th challenge be explained? | It is considered that this term is well-understood and self-explanatory. | 59 | 454 | No |

| Part of Plan | Respondent | Summary of Comments | Authority Response | Respondent ID | Response ID | Action needed? |
|---------------------------|--|---|---|---------------|-------------|----------------|
| 3.2 Recreation and Access | Newby and Scalby Parish Council | There is a need for more effective enforcement of the inappropriate use of green lanes. | The Plan refers to the use of Traffic Regulation Orders where necessary. | 39 | 206 | No |
| 3.2 Recreation and Access | Motor Sports Association / Assoc of Northern Car Clubs / (Yorkshire Motorsports) Forest Users' Group | In relation to the policy 'conflicts between recreational activities and conservation of the special qualities of the National Park will be minimised', there is no such thing in law as a green lane. This is a loose description for minor roads which have little, if any, sealed surface, and can include bridleways, BOATS, unclassified roads or something else. Traffic Regulation Orders may not simply be 'imposed', there is a requirement for consultation. Content with temporary TROs. Surely recreational and logistical use of minor roads should be encouraged as there is insufficient public transport to meet demands. It must be recognised that the vast majority of people adhere to 'good practice'. | The term 'Green Lanes' is considered to be a generally well-understood one. Any use of Traffic Regulation Orders would be carried out in line with any requirements for consultation or other requirements. Reference to 'some recreational activities are having a detrimental impact upon...' is factual. | 27 | 143 | No |
| 3.2 Recreation and Access | Sport England | The Plan should recognise the sporting opportunities offered by the rights of way network, such as cycling events and horse endurances. | Organised recreational events are referred to but it is not considered necessary go into detail to specifically refer to them sometimes using the Rights of Way network. | 46 | 290 | No |
| 3.2 Recreation and Access | Whorlton Parish Council | The tea rooms at the Moors Centre should be updated / refurbished. | This is too detailed for the Management Plan. The Moors Centre Tea Rooms are currently being refurbished. | 33 | 169 | No |
| 3.2 Recreation and Access | Comments at Guisborough Forest 20/11/11 | Cyclists and horses sharing paths is good, but there should be dedicated tracks for walkers. There should be information about routes on the routes themselves. There needs to be links in bridleways networks. There should be a Go Ape type facility. | Some detail not relevant for the Management Plan, but a policy will be added to state 'Provision of high quality information on the recreational opportunities in the National Park will be made available using a wide of range of media.' | 14 | 59 | Amend Plan |
| 3.2 Recreation and Access | Comments at Sutton Bank 11/12/11 | Keeping the Park tranquil is more important than access, for example would not support watersports. | Policies in this section aim to minimise any conflicts between recreational activities and communities / the environment. | 25 | 128 | No |
| 3.2 Recreation and Access | Thirlby Parish Meeting | There should be an indicator related to the last policy which reflects the proportion of tourist locations accessible by bus from nearby towns. | The monitoring proposed will reveal whether levels of car use have increased or decreased, whereas monitoring whether tourist locations are accessible by bus will not show whether people use the bus. | 48 | 551 | No |

| Part of Plan | Respondent | Summary of Comments | Authority Response | Respondent ID | Response ID | Action needed? |
|---------------------------|---------------------------------|---|--|---------------|-------------|----------------|
| 3.2 Recreation and Access | Comments at Sutton Bank 4/12/11 | There should be an extension to the Pickering to Whitby railway through the Park. | It is not clear how the railway could be extended within the Park. | 16 | 111 | No |
| 3.2 Recreation and Access | Comments at Sutton Bank 4/12/11 | There should be more information about where you are and what you are looking at. | A policy will be added to state 'Provision of high quality information on the recreational opportunities in the National Park will be made available using a wide of range of media.' | 16 | 112 | Amend Plan |
| 3.2 Recreation and Access | Comments at Sutton Bank 4/12/11 | Maintenance to public rights of way should continue, some bridleways are eroding in the middle due to bike tyres and illegal off-roading where they are only surfaced at either end. | These issues are addressed at the Management Plan level through the policy on minimising conflicts. | 16 | 113 | No |
| 3.2 Recreation and Access | PLB | Should make reference to volunteers in the text as well as the challenges, to provide a link / rationale. | A sentence has been added to the end of the first paragraph to state 'Many people also enjoy the National Park through volunteering for a wide range of activities including repairing paths and dry stone walling.' | 59 | 452 | Amend Plan |
| 3.2 Recreation and Access | Natural England | The challenges should include recognition of the over-dependence on access to the Park by car, particularly as the economic outlook suggests there may be a higher proportion of domestic holidays and day visits. | The text recognises that 93% of visitors are believed to travel to the Park by car. | 62 | 514 | No |
| 3.2 Recreation and Access | Comments at Sutton Bank 4/12/11 | There should be more circular walks within the villages. | This is covered in the Management Plan under the first policy. | 16 | 115 | No |
| 3.2 Recreation and Access | Local Access Forum 6/12/11 | Target for rights of way that are easy to use should be 100% (some of the group did not agree with this). | A target of 85% allows for acknowledgement that there will always be recent problems that have not yet been resolved, and that some are poorly used and therefore improvement would not represent an efficient use of resources. | 20 | 95 | No |
| 3.2 Recreation and Access | British Horse Society | The health and wellbeing benefits of horse riding should be mentioned. Horseriders tend to be from lower social classes than other countryside users, and are usually female. There are gaps in the bridleway network in the northwest and some parts of the southwest parts of the Park. | Horseriding has been added to the list of activities in the first paragraph. | 42 | 232 | Amend Plan |

| Part of Plan | Respondent | Summary of Comments | Authority Response | Respondent ID | Response ID | Action needed? |
|---------------------------|--|---|---|---------------|-------------|----------------|
| 3.2 Recreation and Access | Motor Sports Association / Assoc of Northern Car Clubs / (Yorkshire) | Pleased to see reference to the initiative to the action targeting illegal motorised use. | Comment noted. | 27 | 142 | No |
| 3.2 Recreation and Access | Comments at Sutton Bank 11/12/11 | Access for cyclists and walkers is generally good and should be maintained. | The first policy aims to ensure access is maintained. | 25 | 130 | No |
| 3.2 Recreation and Access | Comments at Sutton Bank 4/12/11 | There should be more things to do in the Park, such as treasure hunts. | The first policy in this section would support cycling. A new policy is to be added based upon the 'hubs' identified in the Recreation and Access Strategy to state 'Opportunities for a range of recreational activities will be developed around existing 'hubs'.', with the Means to Achieve the Recreation and Access Strategy. | 16 | 116 | Amend Plan |
| 3.2 Recreation and Access | Comments at Sutton Bank 4/12/11 | There is anti-social behaviour around Wainstones, including graffiti on rocks. | These issues are addressed in the Management Plan through the policies on minimising conflicts. The National Park Authority and the Police tackle graffiti. | 16 | 117 | No |
| 3.2 Recreation and Access | Comments at Sutton Bank 4/12/11 | Put railings on steep paths to help people to get up hills. | Railings are unlikely to be in keeping with a lot of the open areas of the Park and this is too detailed for the Management Plan. It is covered by the policy relating to opportunities being available to a wide cross-section of society. | 16 | 118 | No |
| 3.2 Recreation and Access | Nigel and Carol Wilson | There is an omission in relation to museums, in particular Ryedale Folk Museum, which is a valuable resource for education and entertainment. The museum meets the requirements of the Plan in terms of recreation. | Visitng museums is referred to in the first paragraph as being an activity people visit the Park for and is included in the Means to Achieve for policy U15 which relates to lifelong learning. | 24 | 121 | Amend Plan |
| 3.2 Recreation and Access | Comments at Sutton Bank 11/12/11 | Support facilities for cycle hire at Sutton Bank. | The first policy in this section would support cycling. A new policy is to be added based upon the 'hubs' identified in the Recreation and Access Strategy to state 'Opportunities for a range of recreational activities will be developed around existing 'hubs'.', with the Means to Achieve the Recreation and Access Strategy. | 25 | 127 | Amend Plan |

| Part of Plan | Respondent | Summary of Comments | Authority Response | Respondent ID | Response ID | Action needed? |
|---------------------------|----------------------------|--|--|---------------|-------------|----------------|
| 3.2 Recreation and Access | Alison Fuller | Suggests 2 additional challenges: 'To discourage motor vehicle use in the National Park by encouraging visitors to walk, cycle or ride while in the National Park. This reduces CO2 emissions and noise pollution', and 'To manage green lanes to ensure that use by motorised users is not detrimental to the use of and enjoyment by non-motorised users'. | The first is covered in the challenges and policies of the Transport section (5.3) and via the last challenge and last policy in 3.2 Recreation and Access (now Enjoying the Park. Section 5.3 Transport (now 5.5) acknowledges that realistically the car will remain an important mode of transport in the Park, whilst also aiming to promote alternative forms of transport where possible. The second is covered via the policy in 3.2 'conflicts between recreational activities and conservation of the special qualities of the National Park will be minimised'. An additional challenge will be added to state 'Minimising conflicts between different recreational interests.'. | 30 | 162 | Amend Plan |
| 3.3 Promoting the Park | Local Access Forum 6/12/11 | The National Park Authority should be doing more to promote the Park for walking as that is how most people will be able to enjoy the Park. | Raising awareness and promoting the Park will cover promotion of a variety of activities, coupled with the policy in 3.2 Recreation and Access (now Enjoying the Park) which supported provision and use of rights of way and open access land. | 20 | 85 | No |
| 3.3 Promoting the Park | Local Access Forum 6/12/11 | There are other organisations in addition to these that can help to deliver the policies. | Local businesses will be identified as partners in the Means to Achieve the first and third policies. | 20 | 97 | Amend Plan |
| 3.3 Promoting the Park | Natural England | The monitoring should include specific numbers and proportions as at present, with aspirations to increase to measurable targets. | Specific targets are set out in relation to the second indicator. Current data does not facilitate incorporating additional detail in relation to the first outcome. | 62 | 520 | No |
| 3.3 Promoting the Park | Norma Taylor | 6% national awareness and around a third regional awareness is far too small. Perhaps the negative associations with the word 'moors' is something to think about. | The sentence referring to negative associations with the word 'moors' has been removed. This issue is to be addressed through the Promoting the Park strategy. | 65 | 544 | Amend Plan |
| 3.3 Promoting the Park | Local Access Forum 6/12/11 | Rather than refer to specific population groups in the second challenge should refer to socio-economic groups. | Text will be removed from 'including' onwards. | 20 | 96 | Amend Plan |
| 3.3 Promoting the Park | Robert Sword | It is a good idea to raise awareness of the North York Moors 'brand'. This will support tourism including self-catering properties and B&Bs. | Comment noted | 18 | 78 | No |

| Part of Plan | Respondent | Summary of Comments | Authority Response | Respondent ID | Response ID | Action needed? |
|------------------------|--------------------------------------|--|---|---------------|-------------|----------------|
| 3.3 Promoting the Park | Comments at Robin Hood's Bay 3/12/11 | The National Park Authority should encourage Councils in supporting tourism. | Local and regional tourism organisations (of which local Councils are a part) are identified as a means to achieve policies relating to promoting the Park. Local Authorities will be referred to in the Means to Achieve. | 19 | 83 | Amend Plan |
| 3.3 Promoting the Park | Peter Hay | To counter the reduction in visitors more should be done to promote mountain biking, as in Scotland and Wales. This would attract younger people to the Park. Tracks across the moors should be promoted and the numerous Land Rover tracks need to be given higher rights for bikes. This could be done using the Paths for Communities grants scheme. Rock climbing should also be promoted as there are 30 crags in the climbing guide. | The first policy in 3.2 Recreation and Access (now Enjoying the Park) supports cycling. A new policy in 3.2 is to be added based upon the 'hubs' identified in the Recreation and Access Strategy to state 'Opportunities for a range of recreational activities will be developed around existing 'hubs'', with the Means to Achieve being the Recreation and Access Strategy. | 29 | 159 | Amend Plan |
| 3.3 Promoting the Park | Redcar and Cleveland Borough Council | It is interesting that the name 'Moors' is seen as negative. | Comment noted. This sentence is to be removed following other discussions. | 35 | 180 | No |
| 3.3 Promoting the Park | Welcome to Yorkshire | The challenges are also opportunities. WtY welcome the opportunity to work with the NPA to raise awareness of the brand. Whilst 56% of visitors to Yorkshire come from Yorkshire, only 32% of visitors to the National Park come from Yorkshire, so there are clear opportunities to increase recognition across the county. New media can reach harder to reach groups such as young people. | Comments noted. | 49 | 305 | No |
| 3.3 Promoting the Park | Gus Pennington | The Authority should be more ambitious with the Danby Moors Centre Gallery. The gallery could easily attract a regional audience for significant exhibitions and arts groups/curators would welcome the opportunity to contribute to developing it a regional resource. North Yorkshire has a number of excellent municipal galleries who might be interested in a moorland show case. The benefits would be substantial in terms of raising the profile of the Moors, encouraging visitor numbers and possible inward investment. | The points are too detailed for the Management Plan, but a new policy is to be included to state 'Provision of high quality information on the recreational opportunities in the National Park will be made available using a wide of range of media.' | 5 | 18 | Amend Plan |
| 3.3 Promoting the Park | Ingleby Arncliffe Parish Council | The National Park must promote itself and educate the public. | Policies in the Plan aim to promote the Park and the brand and to increase understanding of the Park's special qualities. | 34 | 171 | No |

| Part of Plan | Respondent | Summary of Comments | Authority Response | Respondent ID | Response ID | Action needed? |
|----------------------------|------------------------------------|--|--|---------------|-------------|----------------|
| 3.3 Promoting the Park | Comments at Sutton Bank 4/12/11 | The Park should be promoted to tell people what a fantastic place it is. People should be encouraged to get out and about in the Park. | The Plan (and the Promoting the Park Strategy to be prepared) aims to increase awareness of and visits to the National Park. | 16 | 68 | No |
| 3.3 Promoting the Park | Primary Land Users' Group 18/10/11 | Should do something about promoting the Park and improving its image. | The policies in this section aim to raise awareness of the Park and promote the brand, and will be taken forward in the Promoting the Park strategy. | 21 | 99 | No |
| 3.3 Promoting the Park | Primary Land Users' Group 18/10/11 | Education and training is important in boosting 'networking' e.g. directing visitors to other attractions in the Park and raising awareness of what the Park has to offer and its local distinctiveness. | Local businesses are to be included in the Means to Achieve the first and third policies of this section, and in the policies in 4.1 Tourism. | 21 | 104 | Amend Plan |
| 3.3 Promoting the Park | Local Access Forum 6/12/11 | The name of the Park does not convey the great variety of landscape, there is more to it than just moors. Redefine the perception of the Park, emphasise the diversity of the landscape and different aspects of the Park. Other Parks have specific titles but don't seem to suffer from the same negative associations. People are not aware of the diversity. | The branding work which is being promoted through the Management Plan and will be taken forward in the Promoting the Park Strategy and will look to convey a message that the National Park is more than just moors. | 20 | 86 | No |
| 3.3 Promoting the Park | Comments at Sutton Bank 4/12/11 | Like to keep the North York Moors a secret. | The Plan aims to increase awareness of, and visits to, the National Park to meet the second statutory purpose and to improve the Park's economy. However in doing this the Plan seeks to preserve tranquil areas and minimise conflicts between recreational activities and the environment and communities. | 16 | 67 | No |
| 3.4 Understanding the Park | Welcome to Yorkshire | Tourism businesses can play a key role in passing on messages about the special qualities to their customers. Provision for this should be included in the Plan. WtY run a series of member events which could provide one mechanism for this. | Whilst they may have some role in this local businesses are not considered to be a key partner. Local businesses are identified as key partners against many of the policies in 4.1 Tourism. | 49 | 306 | No |
| 3.4 Understanding the Park | Natural England | It is important to increase 'education outside the classroom'. | Policy U13 aims to engage with school children which will often be in the form of 'learning outside the classroom'. | 62 | 546 | No |

| Part of Plan | Respondent | Summary of Comments | Authority Response | Respondent ID | Response ID | Action needed? |
|--|---------------------------------|---|---|---------------|-------------|----------------|
| 3.4 Understanding the Park | Nigel and Carol Wilson | There is an omission in relation to museums and education service. In particular Ryedale Folk Museum, which is a valuable resource for education and entertainment, is not mentioned. The museum is a rich educational resource for local schools. The museum meets the requirements of many parts of the Plan including promoting opportunities for understanding. | Museums will be referred to in the means to achieve in relation to the policy 'Opportunities for lifelong learning about the National Park will be provided.' | 24 | 120 | Amend Plan |
| 3.4 Understanding the Park | Miss T Solesby | Too many 'learning more' labels, boards and information centres can disfigure the environment. | These are sited in appropriate locations and designed sensitively. | 55 | 407 | No |
| 3.4 Understanding the Park | Natural England | Broadly support policies relating to promoting and understanding the Park, which reflect Natural England's objectives. | Comment noted. | 62 | 516 | No |
| 3.4 Understanding the Park | Peter Woods | The word 'education' is hardly mentioned, this must include possibilities for the future as well as the history of the landscape. | Education, as a way of increasing understanding, is referred to in the means to achieve. | 28 | 149 | No |
| 3.4 Understanding the Park | Comments at Sutton Bank 4/12/11 | Should work with young people to encourage participation and increase opportunities to engage in outdoor adventure activities. | A policy in this section states that children living within and outside the National Park will be engaged with during their school career. A new policy will be added to 3.2 Recreation and Access (now Enjoying the Park) to state 'Provision of high quality information on the recreational opportunities in the National Park will be made available using a wide of range of media.' | 16 | 71 | Amend Plan |
| Chapter 4 - Business and Land Management | Hartoft Parish Council | Reference to earnings in the 2nd paragraph should be mean rather than median, as it is it infers that no-one earns over £31,400. | Median is the mid-range number, so it is unclear how this would be the case. | 51 | 330 | No |
| Chapter 4 - Business and Land Management | Natural England | Support for addressing the local economy as there are clear linkages between this and a well managed countryside and natural environment. | Comment noted. | 62 | 517 | No |

| Part of Plan | Respondent | Summary of Comments | Authority Response | Respondent ID | Response ID | Action needed? |
|--|--|--|--|---------------|-------------|----------------|
| Chapter 4 - Business and Land Management | Sport England | The Plan should recognise the role that sport plays in the economy. | Reference to sports (and recreational activities) supporting the local economy is included the introduction to 3.2 Understanding and Enjoyment. | 46 | 292 | Amend Plan |
| Chapter 4 - Business and Land Management | Redcar and Cleveland Strategic Partnership | All ok. It is important to develop all appropriate opportunities to extend revenue/income for all stakeholders. | The chapter supports businesses across a range of sectors, including the main sectors in the Park and small local businesses. | 6 | 25 | No |
| Chapter 4 - Business and Land Management | Game and Wildlife Conservation Trust | There is a lack of financial support from the National Park Authority for land management support, such as tick and predator control, as these are not available under HLS. The Authority could fund advisory bodies such as the GWCT which could help to resolve concerns about muirburn for example, as is being used in DEFRA's Nature Improvement Area strategies. | Land management is supported through agri-environment schemes. | 58 | 441 | No |
| Chapter 4 - Business and Land Management | B E Vyner | Unconvincing. | The policies are based upon addressing the challenges identified and the means to achieve are based upon organisations / projects / plans that will be working towards implementing these policies. Implementation will be secured via lower level detailed plans and agreements between partners. | 26 | 136 | No |
| Chapter 4 - Business and Land Management | Scarborough Borough Council | Should the potash mine come to fruition local economic benefits should be maximised in terms of employment for residents of the Park and through ancillary, support and supply chain opportunities, albeit in a way that mitigates any direct impacts on the character of the National Park and on local communities. The Plan should contextualise some of the issues facing rural and coastal communities , where high quality year round employment opportunities are needed. | Comments regarding a potential potash mine are noted, although it is not appropriate for the Management Plan to pre-empt any future planning decisions. Reference has been added to the third paragraph of the introduction to this chapter to state 'The dependency on tourism jobs is reflected in the fact that many jobs in the Park are seasonal and/or part-time. It is understood that many younger people are moving away from the area for work, with consequences for local facilities and communities.' | 66 | 563 | Amend Plan |
| Chapter 4 - Business and Land Management | Welcome to Yorkshire | Most of the business sectors are interrelated with tourism, each sector should not be considered in isolation. | A sentence has been included in the first paragraph in 4.1 Tourism to state 'Many of the businesses in the Park are interrelated with tourism and benefit from people visiting the Park.' | 49 | 308 | Amend Plan |
| 4.1 Tourism | Welcome to Yorkshire | Support the aim to increase the economic value of tourism. | Support noted. | 49 | 307 | No |

| Part of Plan | Respondent | Summary of Comments | Authority Response | Respondent ID | Response ID | Action needed? |
|--------------|----------------------------------|--|--|---------------|-------------|----------------|
| 4.1 Tourism | Comments at Sutton Bank 11/12/11 | It is important to support the economy and tourism. | This policy aims to increase the value of tourism to the economy. | 25 | 126 | No |
| 4.1 Tourism | Great Ayton Parish Council | What is the 'Park Strategy'? | The Means to Achieve refers to the 'Promoting the Park Plan' ('Promoting the Park Strategy' in the draft), which will identify how awareness / image of the National Park will be improved. | 57 | 432 | No |
| 4.1 Tourism | Paul Ming | The challenge relating to attracting people into the Park in the shoulder seasons conflicts with a recent planning decision which does not allow a campsite to open during these seasons. | Whilst the Plan seeks to increase the number of tourists in the Park, this must be done in ways which will not harm the special qualities of the Park. | 41 | 225 | No |
| 4.1 Tourism | Scarborough Borough Council | Supports the aim to develop the tourism industry in terms of scale and offer. The Plan should make reference to the inter-relationships between the Park and surrounding areas, for example places outside the Park may provide a base from which to visit the Park. | A sentence has been included at the end of the first paragraph to state 'Many visitors will make combined trips, visiting both the Park and the surrounding area.' | 66 | 561 | Amend Plan |
| 4.1 Tourism | Great Ayton Parish Council | This section lacks the momentum of previous sections and raises the issue of delivering the Communications Strategy. | This is focussed on the economic value of tourism and should be read in conjunction with Chapter 3 Understanding and Enjoyment. | 57 | 433 | No |
| 4.1 Tourism | English Heritage | It is important to improve the quality of what already exists. | The final policy aims to improve the quality. | 37 | 197 | No |
| 4.1 Tourism | Comments at Sutton Bank 4/12/11 | Should work with accommodation providers to support and improve the hospitality sector. | A policy in this section aims to improve the quality of tourism and recreation provision in the Park. The Promoting the Park strategy could improve the networking of providers, and seeking business affiliation to the North York Moors brand is recognised as a challenge in section 4.1. | 16 | 69 | No |
| 4.1 Tourism | Natural England | There is some repetition between 3.1 and 4.1, they should be checked to ensure that they are compatible. | The text and figures in 4.1 relate to the value of tourism whilst 3.1 relates to visitor days, therefore resulting in different percentage increases / decreases. | 62 | 521 | No |

| Part of Plan | Respondent | Summary of Comments | Authority Response | Respondent ID | Response ID | Action needed? |
|-----------------|----------------------------|--|---|---------------|-------------|----------------|
| 4.1 Tourism | British Horse Society | There is no mention of horse tourism which has a bigger spend than a walker or cyclist as the horse must also be fed and kept. | A sentence has been included after the second paragraph to state 'Tourists visit the National Park for a variety of reasons including sightseeing and visiting cultural attractions or to undertake activities such as walking, cycling or horseriding.' | 42 | 239 | Amend Plan |
| 4.2 Agriculture | RSPB | There should be reference to conservation priorities, wildlife and natural heritage in the policies. | Agri-environment schemes are encouraged. Wildlife and natural heritage policies are in the Environment section. | 45 | 279 | No |
| 4.2 Agriculture | Hambleton District Council | The diversification of farming should be promoted, including more sustainable mixed farming methods and using locally grown feed for livestock. More fruit and vegetables should be grown. Breeds suited to the North York Moors climate would minimise the need for intervention. Intercropping produces higher yields than intensive farming, is less carbon intensive and creates more jobs. More modern and effective low carbon farming methods should increase the number of jobs available. The Plan should aim to help farmers to develop a market for traditional breeds and associated products and the area should be a demonstration area of the profitability of extensive rather than intensive farming. | Intercropping is generally economically driven. It is not appropriate to include this level of detail in the Management Plan. | 52 | 357 | No |
| 4.2 Agriculture | Hambleton District Council | Energy crops should only be grown on land not normally suitable for agriculture and should be grown without the use of fertilisers and pesticides which is likely to create a negative carbon balance. Biodigesters to process farm waste should be promoted. | The potential for processing farm waste currently largely depends upon incentives, but text has been included in 5.4 Energy (now 5.6) under Prospects for Future Energy Generation to state that 'There may be potential to generate energy from farm waste.' | 52 | 358 | Amend Plan |
| 4.2 Agriculture | NFU | Before greater levels of engagement in environmental stewardship can be achieved, there should be investigation into the barriers to entry for those outside the schemes and measures should be put in place to overcome them, alongside industry initiatives such as the Campaign for the Farmed Environment. | It is considered that this will form part of the implementation, rather than be an issue for the Management Plan. | 61 | 461 | No |
| 4.2 Agriculture | NFU | The primary purpose of farming within the National Park should remain food production, as a source of high quality meat and breeding stock and arable production to complement these. Investment and knowledge transfer, particularly in the hill sheep sector, could lead to increased productivity and competitiveness in tandem with good environmental management, and also a reverse in the trend in under grazing. | The Plan recognises the importance of farming in the National Park for food production, and aims to increase this. | 61 | 460 | No |

| Part of Plan | Respondent | Summary of Comments | Authority Response | Respondent ID | Response ID | Action needed? |
|-----------------|---------------------------|---|--|---------------|-------------|----------------|
| 4.2 Agriculture | RSPB | The monitoring section lacks qualitative assessment and the conservation objectives need to be defined. | This is the data that is available. A footnote will be included to state 'Conservation objectives include a broad range of objectives covering landscape and nature conservation.' | 45 | 280 | Amend Plan |
| 4.2 Agriculture | RSPB | The 'In 15 Years Time...' section needs to also refer to the environment. | The first sentence in 'In 15 Years Time...' will be amended to state 'Farming in the National Park is viable and productive and contributes to the maintenance and enhancement of the landscape and natural environment and supports biodiversity.' | 45 | 278 | Amend Plan |
| 4.2 Agriculture | RSPB | Welcome and support recognition of the need to benefit and increase biodiversity. However there are challenges to overcome e.g. increasing sheep numbers whilst other moorland interests need a reduction in sheep numbers. There is a need to retain livestock to graze habitats to maintain and conserve priority habitats and species. | The increases in sheep numbers are intended to be accommodated in places currently undergrazed. This has been clarified through rewording the first point in Prospects for Farming to read 'Moorland sheep could be increased by up to 6,000 giving an increase of around 24 tonnes of meat and 500 breeding lambs at current performance. This figure is based on an average stocking rate of one ewe per hectare. This could contribute positively to the conservation of moorland providing sheep were properly re hefted on to those areas currently undergrazed at stocking rates appropriate to the habitat type and carrying capacity on the individual areas of moorland.' | 45 | 276 | Amend Plan |
| 4.2 Agriculture | Robert Goodwill MP | Support moves to brand food as locally produced. Processing of locally produced foods should also be carried out in the area (local farmers who are marketing their lamb through Asda have to ship it to North Wales to be slaughtered). | An additional challenge will be included to state 'Local processing and marketing of produce grown and reared in the National Park.' | 8 | 32 | Amend Plan |
| 4.2 Agriculture | Oswaldkirk Parish Meeting | It would be helpful for the means to achieve the first policy to include further detail (used as an example, should also be applied in other places throughout the Plan). | The Management Plan needs to be flexible and therefore only the main projects and organisations have been identified. Details will be agreed through the Authority's Business Plan and the detailed planning of other organisations. | 44 | 245 | No |
| 4.2 Agriculture | NFU | Welcomes support for diversification of agricultural enterprises as there is a need to ensure that important related industries are not stifled by prescriptive division between what is or is not appropriate in the countryside. The relationship between production and processing needs to be understood, the importance of farm diversification, the important contribution that can be made by rural renewable energy projects to Government targets and the need to ensure an adequate supply of affordable housing. | The Plan supports all of these, and an additional challenge has been included to state 'Local processing and marketing of produce grown and reared in the National Park.' | 61 | 462 | Amend Plan |

| Part of Plan | Respondent | Summary of Comments | Authority Response | Respondent ID | Response ID | Action needed? |
|-----------------|------------------|--|---|---------------|-------------|----------------|
| 4.2 Agriculture | RSPB | A key challenge missing is how to deliver multiple benefit land-use e.g. High Nature Value farming. | The Plan is based upon delivering multiple benefits, it is not necessary to refer to specific details. | 45 | 275 | No |
| 4.2 Agriculture | English Heritage | The Plan needs to be clearer about the role of craft skills, perhaps it should have its own section? The NPA is supporting a craft skills initiative on the Estates. | The policy supports traditional skills, which would include craft skills. | 37 | 198 | No |
| 4.2 Agriculture | Jon Risdon | In relation to accommodating 6,000 additional sheep, it would make more sense to consider uses of land which do not lead to releases of methane. Surely the aesthetic and functional values of the National Park would not suffer without the addition of this number of sheep. | There are multiple reasons for increasing the numbers of moor sheep including management of the moorland, supporting hill farming communities and provision of food. | 3 | 9 | No |
| 4.2 Agriculture | RSPB | Include a figure on the financial value of agri-environment schemes to farms, in paragraph 5. | This is too detailed for the Management Plan. | 45 | 274 | No |
| 4.2 Agriculture | NFU | Concerned that tenant farmers should be able to access potential new markets for ecosystem services. A challenge is to capture the real value of these benefits for the current and future generations of farmers. | A sentence has been included in 1.6 Benefits from Moorland, Woodland, Farmland and Coast to state 'In the future, payments for ecosystem services may become more mainstream in recognition of the role that farming can have in meeting wider environmental objectives.' | 61 | 463 | Amend Plan |
| 4.2 Agriculture | Natural England | Third bullet point - Conversion of temporary grassland and an increase in the use of fertilisers the area of arable land is of considerable concern. Increasing the use of fertilisers would mitigate any benefits achieved through reduction of livestock. It may also lead to increases in the rate of water and sediment runoff, especially through deep level cultivation. The implications of this on proposals to expand the area of species rich grassland are not clear, implications of different parts of the Plan on each other need to be considered. It is considered that fringes of the Park should not be treated as any less important than other areas. The Plan should not promote anything that would harm the valued characteristics. | The prospects for farming section has been revised to clarify that the focus is upon increasing output through more efficient use of inputs, rather than on increasing fertiliser use. The following paragraphs make it clear that any increases in productivity will only be supported by the Management Plan where they do not harm the Park's special qualities and policy B6 states 'The production and profitability of agriculture will be increased through improved use of appropriate technology and transfer of knowledge, without harming the Park's special qualities.' | 62 | 524 | Amend Plan |
| 4.2 Agriculture | Miss T Solesby | More sheep would be welcome. | The Plan aims to increase the number of sheep on the moors. | 55 | 408 | No |

| Part of Plan | Respondent | Summary of Comments | Authority Response | Respondent ID | Response ID | Action needed? |
|-----------------|-----------------------------|--|---|---------------|-------------|----------------|
| 4.2 Agriculture | Martin Muir | An additional 6,000 moor sheep will be hard to achieve. Hill sheep farming has little profitability and is very labour intensive. HLS is halting the decline of moorland flocks, but will need to continue if we are to maintain current sheep numbers. | The Plan recognises the economic issues of hill sheep farming. The plan does not aim to increase the number of hill sheep, instead recognises that this level of increase could be accommodated on the moors, this will be made clearer through the inclusion of a new table in section 1.9 which will clearly separate the aspirations and the aims. | 17 | 75 | Amend Plan |
| 4.2 Agriculture | Campaign for National Parks | Concerns relate to the focus on increasing agricultural productivity. The role of farmers is very important and farmers and land managers should be better rewarded for the beneficial work they do (for example premium prices for quality National Park branded products) and in delivering other ecosystem services (through agri-environment schemes and other payments such as carbon off-setting). Increasing agricultural productivity per se will not lead to long term success for either farmers or the environment. The results of the Askham Bryan study need to be considered alongside the ambitions across all other ecosystem services. The National Ecosystem Assessment shows clearly that focusing on production at the expense of the environment will not lead to economic success in the longer term. An additional 6,000 sheep on the moors is unlikely to be compatible with the England Biodiversity Strategy target of getting 50% of SSSIs into favourable condition by 2020 and an increase in arable area requiring additional fertiliser use could be incompatible with reducing carbon emissions and improving water quality. | Officers are currently looking at how the Prospects for Farming text can be revised. | 22 | 110 | Amend Plan |
| 4.2 Agriculture | RSPB | Clarify what is meant by temporary grassland. The existing conservation value should be considered before ploughing it up. | DEFRA define temporary grassland as grassland which is less than 5 years old. It is not necessary to include this level of detail in the Management Plan. | 45 | 277 | No |
| 4.2 Agriculture | Hartoft Parish Council | 2nd bullet point in prospects for farming - output is market led and in competition with cheaper foreign imports. Sheep farming is in decline as it is not attractive to farmers' children. | Measures to increase output could help to address these issues. Other benefits for farmers are provided through Higher Level Stewardship. | 51 | 334 | No |
| 4.2 Agriculture | Natural England | Promoting increased farming productivity alongside enhancements for biodiversity is challenging and has often led to negative impacts for wildlife and landscape. | A table has been included in 1.9 which will identify where various activities (farming, tree planting, habitat expansion) should and should not take place, and what the potential positive and negative (to be mitigated) impacts would be. | 62 | 525 | Amend Plan |

| Part of Plan | Respondent | Summary of Comments | Authority Response | Respondent ID | Response ID | Action needed? |
|-----------------|---------------------------------|--|--|---------------|-------------|----------------|
| 4.2 Agriculture | Hartoft Parish Council | All animals produce carbon dioxide and methane. Increased use of soil dressings increases release of nitrogen oxides and promotes acidity. | The Prospects for Farming section has been revised and does not now refer to increasing the use of fertilisers. | 51 | 333 | Amend Plan |
| 4.2 Agriculture | Hartoft Parish Council | Actively working soils increases the rate at which carbon dioxide and methane are released and allows nitrates to be more easily leached into water courses. | The Plan encourages more efficient, rather than more intensive, ways of working. | 51 | 336 | No |
| 4.2 Agriculture | Newby and Scalby Parish Council | Recent moves towards partnership working are good but more needs to be done to maintain sheep flocks on the moors. | The Plan aims to increase the number of sheep on the moors. | 39 | 207 | No |
| 4.2 Agriculture | Hartoft Parish Council | The bullet points relating to ensuring there is no impact on the special qualities seem to be constructed to hamper achievement. | These bullet points are intended to make it clear that any changes to farming practices should not result in harm to the National Park's special qualities. | 51 | 337 | No |
| 4.2 Agriculture | Hartoft Parish Council | Ploughing up temporary grassland has contributed to the loss of traditional field boundaries. | The Prospects for Farming section has been revised and does not now refer to ploughing up temporary grassland, focussing instead on more efficient management of existing farmed land. | 51 | 335 | Amend Plan |
| 4.2 Agriculture | Michael Richardson | Not too sure whether the area can sustain another 6,000 sheep. | This would take current numbers up to the Natural England standard of 1 ewe per hectare for upland areas in areas which are currently undergrazed. The principle of increasing sheep numbers has received support from farming / landowner / estate interests. | 4 | 11 | No |
| 4.2 Agriculture | Hartoft Parish Council | The 1st challenge does not acknowledge that there is insufficient capacity on mainland Great Britain to provide 100% of the food for the population. Current net food imports are about 60%. | DEFRA has an aim to increase the amount of food produced, which the Plan reflects. | 51 | 331 | No |
| 4.2 Agriculture | Natural England | An overview or review of farming in the Park would be helpful in identifying where and how increases in productivity can be achieved. | The Askham Bryan report provided an overview of current levels of productivity in the Park and has helped to inform the work looking at what could be accommodated. | 62 | 528 | No |

| Part of Plan | Respondent | Summary of Comments | Authority Response | Respondent ID | Response ID | Action needed? |
|-----------------|-----------------|---|---|---------------|-------------|----------------|
| 4.2 Agriculture | Peter Woods | If the suggested additional 6,000 sheep on the moors are intended to prevent tree growth then they should be opposed. If they are to maintain income for hill farmers they are a laudable aspiration. Any tree planting would need to be protected from sheep. | Increasing the number of moorland sheep would provide a range of benefits including economic and conservation of the moorland landscape. Any tree planting would be protected from sheep where necessary. | 28 | 153 | No |
| 4.2 Agriculture | Natural England | First bullet point in Prospects for Farming - There should not be a blanket stocking rate for moorland sheep, especially without making it clear that it is an annual average or a maximum rate. Sustainable stocking rates should be identified on a site-by-site basis as they depend upon the vegetation present and the conservation objectives. It may be less where there are less productive habitats such as blanket bog or where the objective is restoration of habitat in unfavourable condition, as evidenced by agri-environment monitoring and heathland research. In other cases, such as on dry heath in good condition, it could be exceeded. Actual levels would vary throughout the year. There may still be scope to increase sheep numbers following losses from foot and mouth. The challenge is therefore to achieve levels of grazing that are environmentally sustainable. | The prospects for farming section has been revised and this part has been clarified and now refers to the figure for increasing the number of moorland sheep being based on an average stocking rate of 1 ewe per hectare. | 62 | 522 | Amend Plan |
| 4.2 Agriculture | Paul Ming | Zero grazing could lead to problems associated with slurry. | This has been recognised in the revised text which states 'Zero grazing and wholecrop silage can offer agricultural rewards but are likely to often have environmental drawbacks.' | 41 | 226 | Amend Plan |
| 4.2 Agriculture | Natural England | Support expanding the market for locally produced food, but there should be more reference to the implications and the benefits to consumers in terms of understanding the landscape and its functions, as well as to farmers. | Measures to increase the understanding of the National Park, which includes the farmed landscape, are set out under 3.4 Understanding the Park. An additional challenge has been included to state 'Local processing and marketing of produce grown and reared in the National Park.' | 62 | 526 | Amend Plan |
| 4.2 Agriculture | Paul Ming | Energy crops can lead to problems of monoculture. Could a more natural woodland be managed for energy crops? | This section recognises the visual impacts associated with energy crops. The Forestry and Woodland section supports the management of woodlands for wood fuel. | 41 | 227 | No |
| 4.2 Agriculture | Paul Ming | Removing hedges to increase field sizes leads to the loss of natural habitat. Has a survey been undertaken to ascertain what would be lost? The Hedgerow Regulations 1997 acknowledge the importance of hedgerows. | The Prospects for Farming text has been revised and reference to increasing the arable area and crop has been removed. | 41 | 228 | Amend Plan |

| Part of Plan | Respondent | Summary of Comments | Authority Response | Respondent ID | Response ID | Action needed? |
|---------------------------|--|--|--|---------------|-------------|----------------|
| 4.2 Agriculture | British Horse Society | Horseriding has helped with farm diversification, including through the production of horse feed. | A sentence has been added to the end of the paragraph 5 of the supporting text stating that 'Farm income is also often supported through diversification.' | 42 | 237 | Amend Plan |
| 4.2 Agriculture | Whorlton Parish Council | 'Zero grazing' seems totally out of keeping with the character of the Park, traditional practice and the reduction of greenhouse gas emissions. | The Plan does not state that field size would be increased, but that crop area would be increased, which would involve using currently unused areas of temporary grassland. | 33 | 167 | Amend Plan |
| 4.2 Agriculture | Robert Sword | Very encouraging that an additional 6,000 moorland sheep and 5% increase in crop yields would be supported. The North York Moors has a problem of undergrazing so increasing sheep numbers would be good provided concentrations are avoided and the sheep are properly managed. | Comments noted. | 18 | 76 | No |
| 4.2 Agriculture | Natural England | Second bullet point in Prospects for Farming - Concerned over the implications of changes to grassland management where this results in increase in fertiliser use, such as nutrient run-off, loss of species diversity, carbon storage of the soil, and soil flora and fauna. The moorland fringe area is increasingly seen as playing an important role for biodiversity and ecosystem services and in the connectivity of habitats. | The prospects for farming section has been revised to clarify that the focus is upon increasing output through more efficient use of inputs, rather than on increasing fertiliser use. | 62 | 523 | Amend Plan |
| 4.2 Agriculture | Hartoft Parish Council | 4th challenge - sheep farmers should have already discovered the best sustainable way to manage sheep flocks in a market led business. | It is considered that there is scope for improvements to be made. | 51 | 332 | No |
| 4.3 Forestry and Woodland | Redcar and Cleveland Strategic Partnership | Particularly keen to support more sustainable forms of woodland management. | The policies as a whole, along with those in section 2.9 Trees and Woodlands, support making more use of woodlands, particularly those which are currently unmanaged. | 6 | 26 | No |
| 4.3 Forestry and Woodland | Hambleton District Council | Woodland should be managed to produce timber for building materials, small wood materials for crafts, animal bedding and paper, with only waste used for biomass. Wood fuel should be marketed and sold locally to minimise transport need. | The second policy supports new markets for sustainable woodland products. It would be too detailed for the Management Plan to mention all of these suggestions. | 52 | 363 | No |

| Part of Plan | Respondent | Summary of Comments | Authority Response | Respondent ID | Response ID | Action needed? |
|---------------------------|----------------------------|--|--|---------------|-------------|----------------|
| 4.3 Forestry and Woodland | Natural England | The Plan should recognise that increasing the use of timber products may have implications for landscape and habitat value and include positive policies to manage such changes. | Policy B14 states that 'Best practice in forest management will be promoted' and the first challenge recognises that improving the viability of woodlands should be carried out in a sensitive and appropriate way. It is not considered necessary to add any further cross-reference as the Plan should be read as a whole. | 62 | 530 | No |
| 4.3 Forestry and Woodland | Natural England | Clarify whether 'floor' in the timber market refers increasing the viability of timber production or a shift to biomass fuels. | SembCorp on Teesside take all of the Forestry Commission's surplus timber, so has enabled a use for otherwise surplus materials rather than changing forestry practices. | 62 | 529 | No |
| 4.4 Moorland Shooting | Hambleton District Council | Ensure any shot used in game shooting does not poison the moorland environment. | This is covered in the policy B16 re positive environmental impacts. | 52 | 361 | No |
| 4.4 Moorland Shooting | RSPB | There should be some clarification over the income from agri-environment schemes, how significant is it compared to private income? | It is not necessary to include this level of detail in the Management Plan. | 45 | 282 | No |
| 4.4 Moorland Shooting | RSPB | There should be figures on the value of shooting to the economy to enable a comparison with other sectors. | Figures on the value of shooting to the economy are not available. | 45 | 283 | No |
| 4.4 Moorland Shooting | Farmoor Services LLP | The impact on wildlife of increasing activity for the management of grouse is a challenge for Natural England rather than the National Park. 340 hotel nights per year from grouse shooting seems to be an underestimate, there are potentially 1,170 nights accommodation associated with the shoots you have listed. | The Management Plan is for the Park not just the National Park Authority and it is therefore not necessary to refer to Natural England. | 9 | 36 | No |
| 4.4 Moorland Shooting | Peter Woods | Moorland management is not forward looking enough. Grouse shooting brings a little money into the Park but causes harm to wildlife and predators. | The Plan aims to support grouse shooting where it has positive environmental impacts. Reference is to be included to the Game and Wildlife Conservation Trust's Code of Good Shooting Practice and other guidance. | 28 | 151 | Amend Plan |
| 4.4 Moorland Shooting | RSPB | The infrastructure can cause considerable damage to protected sites and species. | Policy B17 states that new infrastructure should be appropriate to the landscape and environment and refers to the National Park Authority's Planning Advice Note on Agricultural, Forestry and Recreational Tracks in the Means to Achieve. | 45 | 284 | No |

| Part of Plan | Respondent | Summary of Comments | Authority Response | Respondent ID | Response ID | Action needed? |
|-----------------------|------------------------------------|---|--|---------------|-------------|----------------|
| 4.4 Moorland Shooting | Primary Land Users' Group 18/10/11 | Shooting is beneficial to wildlife and the economy if managed in the right way. Should the North York Moors become a beacon of good practice? | This would need to be led by the industry and at the moment it is not clear whether this is likely to happen or not. | 21 | 106 | No |
| 4.4 Moorland Shooting | RSPB | The 'In 15 Years Time...' section and the aim should also relate to conservation of the moorland and protected sites. | It is considered that this is covered, although 'moorland environment' has been added to the 'In 15 Years Time' to read '...without damaging the moorland environment, wildlife, landscape, heritage...'. A table has also been added to 1.9 Delivering the Plan which will identify where tree planting should not take place. | 45 | 286 | Amend Plan |
| 4.4 Moorland Shooting | Susan Willmington | Many other animals are being shot, including foxes and badgers, to protect the young grouse. Shooting should allow the bird to get away. | Text is to be added to 2.2 Habitats and Wildlife (now 2.3) to state 'There have been cases of illegal persecution of protected species in the National Park. Such incidences will continue to be addressed by the relevant enforcement agencies with appropriate support from the National Park Authority.' along with a new challenge to state 'Addressing wildlife crime'. | 11 | 47 | Amend Plan |
| 4.4 Moorland Shooting | Natural England | The 2nd policy implies a presumption that new infrastructure will go ahead, but all new proposals should demonstrate no negative impacts. Natural England should be included under the Means to Achieve. | Policy B17 has been amended to state 'New infrastructure for grouse shooting will be supported where it is located and designed to ensure there are no adverse impacts on the landscape and environment'. This is backed up through reference to the Local Development Framework as a Means to Achieve. | 62 | 534 | Amend Plan |
| 4.4 Moorland Shooting | RSPB | Additional challenges should be added in relation to avoiding negative impacts on biodiversity, soils, blanket bog function and water quality from burning, and the need to stop illegal persecution. If tracks are needed for management for grouse shooting, couldn't they also be used to cut the heather? Policies should also be expanded to address these issues. | The second challenge will be amended to state 'Inappropriate burning of the moorland can have wider adverse impacts on air quality, wildlife, cultural heritage, soils and water quality as well as visual impacts.'. | 45 | 285 | Amend Plan |
| 4.4 Moorland Shooting | Natural England | Concerned about intensification of management of grouse moors. Reword the 2nd challenge as it implies that any infrastructure is acceptable provided it is carried out in a sensitive way. All new infrastructure should be assessed in terms of impacts upon biodiversity (especially designated sites), historic environment and enjoyment of the moors. | This challenge has been reworded to state that 'There is likely to be continued pressure for upgrading tracks and other infrastructure. It is important that these changes are carried out only where appropriate and in a sensitive way to maintain the distinctive quality of the National Park's moorland landscape, biodiversity and the natural environment' | 62 | 533 | Amend Plan |

| Part of Plan | Respondent | Summary of Comments | Authority Response | Respondent ID | Response ID | Action needed? |
|-----------------------|--------------------------------------|---|---|---------------|-------------|----------------|
| 4.4 Moorland Shooting | Natural England | The first challenge should also acknowledge other impacts of burning on wildlife, soils and water quality, and visual impacts. | This challenge has been reworded to state 'Inappropriate burning of the moorland can have wider adverse impacts on air quality, wildlife, cultural heritage, soils and water quality as well as visual impacts' and a further challenge to state 'Moorland burning can have localised adverse impacts on air quality'. | 62 | 532 | Amend Plan |
| 4.4 Moorland Shooting | Natural England | In the third paragraph, it is the grouse shooting industry, not the moorlands, which require 45 full time keepers. | This has been amended to read 'Moorland management for grouse shooting requires...' | 62 | 531 | Amend Plan |
| 4.4 Moorland Shooting | RSPB | There should be a clearer description of moorland and reference to the statutory status and conservation needs of protected sites. | This is covered in the Environment chapter, it is not necessary to mention it again. | 45 | 281 | No |
| 4.4 Moorland Shooting | Hartoft Parish Council | Reference to controlling predators could be interpreted as loss of protected species and essential carrion eaters. | A sentence has been included in 2.2 Habitats and Wildlife (now 2.3) to state 'There have been cases of illegal persecution of protected species in the National Park. Such incidences will continue to be tackled by the relevant enforcement agencies with appropriate support from the National Park Authority.', and a challenge will be added to state 'Addressing wildlife crime.' | 51 | 338 | Amend Plan |
| 4.5 Lowland Shooting | Game and Wildlife Conservation Trust | Change reference to the Code of Good Shooting Practice, it was produced by a range of organisations. | The text has been amended to read 'The Code of Good Shooting Practice...includes guidance on...' | 58 | 448 | Amend Plan |
| 4.5 Lowland Shooting | Natural England | Support the 2nd policy, but the 1st policy should be reworded to state 'The lowland shooting industry will be supported only where it brings environmental and economic benefits that support and enhance the special qualities of the National Park.' Natural England should be mentioned in the Means to Achieve. | It is considered that they have broadly the same meaning. Reference has been made to the Game and Wildlife Conservation Trust Guidelines on sustainable Game Bird Release and Shoot Management and other guidance in the Means to Achieve which will help to ensure that there are no negative impacts. | 62 | 536 | Amend Plan |
| 4.5 Lowland Shooting | Natural England | Agree with the summary of lowland shooting, but recently intensification has not been to the benefit of biodiversity or the landscape. Further research to understand the current level of activity would be helpful in monitoring future activities. | The text acknowledges recent inappropriate activity. Further research is identified as an action in the Means to Achieve. | 62 | 535 | No |

| Part of Plan | Respondent | Summary of Comments | Authority Response | Respondent ID | Response ID | Action needed? |
|----------------------|----------------------------|---|---|---------------|-------------|----------------|
| 4.5 Lowland Shooting | RSPB | Concern over the impact on habitats and wildlife of increased numbers of gamebirds released, particularly within SSSIs. Welcome the proposal to commission research into these impacts. | Comment noted. | 45 | 287 | No |
| 4.5 Lowland Shooting | Robert Sword | Supports reference to game shooting providing benefits to the environment and local economy 'provided it does not harm the special qualities of the Park'. Shooting at Danby and Wykeham generates a considerable amount of income which directly benefits the local economy including keepers, beaters, loaders, pickers-up, hotels, vehicle hire/taxis, garages and catering. | The economic benefits of shooting have been recognised in the Plan. | 18 | 80 | No |
| 4.5 Lowland Shooting | Farmoor Services LLP | Reference to the Moorland Association should be removed from the Lowland Shooting section. | Agreed, reference will be removed. | 9 | 38 | Amend Plan |
| 4.5 Lowland Shooting | Hartoft Parish Council | Reference to controlling predators could be interpreted as loss of protected species and essential carrion eaters. | A sentence has been included in 2.2 Habitats and Wildlife (now 2.3) to state 'There have been cases of illegal persecution of protected species in the National Park. Such incidences will continue to be tackled by the relevant enforcement agencies with appropriate support from the National Park Authority.', and a challenge will be added to state 'Addressing wildlife crime.' | 51 | 339 | Amend Plan |
| 4.5 Lowland Shooting | Whorlton Parish Council | Higher populations of pheasants as a result of the shooting industry can lead to damage to crops, particularly potatoes, grains or beans. This is especially important if an increase in crop growing is being encouraged. | Damage to crops is not considered to be a major issue here. | 33 | 168 | No |
| 4.6 Local Businesses | Hambleton District Council | Employment and training in the Park should be expanded, particularly in low carbon knowledge and skills and local sustainable industries and crafts. | Diversifying the rural economy is mentioned in the challenges and there are policies to support employment and training. | 52 | 362 | No |

| Part of Plan | Respondent | Summary of Comments | Authority Response | Respondent ID | Response ID | Action needed? |
|----------------------|--------------------------------|--|---|---------------|-------------|----------------|
| 4.6 Local Businesses | Robert Goodwill MP | The area has traditionally been used for mining. The draft Plan should set out the terms of reference for the likely forthcoming potash application to send out clear signals to the prospective developer as to how any development can fit in with the National Park's objectives. As the potash mine cannot be developed elsewhere it is an important challenge that should be met by the National Park Authority. It may be that the development of communities in the Park could be helped by conditions placed upon the mining company, for example in relation to community facilities or housing provision. Everything possible should be done to ensure that the environmental impact of a new mine is minimised. | Letter sent in reply. Any potash development will need to be considered against the planning policies contained in the Local Development Framework and national policy (particularly the major development test). Early discussions with prospective developers will provide opportunities for setting out if or whether any proposed mine could be accommodated. | 8 | 34 | No |
| 4.6 Local Businesses | Thirlby Parish Meeting | Could the Park develop a strategy to ensure that any benefits from a new potash mine feed into the area in a positive way? Should there be more detail in the Plan? Perhaps the developer could be encouraged to support low energy affordable homes for the potentially vast workforce. | Any proposal for a potash mine would need to be considered against the national Major Development Test, for proposals for major developments in National Parks. There is reference to exploration for potash in the text. | 48 | 298 | No |
| 4.6 Local Businesses | North Yorkshire County Council | Pleased that the Plan recognises the significant economic development and employment opportunities offered by potash and offshore wind. Support the policies to support economic development where it is related to the special qualities of the Park and to increase and maintain employment opportunities available to people in the Park. However, these policies have housing implications which should be considered, the National Park should seek to accommodate this where possible and compatible with maintaining the special qualities of the National Park. | At present a planning application for a potash mine has not been submitted, but any potential mine would need to be considered against the major development test. Prior to this, it is not appropriate to pre-empt any requirements but these would be planned for if the development goes ahead. | 40 | 215 | No |
| 4.6 Local Businesses | Paul Ming | The policy should refer to '...good quality local food...' | This amendment has been made. | 41 | 229 | Amend Plan |
| 4.6 Local Businesses | British Horse Society | The horse industry contributes £7.5 billion to the national economy and around £10 million to the National Park and surrounding area's economy each year. It should therefore be mentioned. | Other sectors are not specifically referred to, but the first sentence in the second paragraph has been amended to state '...indirectly by tourism and recreation...!. | 42 | 231 | Amend Plan |
| 4.6 Local Businesses | Susan Willmington | The most successful business in Littlebeck is Falling Foss Tea Room because it is simple and genuine. | Comment noted. | 11 | 53 | No |

| Part of Plan | Respondent | Summary of Comments | Authority Response | Respondent ID | Response ID | Action needed? |
|----------------------|----------------------------------|---|--|---------------|-------------|----------------|
| 4.6 Local Businesses | Natural England | Reference should be made to increasing the market for locally produced food as it requires a network of retail outlets. | Policy B9 seeks to increase opportunities for the production and sale of locally produced food, which will by implication increase the market. | 62 | 527 | No |
| 4.6 Local Businesses | Hartoft Parish Council | Most small and dispersed communities are too far from the telephone exchange to obtain landline broadband and it is often not financially viable in such places. | The Plan supports Connecting North Yorkshire (which includes NYnet) which seeks 100% broadband coverage across North Yorkshire by 2015. | 51 | 340 | No |
| 4.6 Local Businesses | Whitby Town Council | The expansion of Whitby Business Park should be concentrated on light industrial services and not on expansion of retail outlets. | The Whitby Business Park Area Action Plan is currently being drafted, and will be consulted upon shortly. | 38 | 202 | No |
| 4.6 Local Businesses | Scarborough Borough Council | Welcome the commitment to economic development and the development of the Whitby Business Park Area Action Plan to capitalise on emerging economic opportunities, particularly off-shore wind energy and potash. To bolster this, there should be a specific commitment to the promotion of jobs, skills and training in conjunction with partner organisations and support for low impact business development such as creative, digital and environmental technologies. There should be a commitment to the delivery of rural superfast broadband. The Borough Council's Economic Development team would welcome the opportunity to discuss delivery of this part of the Management Plan. | Policies in the Plan support economic development and training. Reference has been made to constituent councils in the Means to Achieve some of the policies. There is a policy linked to the Connecting North Yorkshire project which aims for 100% of households and businesses in the county to have access to broadband by 2015. | 66 | 562 | Amend Plan |
| 4.6 Local Businesses | Natural England | The first policy should be reworded to state 'Economic development will be supported where it contributes to and enhances the special qualities...' | It is not reasonable for development and activities related to economic development to enhance the special qualities in every instance, this would not be consistent with policies in the Local Development Framework. | 62 | 538 | No |
| 4.6 Local Businesses | Ingleby Arncliffe Parish Council | The National Park must encourage rural businesses, including farming, and increase employment opportunities, maximising the contribution to the national economy. | The Plan aims to support the economy by a range of measures including looking to increase agricultural production, increase allocated employment land, increase training opportunities and improve broadband services. | 34 | 172 | No |
| 4.6 Local Businesses | Whitby Town Council | Concern that employment opportunities for Whitby relating to the Dogger Bank windfarm and the development of potash mining will be affected by the concern about increased commercial traffic travelling through the National Park. Rail links should be re-established to move the potash. | Any proposal for a potash mine will need to be considered against the national Major Development Test, for major development proposals in National Parks. The means of transportation will be determined through the application process. | 38 | 200 | No |

| Part of Plan | Respondent | Summary of Comments | Authority Response | Respondent ID | Response ID | Action needed? |
|-------------------------|--|---|---|---------------|-------------|----------------|
| 4.6 Local Businesses | Natural England | Issues of broadband should be addressed in 5.1 Community Facilities to avoid repetition. | Broadband is considered to be an issue equally for communities and businesses. | 62 | 537 | No |
| 4.6 Local Businesses | Hambleton District Council | Use of the internet should be promoted for the pre-ordering of driven-in goods. | Policies support the roll-out of broadband which would facilitate this. | 52 | 366 | No |
| 4.6 Local Businesses | North Yorkshire County Council | The Plan should refer to 'Connecting North Yorkshire (which includes NYnet)' instead of 'NYnet'. The text should note that 'The vision of Connecting North Yorkshire is to bring the advantages of high quality broadband (i.e. appropriate to people's needs) to 100 percent of businesses and citizens in North Yorkshire by 2017. It is important that businesses have access as this is and will increasingly be an essential requirement for small businesses, particularly those that have a low impact on the National Park environment (e.g. farming and tourism).' | NYnet references have been amended. In the final paragraph before the challenges in 5.1 a brief description of the Connecting North Yorkshire project has been included. | 40 | 216 | Amend Plan |
| 4.7 Fishing | Primary Land Users' Group 18/10/11 | Fishing and management of associated wildlife are crucially important, should best practice be included in the Plan in recognition of achievements made? Should activities such as canoeing be looked at to examine the effect it may have on fish stocks? | This sounds fairly detailed for the Management Plan, and canoeing is not known to be an issue. | 21 | 107 | No |
| Chapter 5 - Communities | Miss T Solesby | Fully support the importance of helping local communities. | Comment noted. | 55 | 409 | No |
| Chapter 5 - Communities | Redcar and Cleveland Strategic Partnership | Most priorities in terms of communities very much align with strategic priorities for Redcar & Cleveland. | Comment noted. | 6 | 27 | No |
| Chapter 5 - Communities | Welcome to Yorkshire | An increase in visitors is also likely to provide many community benefits. | A sentence will be added in to the second paragraph in 5.1 Facilities (now 5.3) to state '...funding. Local facilities are also often supported by tourism, and a declining number of visitors to the National Park may also contribute to the loss of community facilities.' | 49 | 309 | Amend Plan |

| Part of Plan | Respondent | Summary of Comments | Authority Response | Respondent ID | Response ID | Action needed? |
|----------------|--------------------------------|---|--|---------------|-------------|----------------|
| 5.1 Facilities | Robert Goodwill MP | Welcome the aspiration to roll out high speed broadband throughout the National Park. It is vital that mobile phone communication is also available. Where phone signals are not available this can have particular impacts upon health and safety. Many people now rely on smart phones rather than traditional broadband connections. The Plan should look at how mobile phone coverage in the Park can be improved. | Text will be added to the end of the last paragraph to state 'There are significant areas of the National Park which suffer from poor or no mobile phone reception.'. A new policy will be added to state 'Improvements to mobile phone coverage in the Park will be investigated.', with the Means to Achieve the National programme to improve mobile phone coverage. | 8 | 31 | Amend Plan |
| 5.1 Facilities | North Yorkshire County Council | Reference should be made to 'Connecting North Yorkshire (which includes NYnet)' instead of 'NYnet'. The target should state 'To bring the advantages of high-quality broadband (i.e. appropriate to people's needs) to 100 percent of businesses and citizens in North Yorkshire by 2017' to be in line with the vision of Connecting North Yorkshire. | References to NYnet have been amended. Reference to businesses has been added to the target, but it is not appropriate to copy this directly as it refers to the whole of North Yorkshire. | 40 | 218 | Amend Plan |
| 5.1 Facilities | Comments from Parish Forums | There is poor mobile reception across the Park, particularly in Rosedale. | Text has been added to the end of the last paragraph to state 'There are significant areas of the National Park which suffer from poor or no mobile phone reception.'. A new policy has been added to state 'Improvements to mobile phone coverage in the Park will be investigated.', with the Means to Achieve the national programme to improve mobile phone coverage which North Yorkshire County Council are involved in. | 56 | 410 | Amend Plan |
| 5.1 Facilities | North Yorkshire County Council | Welcome the policy that states that 'the loss of existing facilities in villages including commercial premises such as pubs and shops will be resisted', although it is not clear how this will be delivered through the Local Development Framework. One mechanism is concentrating new development in existing settlements. The Management Plan should consider wider mechanisms such as working with local communities and businesses to involve them in awareness raising opportunities such as local events or through the provisions for 'assets of community value' in the Localism Act. | This can be delivered through the Local Development Framework by refusing planning permission for change of use / conversion of community facilities. Text has been added to state that 'The Localism Act introduces powers for local communities to identify assets of community value, which would provide the community with possible further opportunities to purchase these in the future.' | 40 | 217 | Amend Plan |
| 5.1 Facilities | Hartoft Parish Council | The decline in facilities is a result of new residents who often shop in larger towns and cities or via the internet. | Comment Noted. Policies in the Local Development Framework seek to protect community facilities. | 51 | 341 | No |

| Part of Plan | Respondent | Summary of Comments | Authority Response | Respondent ID | Response ID | Action needed? |
|---------------------------------|--------------------------------------|---|---|---------------|-------------|----------------|
| 5.1 Facilities | Natural England | Maintaining facilities is closely linked to reducing transport generated problems and an integrated approach to addressing both issues should be more clearly set out. | Reference has been made in the background text to the transport implications of loss of services. The challenges and the policies aim to retain facilities, and the policies of 5.3 Transport (now 5.5) support the provision of local community transport initiatives. Reference has been included in the first challenge of Transport to the issue potentially increasing as further facilities are lost by stating '...households and the young. This issue may become more widespread if more local facilities and services close.' | 62 | 539 | Amend Plan |
| 5.1 Facilities | Comments at Robin Hood's Bay 3/12/11 | The National Park Authority should encourage local councils to support communities. | Local councils support local communities through a range of services and through the Local Strategic Partnerships. | 19 | 84 | No |
| 5.1 Facilities | Ingleby Arncliffe Parish Council | The provision of new facilities including broadband, should be supported, but the the loss of commercial and relaxation facilities should be resisted. | These aims form the basis of the two policies in this section. Policies in the Local Development Framework aim to resist the loss of such facilities. | 34 | 173 | No |
| 5.1 Facilities | Susan Willmington | There is a redundant village hall in Littlebeck. | The Plan recognises that facilities may need to be provided in different ways in the future and this may see unused community buildings being put back into use. The Localism Act also includes measures for communities to be able to make use of important community assets. | 11 | 52 | No |
| 5.1 Facilities | Hambleton District Council | Support / encourage the provision of local vegetable / produce box schemes and/or 'corner shop vans' to provide local shopping services. Support the diversification of shops / pubs and community run schemes. Develop the few farmers' co-ops and community agriculture schemes with the aid of the local Transition Towns group. | The 2nd policy supports provision of community facilities in new and innovative ways. These details are not appropriate for the Management Plan. Policy B9 which aims to encourage local food markets is included in 4.2 Agriculture. | 52 | 365 | No |
| 5.2 Housing and New Development | Comments at Robin Hood's Bay 3/12/11 | Concerned about the landscape impact of any proposed potash development. Concerned about the amount of new development (house building and conversions). | Any potash development will need to be considered against the planning policies contained in the Local Development Framework and national policy (particularly the major development test). Comments about the amount of new development are noted, housebuilding in the Park is restricted compared to places outside the Park and most is for affordable or local needs housing. The Management Plan reinforces planning policies by aiming for new development to be of a high quality. | 19 | 81 | No |

| Part of Plan | Respondent | Summary of Comments | Authority Response | Respondent ID | Response ID | Action needed? |
|---------------------------------|-----------------------------------|---|--|---------------|-------------|----------------|
| 5.2 Housing and New Development | Comments at Moors Centre 27/11/11 | Need to provide more affordable housing. | The Plan contains a target to build at least 75 affordable homes by 2017. | 15 | 64 | No |
| 5.2 Housing and New Development | Scarborough Borough Council | Concern over the intention to deliver 10 affordable homes each year. The recent Strategic Housing Market Assessment for North Yorkshire identified an annual need for 50 affordable dwellings in the Scarborough Borough part of the National Park. With reduced public funding for affordable housing developments the National Park Authority may need to explore other ways of delivering affordable housing which may require a review of housing policy contained within the National Park Authority's Local Development Framework. The Management Plan could set the scene for further work and co-operation between the Authority and the Borough Council. | Whilst the annual need for 50 (actual number in the report is 92) homes per year in the Scarborough Borough part of the Park is acknowledged, and whilst in recent years the target of 10 per year has been exceeded, it is considered that with reducing levels of public funding available for affordable housing in future years it may be difficult to maintain a higher target through these means alone. However, the Authority's Local Development Framework allows for open market housing developments in the Local Service Villages and the Local Service Centre of Helmsley on the basis that a proportion (50%) of the units developed will be affordable housing. The proportion required is currently under review. Based upon past completion rates, the target for affordable housing has been increased to 'At least 75 built by 2017'. | 66 | 564 | Amend Plan |
| 5.2 Housing and New Development | Newby and Scalby Parish Council | There is a need for more effective enforcement of unauthorised development. | The Management Plan aims to ensure that new development is of a high quality, but it is not appropriate to address issues of enforcement specifically which are dealt with through the Authority's enforcement remit. | 39 | 205 | No |
| 5.2 Housing and New Development | Robert Sword | Perhaps if the planning policies were relaxed there might be more residential conversions and building which would provide more homes without the need to create a false market leading to the need for affordable homes. Providing housing for retired farmers is becoming more pressing, this could be achieved by converting barns for residential use (there is an example at Butterwitts Farm, Little Fryup, which provides a house for the family as well as a B&B). | Relaxing planning policies to the extent that housing would decrease in value to a price that those in need of affordable housing could afford would only be achieved by causing significant harm to the environment and landscape thus making the Park a less attractive place to live, contrary to National Park purposes. As well as affordable housing, policies allow the conversion of traditional rural buildings for residential letting for local needs, local needs housing on infill sites in villages and annex accommodation which can all help to meet local needs for housing. | 18 | 79 | No |
| 5.2 Housing and New Development | Michael Richardson | Hope that the plan for more affordable homes allows for the properties to be built in a non-sensitive area. | The Local Development Framework contains planning policies which aim to ensure that new affordable housing development is built within or adjacent to existing villages. | 4 | 12 | No |

| Part of Plan | Respondent | Summary of Comments | Authority Response | Respondent ID | Response ID | Action needed? |
|---------------------------------|---|--|---|---------------|-------------|----------------|
| 5.2 Housing and New Development | Whitby Town Council | The lack of green space in Whitby means that all brownfield sites must be used for housing. Innovative uses of unused agricultural buildings within the National Park would be sufficient to meet the Park's housing needs but encouragement should be given to owners. Due to high demand from the National Park and as a seaside resort Whitby needs the protection of local occupancy and affordable housing clauses and the support of the National Park to obtain that. The Town Council commend the policy of the National Park Authority on issues of local occupancy and affordable housing. | Comment noted. The Management Plan continues support for affordable housing and local occupancy developments in the National Park. New development in Whitby is the responsibility of Scarborough Borough Council who do not adopt this approach at present. | 38 | 203 | No |
| 5.2 Housing and New Development | Ryedale District Council (Forward Planning) | The Helmsley DPD is an important framework for managing the development of Helmsley over the next 16 years and therefore greater reference should be made to its role and status. | A new paragraph will be added at the end of the text (now 5.4) to state 'The Authority's Local Development Framework contains the strategic and development management policies for the National Park. The Authority has also produced a number of Supplementary Planning Documents covering design, housing and renewable energy and is currently producing a Helmsley Plan jointly with Ryedale District Council and a plan for Whitby Business Park jointly with Scarborough Borough Council.' | 10 | 44 | Amend Plan |
| 5.2 Housing and New Development | Oswaldkirk Parish Meeting | There is no indication as to whether building 10 more affordable homes each year will meet the overall policy. | This shows how progress is made towards the first policy which aims to deliver more affordable housing. This target has been exceeded in recent years and has therefore been revised upwards in the final Plan to at least 75 by 2017. | 44 | 247 | No |
| 5.2 Housing and New Development | Comments at Sutton Bank 4/12/11 | The landscape, moorland and villages need to be kept looking as they are now. | Policy aims to ensure that all new development will be of a high quality and the special qualities of the Park are conserved and enhanced. | 16 | 70 | No |
| 5.2 Housing and New Development | Comments at Sutton Bank 11/12/11 | Holiday homes would destroy communities. | Planning policies in the Local Development Framework aim to ensure that new houses are occupied by people with a local need. It is not possible to control existing houses being bought and used as holiday homes. | 25 | 129 | No |

| Part of Plan | Respondent | Summary of Comments | Authority Response | Respondent ID | Response ID | Action needed? |
|---------------------------------|---|---|--|---------------|-------------|----------------|
| 5.2 Housing and New Development | Hambleton District Council | The issue of second homes needs to be addressed as this leads to the need for more houses to be built. Local occupancy clauses should be in place for any new affordable homes built. Co-ordinate with District Councils on second home Council Tax penalties. Encourage ways of using visitor accommodation more efficiently such as timeshares, use of second homes as guest houses. Encourage more temporary accommodation options such as tent only camping, tepees and log cabins that are well insulated. | All new housing outside of the largest settlements is local occupancy or affordable. Affordable homes are restricted to local occupancy. The Local Development Framework supports camping etc in woodland areas. The District Councils are responsible for Council Tax, it is not clear how the involvement of the National Park Authority would assist in this. | 52 | 386 | No |
| 5.2 Housing and New Development | Age UK (Scarborough) | Many properties which elderly people live in are in need of a heating upgrade, is any thought being given to support for insulation? Is there sufficient housing in the Park to cater for older people's needs as they become frailer. Support anything to develop the Park provided it does not spoil it. | Section 5.4 Energy (now 5.5) encourages use of insulation, albeit from a climate change angle rather than a housing angle. Planning policies contained in the Local Development Framework will ensure that new development is of high quality design and in an appropriate location, and housing needs surveys help in making sure that the housing needs of older people are met. | 12 | 57 | No |
| 5.2 Housing and New Development | Susan Willmington | Dalby Forest Visitor Centre is a beautiful building. Design policy should be based on the history of each valley, including long houses and sliding sash windows and a stop to plastic windows. | The Design Guide Supplementary Planning Document sets out the principles including form of buildings and window design to respect local vernacular. Article 4 Directions have been put in place in most Conservation Areas in the Park to control the change of features including windows. | 11 | 55 | No |
| 5.2 Housing and New Development | Ingleby Arncliffe Parish Council | Limited new housing should be supported. | The Plan supports the development of affordable housing. The Local Development Framework contains the detailed planning policies in relation to housing and supports affordable housing on exception sites and infill developments of one house for local occupancy, with open market housing only in the larger Service Villages and the Local Service Centre of Helmsley. | 34 | 174 | No |
| 5.2 Housing and New Development | Ryedale District Council (Forward Planning) | The Council notes and supports liaison with the National Park regarding the assessment of the impact of development on the setting of the National Park. | Support noted. | 10 | 41 | No |

| Part of Plan | Respondent | Summary of Comments | Authority Response | Respondent ID | Response ID | Action needed? |
|---------------------------------|-----------------------------------|--|--|---------------|-------------|----------------|
| 5.2 Housing and New Development | Robert Goodwill MP | Second homes and holiday homes have removed many more properties from the housing stock than the 48 affordable homes that have been built. Much more needs to be done to provide affordable housing for local people who live and work in the area, particularly to enable people to buy rather than rent. There are also problems with people not being able to obtain mortgages for houses with covenants on them. | Separate response sent. The Plan reflects the policies of the Local Development Framework which generally supports affordable housing / housing to meet local needs rather than open market housing, but recognises that this can only be achieved on a scale consistent with conserving the environment of the Park. Difficulties with mortgage lending for specific affordable housing schemes in the Park have been addressed. | 8 | 33 | No |
| 5.2 Housing and New Development | Buglife | More housing will increase the demand for water. | It is not considered that ten houses per year would have an impact on water supply. The Core Strategy and Development Policies anticipates that around 26 houses per year would be completed in the National Park and this was not judged to have any implications for water supply. | 2 | 6 | No |
| 5.2 Housing and New Development | Comments at Moors Centre 27/11/11 | Planning should ensure that the Park generally stays as it is. | There is a policy in 5.2 Housing and New Development (now 5.4) which states that new development should be of a high quality design. Planning policies contained within the Local Development Framework ensure that development is of a high quality and is generally focussed on existing villages and that the landscape and special qualities of the Park are conserved and enhanced. | 15 | 65 | No |
| 5.2 Housing and New Development | Susan Willmington | Holiday cottages and second homes are destroying local areas, there are only 3 homes occupied full time in Littlebeck. These holiday makers bring food in from supermarkets outside the Park, holiday makers should put something back in to the local community. | Use as a second home cannot be controlled, but the Plan does seek to continue to increase provision of affordable housing in the Park. The local businesses and agriculture sections of the Management Plan aim to increase the sale of locally produced food. | 11 | 51 | No |
| 5.2 Housing and New Development | Comments at Moors Centre 27/11/11 | Planning requirements often end up costing the developer a lot more, not sure if the benefits outweigh the cost. | It is important for development to be designed to a high standard as, especially cumulatively, it may otherwise harm the National Park's landscape / built heritage. | 15 | 61 | No |
| 5.2 Housing and New Development | Hambleton District Council | By 2030 (or before) new and existing homes should all be able to meet their needs within local environmental limits in terms of food, water, energy and natural resources. | The Core Strategy and Development Policies, and associated Design Guide Supplementary Planning Document, aims to ensure that sustainable design and construction techniques are used, and that developments of 5 or more houses or other uses of over 200sqm must offset 10% of their predicted CO2 emissions through the use of renewable energy. It is difficult to apply to existing properties and it is unclear how local environmental limits would be defined. Any changes to this policy would need to be carried out as part of any future review of the Core Strategy. | 52 | 388 | No |

| Part of Plan | Respondent | Summary of Comments | Authority Response | Respondent ID | Response ID | Action needed? |
|---------------------------------|--|--|---|---------------|-------------|----------------|
| 5.2 Housing and New Development | Hartoft Parish Council | The policy requiring development to be of a high quality design may hinder them in being affordable. | Experience to date has shown that this is not the case. A number of affordable housing developments have been built / permitted which meet the same high design standards as other developments. | 51 | 343 | No |
| 5.2 Housing and New Development | Hartoft Parish Council | In the 1st paragraph, 'sustainable development' conflicts with 'conservation'. | Development can take place in a way which conserves the Park's environment and is sustainable, for example the Local Development Framework focusses most new development in existing settlements. | 51 | 342 | No |
| 5.2 Housing and New Development | Linda Grout | Castleton is not identified as a Service Village although it has a range of services and facilities (list provided). Apart from Guisborough, the other villages identified as Service Villages probably do not have as many facilities as Castleton. | The Management Plan is not a 'planning' document and is not reviewing the settlement hierarchy which is set out in the Core Strategy and Development Policies. Service Villages were identified as part of the development of the Core Strategy and Development Policies not only based upon the services and facilities they have but also on public transport links and their relationship to wider areas beyond the National Park. | 31 | 163 | No |
| 5.3 Transport | Hambleton District Council | Car clubs should be set up in key towns for tourists and residents, and encourage the use of electric vehicles charged by renewable energy. | This is too detailed for the Management Plan. | 52 | 377 | No |
| 5.3 Transport | Esk Valley Railway Development Company | Whilst car ownership is high within the Park, outside levels can be low including 41% in Middlesbrough and 40% in Whitby not having access to a private car. Staying visitors prefer to use public transport once they have arrived at their destination. The 'AB' visitor profile, the predominant visitor to the Park, seeks to use sustainable transport. Recent reductions in bus services will reduce travel options for visitors and residents. It is therefore essential to improve and promote rail links to benefit the local economy, reduce congestion, improve health and safety, increase accessibility and support the increasingly ageing population. The community rail line from Whitby to Middlesbrough should be included as part of any strategic transport plan for the Park, and would benefit from community support. | Policy C12 supports local community transport projects, which may include rail based initiatives. A sentence has been included in the text to recognise that communities just outside the Park have far lower levels of car ownership at the end of the second paragraph 'Conversely, some urban communities just outside the National Park have far lower levels of car ownership.'. A sentence will be added to the end of the third paragraph to state 'The Esk Valley Railway provides a service between Middlesbrough and Whitby, connecting the villages in between.' The second policy provides support for non-car travel, which would include rail travel. | 64 | 542 | Amend Plan |
| 5.3 Transport | Comments at Moors Centre 13/11/11 | Disappointed at the loss of Moorsbus. | Comment noted. Moorsbus is to be replaced with targeted transport schemes. | 63 | 541 | No |

| Part of Plan | Respondent | Summary of Comments | Authority Response | Respondent ID | Response ID | Action needed? |
|---------------|----------------------------|---|---|---------------|-------------|----------------|
| 5.3 Transport | Hambleton District Council | In sensitive areas restrictions should be placed on parking other than in designated car parks. | This has been done in places such as at Sheepwash. | 52 | 371 | No |
| 5.3 Transport | Hambleton District Council | Allow bikes to be carried on the back of buses. | This has been tried in the past but it was unsuccessful. This is too detailed for the Management Plan. | 52 | 374 | No |
| 5.3 Transport | B E Vyner | Unless the National Park Authority works with adjoining councils there will be 'suburbanisation' though 'improved' roads etc. | There is a policy which states that 'The visual and environmental impacts of highway improvements and new or replacement infrastructure will be minimised.' As the Plan is for the Park, not for the Authority, Local Transport Plans (prepared by North Yorkshire County Council and Redcar and Cleveland Borough Council) have been identified as one of the means to achieve. The National Park Authority works closely with the Highways Authorities. | 26 | 140 | No |
| 5.3 Transport | British Horse Society | The term 'footpaths' should be replaced with 'rights of way'. They are used for work, exercising horses and recreation. | Amendments to refer to 'rights of way' have been made throughout the Plan. | 42 | 238 | Amend Plan |
| 5.3 Transport | Hambleton District Council | Minimise use of salt on the roads for winter maintenance as it kills roadside vegetation and pollutes rivers. | The National Park Authority are liaising with North Yorkshire County Council to address this issue. | 52 | 379 | No |
| 5.3 Transport | Local Access Forum 6/12/11 | Other Parks have better road and rail links - do accidents and congestion on the A64 put people off coming to the Park? | There is no evidence available that would suggest that this is the case. | 20 | 98 | No |
| 5.3 Transport | Hambleton District Council | Consider imposing road tolls beyond bus pick-up points. This could be used for road or verge maintenance or improving public transport. | This is likely to detract visitors from coming, would undermine the principles of National Parks' second purpose and potentially displace their car mileage to elsewhere. | 52 | 370 | No |
| 5.3 Transport | Hambleton District Council | New or replacement roads should be built to emphasise that wildlife and sheep have priority. | There are signs in place to warn drivers of sheep. It is unlikely that any major new roads will be built. | 52 | 378 | No |

| Part of Plan | Respondent | Summary of Comments | Authority Response | Respondent ID | Response ID | Action needed? |
|---------------|----------------------------|--|--|---------------|-------------|----------------|
| 5.3 Transport | Hambleton District Council | Moorsbus should be developed and promoted, including timetabling and ticketing from major train stations and population centres surrounding the Park. Timetables should be available in all visitor accommodation. Consider Park & Ride schemes from the main Moorsbus pick-up points. | Moorsbus is to be replaced with targeted transport schemes and initiatives. | 52 | 368 | No |
| 5.3 Transport | Hambleton District Council | Low carbon travel options should be a tourist attraction such as more steam trains and historic buses. Perhaps based on the Yorkshire Dales' Little Red Bus. Special steam trains could help to attract tourists in the shoulder seasons. | This is too detailed for the Management Plan. The North Yorkshire Moors Railway is mentioned in 3.2 Recreation and Access (now Enjoying the Park). A historic bus service was trialled between the Moors Centre and Whitby but was not sufficiently used. | 52 | 376 | No |
| 5.3 Transport | Hambleton District Council | Encourage tourist attractions to re-order the 'how to get here' part of their leaflets to include public transport information first, and to offer well-publicised discounts for those who do not travel by car. | This is too detailed for the Management Plan but the comment will be considered as part of the Authority's spending on transport. This is to be addressed through the bid to the Local Sustainable Transport Fund which includes the proposal for an Esk Valley Smart Card which would offer discounts on various modes of transport and shop discounts. | 52 | 375 | No |
| 5.3 Transport | Hambleton District Council | Provide on-road pony trap rides and off-road pony hacking from key tourist centres so that car travel is not needed. | This is too detailed for the Management Plan. | 52 | 373 | No |
| 5.3 Transport | Age UK (Scarborough) | Concern over how the elderly/vulnerable can access local services, appointments etc. Many rely on volunteers in the Esk Valley. | The first policy supports local community transport projects which will be taken forward via the Transport Strategy and the Local Sustainable Transport Fund. | 12 | 56 | No |
| 5.3 Transport | Natural England | The Transport Plan should help and encourage people who have never visited the Park before. | This will be addressed in the Promoting the Park Strategy and through the National Park Authority's future spending on transport. | 62 | 545 | No |
| 5.3 Transport | Hartoft Parish Council | Community volunteer transport schemes cost less per trip than taxis but more per trip than private transport. | Comment noted. Where there is no public transport community transport may be the best option for those who don't own a car. The first policy supports local community transport projects. | 51 | 345 | No |
| 5.3 Transport | Thirlby Parish Meeting | Vehicle counts are not an adequate indicator. The transport strategy should establish a fuller set of indicators. | Vehicles counts will help to measure progress broadly against many of the policies which aim to reduce car use. | 48 | 552 | No |

| Part of Plan | Respondent | Summary of Comments | Authority Response | Respondent ID | Response ID | Action needed? |
|---------------|----------------------------|---|--|---------------|-------------|----------------|
| 5.3 Transport | Welcome to Yorkshire | Good that the role of visitor travel is considered. Tourism can provide a complementary role such as using off-peak capacity or contribute to the viability of local transport services. An additional challenge is the cost of fuel. Research shows that 35% of British travellers were deterred from taking a domestic holiday in 2011 due to fuel prices and were more likely to go abroad. | A new challenge has been added to 4.1 Tourism to state 'Rising costs of transport and competing with other destinations.' | 49 | 310 | Amend Plan |
| 5.3 Transport | Hartoft Parish Council | The majority of policies could only be achieved with public subsidies. | The Means to Achieve recognises and reflects the role of the public sector. | 51 | 346 | No |
| 5.3 Transport | Hambleton District Council | The Plan should be stronger on discouraging car travel in the Park. It should seek to maximise the number of people walking, cycling or travelling by bus or train and minimise vehicle movements in the Park to reduce carbon emissions and protect the Park's environment and air quality. | The policies encourage alternatives to the car. | 52 | 367 | No |
| 5.3 Transport | Hambleton District Council | Promote car sharing via the Liftshare scheme. | This is too detailed for the Management Plan. The first policy supports local community transport projects, which could include car sharing schemes. | 52 | 369 | No |
| 5.3 Transport | Peter Woods | The railway to Boulby mine has the potential to bring people into the Park from Teesside and East Cleveland. A terminus and / or Park and Ride facility at Boulby could also incorporate an information centre. | This is too detailed for the Management Plan but the comment will be considered as part of the Authority's spending on transport. | 28 | 150 | No |
| 5.3 Transport | Whitby Town Council | All road and rail traffic must come through the Park to access Whitby, and many residents will travel through the Park to access employment. There are concerns over the withdrawal of Moorsbus, especially as this was linked into the Whitby Park and Ride service which may not go ahead. The Esk Valley Railway should be improved to provide a commuter service and better access to facilities. The Malton to Pickering rail line should be re-established. Steam trains could provide a better service to residents if allowed to drop passengers in Sleights and Ruswarp. | Moorsbus is to be replaced with targeted transport schemes. Esk Valley Railway are working to get better commuter services. A bid is being made to the Local Sustainable Transport Fund to extend the Sunday service to all year round. The Malton to Pickering 'rail line' would not be in the National Park. | 38 | 204 | No |
| 5.3 Transport | Sport England | The Plan should acknowledge the positive role of the motor vehicle in increasing participation in sports and recreation. | This section acknowledges that use of the car is important, not just for sport but for many activities. | 46 | 293 | No |

| Part of Plan | Respondent | Summary of Comments | Authority Response | Respondent ID | Response ID | Action needed? |
|---------------|--------------------------------|---|---|---------------|-------------|----------------|
| 5.3 Transport | Michael Richardson | The withdrawal of Moorsbus at the end of next year is very unfortunate, and may discourage some tourists from visiting, although I understand the financial constraints. I cannot say that I have ever seen quoted the cost of the bus, either in past years or in 2011 when it ran a very much reduced service. | The public subsidy cost for Moorsbus was £226,633 for 2009 and £212,637 for 2010. Figures for 2011 are yet to be published. | 4 | 14 | No |
| 5.3 Transport | Susan Willmington | Public transport in the Park is terrible, Moorsbus is not convenient for getting to and from work. A postbus service, based on the existing journeys made by post office vans, should be investigated. | Moorsbus is a service for tourists and visitors and is not intended to be a commuting service. The first policy supports local community transport projects, to be taken forward by a Transport Strategy and the Local Sustainable Transport Fund. | 11 | 50 | No |
| 5.3 Transport | Michael Richardson | With regard to the very unpopular car park charge machines, I understand the income generated, but they do encourage "a park anywhere attitude". For those of us who live near the park and use the car parks whilst out walking, would it not be possible for an Annual Pass to be made available at a reasonable price? | An Annual Pass is available, details have been forwarded to the respondent. | 4 | 15 | No |
| 5.3 Transport | Hartoft Parish Council | 'Low income households', who often work the land, are moving out of the moors often due to lack of transport. Those who move in usually use private transport. Public transport is not viable unless subsidised. | The Plan recognises the importance of local community transport projects to help to address this issue. | 51 | 344 | No |
| 5.3 Transport | North Yorkshire County Council | The Plan could place more emphasis on the North Yorkshire Moors Railway, in particular encouraging greater integration with other forms of transport to strengthen the tourism offer of the Park as well as providing an alternative to the car. | To increase emphasis on integration the second challenge has been amended to state 'Operating integrated, efficient and equitable...'. The second policy has been amended to state '...around the National Park in a more sustainable and integrated way.' | 40 | 219 | Amend Plan |
| 5.4 Energy | Hambleton District Council | Support small scale domestic and farm wind turbines where they do not harm the landscape by locating with buildings in remote, high, windy locations. | Noted, this is broadly in line with the Local Development Framework which aims to ensure that turbines are well related to buildings. | 52 | 380 | No |
| 5.4 Energy | Hambleton District Council | New homes should be built to the highest possible energy standards and produce their own renewable energy. By 2030 100% of a new home's energy should be provided locally (community or building integrated renewables). | The Local Development Framework requires 10% of predicted CO2 emissions for developments of 5 or more houses or other uses of 200sqm or more to be offset through renewable energy, any further requirements will be considered through future reviews of the Core Strategy and Development Policies. | 52 | 384 | No |

| Part of Plan | Respondent | Summary of Comments | Authority Response | Respondent ID | Response ID | Action needed? |
|--------------|----------------------------|--|---|---------------|-------------|----------------|
| 5.4 Energy | Hambleton District Council | Research and training should take place on low carbon building and retrofitting techniques. | It is understood that this is being done through various other means. This will come about from promoting renewable energy. | 52 | 385 | No |
| 5.4 Energy | Paul Ming | There are various problems with wind power including wind damage, lower output than predicted and variability of output requiring conventional power stations to be on standby. Small scale production such as the Esk hydro scheme helps to mitigate the use of conventional power stations. Nuclear power seems to be the best solution. | The Plan suggests that woodfuel may be particularly appropriate for the National Park, but that a role may exist for all forms including small scale wind turbines. Government planning policy advises against ruling out specific forms of renewable energy. | 41 | 230 | No |
| 5.4 Energy | Hambleton District Council | Promote the District Council Business Waste Handbooks and Business Resource Efficiency help from CO2Sense Yorkshire to all businesses, particularly tourism businesses so that visitors can also help to minimise the impact of tourism on the Park. | A new policy has been added to 4.1 Tourism which states 'Tourism businesses will reduce their impact on the environment and use resources efficiently.' The Means to Achieve refers to the national Green Tourism Business Scheme. Business Waste Handbooks have been referred to in 5.7 Waste Management. | 52 | 387 | No |
| 5.4 Energy | Hambleton District Council | Energy efficiency and renewable energy should be linked as a solution to high levels of fuel poverty in the Park. There should be more focus on fuel poverty - oil prices are likely to continue to rise and residents may leave the Park. | A new paragraph has been added in to state 'As well as resulting in emissions of greenhouse gases, energy use also has a financial cost to the consumer. In 2009, between 20 and 30% of households in the National Park were in fuel poverty (footnote - Based on Department of Energy and Climate Change statistics for Hambleton District, Redcar and Cleveland Borough, Ryedale District and Scarborough Borough Councils, 2009.)'. The first sentence of the following paragraph has been amended to read '...from sustainable sources will help to address issues of fuel poverty and help to offset some of...' | 52 | 382 | Amend Plan |
| 5.4 Energy | Natural England | Supports the promotion of less intrusive renewable energy technologies such as ground source heat pumps. PV panels should be promoted with caution and measures should be established within the spatial plan to provide appropriate control over all technologies to ensure National Park purposes are met. Less visually prominent coloured PV sheeting materials are now available which may be appropriate for agricultural buildings. | Reference is made to the Local Development Framework in the Means to Achieve which ensures that renewable energy developments are appropriate within the context of the National Park. | 62 | 540 | No |
| 5.4 Energy | Welcome to Yorkshire | The Welcome to Yorkshire tool for tourism businesses to reduce their energy use should be promoted. | This is too detailed for the Management Plan, but the policy C18 has been amended to state 'residents, visitors and businesses...' | 49 | 311 | Amend Plan |

| Part of Plan | Respondent | Summary of Comments | Authority Response | Respondent ID | Response ID | Action needed? |
|--------------|----------------------------|--|---|---------------|-------------|----------------|
| 5.4 Energy | Thirlby Parish Meeting | Transfer to alternative forms of energy may not be feasible without replacing the whole heating system in many properties. More emphasis should be given to energy conservation in older homes. Householders should be informed about the alternatives. Modern building techniques and high efficiency energy sources should be encouraged in new homes and renovations. Aspects of minergy houses could be incorporated such as positioning of windows and use of double or triple glazing. | This is acknowledged, this section looks at what the Park can accommodate in terms of impact upon the special qualities. The Plan aims to increase use of energy efficiency measures. The Local Development Framework requires new building to be sustainable and minimise energy use, and developments of 5 or more houses or 200sqm or more of the uses must offset 10% of their predicted CO2 emission through renewable energy. Some 'minergy' house principles are incorporated in the Design Guide Supplementary Planning Document. | 48 | 297 | No |
| 5.4 Energy | Whorlton Parish Council | Wind power is unlikely to make much of a contribution unless restrictions in the Renewable Energy Supplementary Planning Document are relaxed. These restrictions mean that few locations will be commercially viable. | The Plan recognises that wind turbines in particular can have an impact on the landscape, and therefore suggests that, whilst there is a role for wind, other forms of renewable energy generation may make more of a significant contribution for the Park such as the use of wood pellet boilers and heat pumps. Planning permission for small scale wind turbines has been granted where these are appropriate to the National Park, and these contribute towards the farm or building's energy use. | 33 | 166 | No |
| 5.4 Energy | Hambleton District Council | Consider turning off most streetlights at times of the night when most people do not use them. | North Yorkshire Local Transport Plan 3 looks to use more energy efficient bulbs in streetlights which also result in lower levels of light pollution. | 52 | 381 | No |
| 5.4 Energy | Hartoft Parish Council | The energy cost of transporting biomass is about three times that of coal, and releases about 20% more CO2 on combustion. | The Plan aims to develop local wood fuel markets which would minimise transport costs (as well providing benefits to the local economy). | 51 | 349 | No |
| 5.4 Energy | Hartoft Parish Council | It is impossible to audit CO2 offsetting claims reliably. | The Plan aims to provide an indication of what is needed to offset CO2 emissions, based upon figures from the Energy Saving Trust. | 51 | 350 | No |
| 5.4 Energy | Oswaldkirk Parish Meeting | Shouldn't there be reference to the size of decrease in CO2 emissions (used as an example of where monitoring is considered to be too vague). | No specific targets are set in relation to a reduction in CO2 emissions as there are a huge number of factors which can affect CO2 emissions, and also it is not certain exactly when the data will be produced again. It is not data that the Authority is able to collect itself. | 44 | 246 | No |

| Part of Plan | Respondent | Summary of Comments | Authority Response | Respondent ID | Response ID | Action needed? |
|--------------|------------------------|---|--|---------------|-------------|----------------|
| 5.4 Energy | Hartoft Parish Council | If the CO2 output of the National Park is 490,000 tonnes then 1.3 million PV panels would be needed to offset this. | CO2 emissions which can be attributed to the Park are 396kt, which would require over 500,000 solar panels, using Energy Saving Trust data. | 51 | 347 | No |
| 5.4 Energy | Hartoft Parish Council | Ground source heat pumps, solar water heating and hydro electricity are all very good systems, but why limit hydro to farms? | It is not limited to farms, these are suggestions as to what could be done but it is acknowledged that most of the suitable watercourses for small scale hydro are on farmland although there will be other opportunities and locations. This has been made clearer through amending the final bullet point to say 'Small scale hydropower plants on some watercourses, many of which are associated with farms.' | 51 | 353 | Amend Plan |
| 5.4 Energy | Hartoft Parish Council | Clarify what size small scale wind generators are. | The Local Development Framework supports wind turbines where they relate well to existing buildings, rather than stand alone wind farms. The detail is contained within the Renewable Energy Supplementary Planning Document. | 51 | 352 | No |
| 5.4 Energy | Hartoft Parish Council | Doing something to address a problem will often make it worse. | Comment noted. | 51 | 351 | No |
| 5.4 Energy | Miss T Solesby | Concern over increases in numbers of wind farms and solar panels which would seriously damage the environment and are becoming outdated nationally. | The Local Development Framework supports wind turbines where they relate well to existing buildings, rather than stand alone wind farms. Many solar panels do not require planning permission following amendments to the national General Permitted Development Order. The Plan suggests that whilst there is some role for these, focussing upon wood fuel options could help to meet a range of objectives. | 55 | 405 | No |
| 5.4 Energy | Hartoft Parish Council | Domestic renewable energy schemes are capital intensive and revenue costs are often not explained / revealed. Now that subsidies are being reduced such schemes are becoming less attractive. | A sentence has been added after the final paragraph to state 'Many small scale renewable energy installations now benefit from Permitted Development rights, meaning that they do not require planning permission. Take up of renewable energy is often driven by subsidies, and therefore future funding schemes are likely to largely dictate the amount and type of renewable energy that comes forward in the Park.' | 51 | 348 | Amend Plan |

| Part of Plan | Respondent | Summary of Comments | Authority Response | Respondent ID | Response ID | Action needed? |
|----------------------|-----------------------------|---|--|---------------|-------------|----------------|
| 5.4 Energy | Hambleton District Council | Larger community renewables should be promoted, particularly hydro schemes on fast flowing rivers and biogas schemes which might address problems of methane release and lack of gas supplies. | The policies in the Management Plan and in the Local Development Framework support these where appropriate to the National Park. | 52 | 383 | No |
| 5.4 Energy | Comments from Parish Forums | Query what scale of wind turbines are appropriate in the Park, it is noticeable that there are proposals for large scale turbines just beyond the boundary. | The Renewable Energy Supplementary Planning Document contains criteria referring to the scale and location in relation to surrounding buildings and structures. The National Park Authority is consulted on large scale developments near to the Park's boundary. | 56 | 414 | No |
| 5.5 Waste Management | Environment Agency | The Local Development Framework should be referred to in the Means to Achieve. | The policy does not relate to actions which can be influenced by the Local Development Framework. A new policy has been added which states 'There will be increased encouragement of and opportunities for re-using and recycling waste.', with the Means to Achieve as the National Park Authority's Green Business Guide, district and borough councils' Business Waste Handbooks, and the Core Strategy and Development Policies Core Policy F. | 60 | 458 | Amend Plan |
| 5.5 Waste Management | Hambleton District Council | Recycling bins should be provided alongside street and car park bins. | This is too detailed for the Management Plan, but the Plan would support District Councils if they chose to do this. | 52 | 391 | No |
| 5.5 Waste Management | Hambleton District Council | Work towards the Government's strategy of zero waste by 2030 from households, and be well on the way to achieving this for businesses. Develop and support local repair, re-use and recycling schemes, which will help the economy and reduce the need for transport. | The EU / UK target is to recycle 50% of waste by 2020. The policies in the draft Plan do not relate to actions which can be influenced by the Local Development Framework. A new policy has been added to state 'There will be increased encouragement of and opportunities for re-using and recycling waste.', with the Means to Achieve as the National Park Authority's Green Business Guide, district and borough councils' Business Waste Handbooks, the Core Strategy and Development Policies Core Policy F and the waste management strategies which cover the Park. | 52 | 389 | Amend Plan |
| 5.5 Waste Management | Great Ayton Parish Council | Clarify that waste management is delivered by constituent councils. National Park Authority should work closely with councils to ensure that waste management facilities (e.g. bin colours) are compatible with the National Park. Refer to Redcar and Cleveland Borough Council. | Reference has been made to the role of the constituent councils at the end of the first paragraph to state 'Within the North York Moors National Park the waste disposal authorities are North Yorkshire County Council and Redcar and Cleveland Borough Council, and the waste collection authorities are the District and Borough Councils.' | 57 | 434 | Amend Plan |

| Part of Plan | Respondent | Summary of Comments | Authority Response | Respondent ID | Response ID | Action needed? |
|----------------------------|---------------------------------|---|--|---------------|-------------|----------------|
| 5.5 Waste Management | Hartoft Parish Council | The illegal dumping of waste does not need to be enforced as those doing so will do so voluntarily. | This has been amended to read 'The illegal dumping of waste will be enforced against.' | 51 | 354 | Amend Plan |
| 5.5 Waste Management | Thirlby Parish Meeting | Should the policy be re-worded to state 'Sanctions against the illegal dumping of rubbish will be enforced'? | This has been reworded to state 'The illegal dumping of rubbish will be enforced against'. | 48 | 299 | Amend Plan |
| 5.5 Waste Management | Hambleton District Council | Emphasise to all visitors to take their litter home with them from locations where bins are not provided and use enforcement and fines. | The National Park Authority does this through the promotion of the Moors Message. | 52 | 390 | No |
| 5.6 Culture and Traditions | Nigel and Carol Wilson | There is an omission in relation to museums, in particular Ryedale Folk Museum, which is a valuable resource for education and entertainment through activities such as themed weeks and re-enactments. The museum meets the requirements of many aspects of the Plan including conservation of the cultural heritage. | Museums and visitor centres will be identified as a means to achieve the policies in this section. | 24 | 124 | Amend Plan |
| 5.6 Culture and Traditions | Susan Willmington | The old woodcarvers workshops in Littlebeck could be occupied by artists and craftsmen. North Yorkshire Open Studios and the North York Moors Chamber Music Festival are a great success, more projects like this should be created. There should be more lectures, touring talks, demonstrations, walking tours and courses, making use of outlying village halls. | The National Park Authority events programme is recognised as a Means to Achieve which could incorporate such events. | 11 | 54 | No |
| 5.6 Culture and Traditions | Welcome to Yorkshire | Tourism can help to sustain local cultures and traditions and could be better recognised in this section. Visitors like to understand and experience places and meet 'real' people. | The final sentence of the first paragraph has been amended to read '...and other parts of the country, and is an important element of the appeal of the National Park to visitors. Equally, interest from tourists can help to sustain cultures and traditions which may otherwise be lost.' | 49 | 312 | Amend Plan |
| 5.6 Culture and Traditions | Comments at Sutton Bank 4/12/11 | There should be more public sculpture in the Park. | It is considered that this is covered and supported in the two policies. | 16 | 73 | No |

| Part of Plan | Respondent | Summary of Comments | Authority Response | Respondent ID | Response ID | Action needed? |
|-----------------|--|---|--|---------------|-------------|----------------|
| 5.7 Involvement | North East Yorkshire Geology Trust | The Geology Trust has not been sufficiently involved in matters of geodiversity and geoconservation, and the aims of the Management Plan may not therefore be achieved. | Discussions are taking place with the North East Yorkshire Geology Trust about future working arrangements. | 53 | 402 | No |
| 5.7 Involvement | North Yorkshire County Council | The Localism Bill is now the Localism Act, and applies to county councils and district councils and may also apply to the National Park Authority. | This has been amended to read 'Localism Act'. | 40 | 220 | Amend Plan |
| 5.7 Involvement | Great Ayton Parish Council | There is no plan to facilitate social enterprise, and National Park Authority role. | A policy has been added to state that 'Communities will be involved in delivering services, facilities and projects where appropriate.' Means to Achieve - Local Communities, National Park Authority and constituent councils. | 57 | 435 | Amend Plan |
| 5.7 Involvement | Redcar and Cleveland Strategic Partnership | All plans and priorities should reflect the needs, wishes and aspirations of the community going forward. The local community need to become more involved in future decision making. | Section 5.7 (now 5.1) contains a policy to involve local communities in developing policies, priorities and activities which arise out of the Management Plan. Further changes resulting from the Localism Act will influence how people are involved in the future. | 6 | 28 | No |
| 5.7 Involvement | Thirlby Parish Meeting | The Plan should indicate how communities will be assisted to prepare effective Neighbourhood Plans and other interventions of the planning system. | The Management Plan does not form part of the Development Plan or Local Development Framework and it is therefore not necessary to include any further detail on Neighbourhood Plans. | 48 | 553 | No |
| 5.7 Involvement | English Heritage | Why put people last, it is particularly bad to put people after waste management. | This section, and Culture and Traditions, have been moved to the start of the Communities chapter. | 37 | 199 | Amend Plan |